universität wien

MASTERARBEIT / MASTER'S THESIS

Titel der Masterarbeit / Title of the Master's Thesis

„A comparative Analysis of Documentary Films on the so-called "comfort women" of the Japanese Imperial Army"

verfasst von / submitted by

Katharina Fischer BA BA

angestrebter akademischer Grad / in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts (MA)

Wien, 2018/ Vienna 2019

Studienkennzahl lt. Studienblatt / degree programme code as it appears on the student record sheet:	A 066 864
Studienrichtung lt. Studienblatt / degree programme as it appears on the student record sheet:	Wirtschaft und Gesellschaft Ostasiens
Betreut von / Supervisor:	Univ.-Prof. Mag. Dr. Rüdiger Frank

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank everybody who supported me during
my studies, especially my parents, my grandmother,
the best proof-reader Gary and Dr. Astrid Lipinsky, M.A
Dr. Lipinsky worked together with me for years
on this topic and on many other things,
and without her positive attitude
I would not have managed to concern
myself with this sad topic for so long.
Thank you!

Table of Contents

1. Introduction

1.1. General Introduction

This thesis aims to analyse and compare six documentaries on former so-called "comfort women" and thereby studies a range of issues related to the discourse on so-called "comfort women".

Although the issues mainly concern atrocities committed during World War II, the topic still prevails as a source of political and diplomatic disputes between Japan and its neighbouring countries.

In short, even before the second Sino-Japanese war officially started in 1937, the Japanese military tasked private companies, supported by public officials and the military administration, to supply women and girls to so-called "comfort women stations" or "comfort stations". During the course of the Second World War, the Asian theatre of war included not only the South and East of China, but also a large part of Southeast Asia and the Pacific. Over the course of the war, the rising demand for so-called "comfort women" led to increasingly violent forced conscriptions (Terre des Femmes, 2001: 12).

The estimated number of women conscripted varies; some estimates account for some 200, 000 women from all over Asia who were conscripted officially (Sajor, 1995: 509), other sources claim that from Korea alone, around 200, 000 women were deported to the occupied regions (Terre des Femmes, 2001: 12). Historians estimate that out of all these women, fewer than 30% survived the ordeal by the close of war (Sajor, 1995:509).

To this day, survivors and activists continue to struggle for justice, compensation and reparation. Since January 8, 1992, when former Japanese Prime Minister Miyazawa Kiichi visited Seoul, survivors and activists demonstrate weekly, every Wednesday at noon, in front of the Japanese embassy in Seoul, demanding Japan to redress the issue (Okano 2012).

So far, the only institution that chronicles the history of so-called "comfort women" is the "House of sharing", a shelter and museum, where survivors live and receive therapy. It was built by a private Buddhist foundation in 1992 (Sala, 2017). In China, a "Research Center for Chinese Comfort Women" was established at Shanghai Normal University in June 2016, and in Taiwan, the Taipei Women's Rescue Foundation created an online memorial museum in 2014 and the "Ama Museum" in Taipei that opened in 2016 (Hou and Lee, 2016). The "Women's Active Museum on War and Peace" in Japan, which was opened in 2005, is still controversial within Japan and just in autumn of 2016, received a bomb threat (Kyodo, 2016).

Activism struggling for justice for survivors is now under time-pressure, since the former so-called "comfort women" are gradually passing away.

The topic is also relevant internationally, as the problem of forced prostitution in armed conflicts is not limited to the acts of the Japanese imperial army. Forced prostitution and rape are still deliberately and systematically employed as a weapon of war in different conflicts around the world. Sexualized violence is used to morally and emotionally defeat enemies, and is especially effective in patriarchal societies, where a man's honour is traditionally tied to the purity and chastity of wife and daughters. A consequence of this is that many victims are stigmatized, disowned and abandoned by their families. (Drinck 2007: 109)

Therefore, the issue should not be regarded as a question of relations between Japan and its neighbour, but as a contemporary human rights issue for women across the world (Ahn 2007: 315).

Research concerning the causes and consequences of conflict-related sexual violence is relevant and a key interest both for the scholarly debate on peace and conflict and for policymakers and practitioners, since the consequences of sexual violence in conflicts lasts longer

than wars themselves and have implications not only for individual survivors, but also affect social relations within and beyond communities. Research on causes of sexual conflict may help policymakers to prevent it in the future, and understanding the consequences improves the provision of measures to help survivors and their communities in their recovery. (Koos 2017:1935 and 1941)

The documentary films I chose to analyse for my thesis are the following:

1. "Senso Daughters" by Sekiguchi Yuka (1989)
2. The trilogy "The Murmuring" (1995), "Habitual Sadness" (1997) and "My own breathing"(1999) by Byun Young-joo
3. "Song of the Reed" by Wu Hsiu-ching (2014)
4. "The Apology" by Tiffany Hsiung (2016)

The choice of films offers a good range of documentaries as they are produced in different decades, in different countries and by directors from Japan, Korea, Taiwan and Canada.

The main reason for my choice of topic is that I had the opportunity to meet and talk to Wu Hsiu-ching, director of the documentary "Song of the Reed". Director Wu stayed in Vienna on the invitation of the Vienna Center for Taiwan Studies to show her documentary and give lectures in multiple venues. She let me conduct an expert interview about her documentary during her time in Vienna. In addition, Byun Young-joo, director of a renowned documentary trilogy on so-called "comfort women" agreed to be interviewed via E-mail. Later, I also got the chance to interview director Sekiguchi of "Senso Daughters" via E-mail. The interviews with the directors offered interesting new insights and perspectives to the discourse.

1.2. Research Questions

- In which ways are documentary films able to influence the public discourse on “comfort women” in societies and can they even trigger political action?
- What patterns of hegemonic representations of former so-called “comfort women” can be observed in the documentaries? What images of former so-called “comfort women” are created within documentaries and the public discourse? In which ways might they be exploited and for whose and which agendas?
- What are the differences between the domestic and interstate discourse and what are the reasons for the differences?
- How do documentary films on so-called “comfort women” deal with issues of gender and power?
- In which ways is the “comfort women” discourse integrated in a broader feminist discourse on issues such as victim shaming, forced prostitution or sexual violence on women in armed conflicts?

1.3. Historical background

1.3.1. Asia-Pacific War

At the beginning of the 1930s, the Japanese military tasked private companies, supported by public officials and the military administration, to supply women and girls to so-called "comfort women stations". The first of such brothels was set up in Shanghai in 1931. From 1937 on, after Japan entered into war with China, the Japanese army began to set up more "comfort stations" in other parts of China. By the year 1942, Japanese occupied territory reached its maximum extension and with Myanmar and the Andaman-Nikobar Isles, Indian possessions in the West, Indonesian Islands in the South and the Solomon and Marshall island groups in the East, a large part of Asia and the Pacific were brought under Japanese rule. (Hayashi, 2007: 147)

With the increase in occupied territory, demand for so-called "comfort women" also increased and led to more and more violent conscriptions (Terre des Femmes, 2001: 12). The Army targeted girls and women who, because of poverty, class, family status, education or ethnicity (in Taiwan for example, the number of aboriginal women who were so-called "comfort women" is disproportionally high), were susceptible to being deceived and trapped into this system. Others were abducted by force. The girls and women recruited were between the ages of twelve and 22 (Drinck 2007: 15). The estimated number of so-called "comfort women" varies; some estimates account for some 200, 000 women from all over the occupied areas, (Sajor, 1995: 509) other sources claim that from Korea alone, around 200, 000 women were deported to the occupied regions (Terre des Femmes, 2001: 12). Details about precise numbers and the means of recruitment continue to be highly contested within Japan (Muta 2016: 623). It is estimated that out of all these women, fewer than 30% survived the ordeal by the close of war (Sajor, 1995: 509). Those who survived continued to suffer from physical and mental ill-health, shame and often poverty as a result of their experience as so-called "comfort women (Amnesty International 2016: 1).

According to Lourdes Indai Sajor, "The case of the Asian Comfort Women of the Japanese Imperial Army during World War II is unparalleled in that the government itself, using the entire army apparatus, systematically planned, ordered, conscripted, established and controlled army brothels and forcibly abducted women from the occupied territories and countries to serve in brothels." (Sajor, 1995: 508)

However, the physical, mental and emotional pain of so-called comfort women did not end with the war, but remained (illnesses, inability to become pregnant or give birth due to violence suffered), and they continued to suffer in societies that shame survivors of sexual abuse. Many survivors were divorced by their husbands after they found out about their past as so-called "comfort woman" (Hung 2010-73).

1.3.2. Truth and reconciliation

1.3.2.1. Until the 1990s

The truth about so-called "comfort women" only became known to a broader Japanese public in the 1970s, when Senda Kako published a book on the issue (note: he appears and is interviewed in director Sekiguchi's documentary "Senso daughers", see 4.1.1.1.). Until then, so-called "comfort women" had been portrayed in war novels and films as prostitutes, and the issue had not been treated in regard to aspects of human rights or as a matter of war reparations. In the 1980s,

some survivors went public and reported their experiences. Their accounts made the Japanese public aware about the issue, but the problem wasn't politically dealt with. (Nishino 2007: 156)

1.3.2.2. 1990s – Testimonial of Kim Hak-soon

The 1990s brought a political turning point with the account of Korean survivor Kim Hak-soon in August 1991 (see 4.1.1.1.). Until Kim's testimonial, no one had problematized the history of so-called "comfort women" as a human rights issue. Kim Hak-soon stepped forward in 1991 during war crime trials at Pearl Harbor with the help of the "Korean Council for the Women Drafted for Military Sexual Slavery", a support group for survivors established in 1990 by feminist scholars and activists in Korea. In September 1991 a hotline for victims was opened. Following the example of Kim, hundreds of former so-called "comfort women" came forward in Korea, the Philippines, China, Taiwan, Indonesia, and the Netherlands, demanding an apology and claiming compensation from the Japanese Government. (Muta 2016: 622)

The demand for reparations for the women became stronger as more survivors followed Kim Hak-soon and spoke up, and feminist scholars and activists, especially in Korea and Japan, but also worldwide, have tried to support these survivors and offer an adequate response. In December 1991, Kim and two other survivors filed a lawsuit in the Tokyo District Court (Fisher 2007: 281). In January 1992, the first so-called "Wednesday Demonstration", a weekly protest in front of the Japanese embassy, was held.

In the following years, nine other cases have subsequently been brought to courts by former so-called "comfort women" from Korea, the Philippines, Indonesia, China, and Taiwan. In all cases, the plaintiffs demanded an apology and compensation from the Japanese government. So far, the total number of plaintiffs is around 100, with the most recent ruling being made in 2010 against the plaintiff. In almost all the plaintiffs lost to the Japanese government, with the reasoning that first, all second World War claims had been settled by the San Francisco Peace Treaty of 1951 and the Agreement on the Settlement of Problems Concerning Property and Claims on Economic Cooperation Between Japan and the Republic of Korea of 1965, and second, "that Japan has already taken legal responsibility for war crimes and cannot compensate individual victims" (Muta 2016: 624).

In the 1990s, the Japanese government tried to pay compensation to individual survivors through the Asian Women's Fund, a privately run organization established in 1994 and funded mostly by the government. In addition to providing financial compensation, the Asian Women's Fund also distributed letters to survivors and their families. It succeeded in paying compensation and building homes in affected countries for survivors, but the compensation was rejected by the Korean and Taiwanese governments, which found that civilian monetary compensation did not constitute adequate state redress (Muta 2016: 623-624)

The wave of court cases changed the consciousness of the Japanese population and a discourse regarding the responsibility of the post-war generation started, as well as the dispute concerning the portrayal of so-called "comfort women" in Japanese textbooks [1](Nishono 2007:

[1] In 1982, the screening process for government-approved history textbooks for middle and high schools first became a source of diplomatic conflict between Japan and its neighbouring countries, after the language of a textbook was changed, for example, from "invade China" to "advance into China". Since then, Japanese history textbooks have been accused several times of glossing over references to the Nanjing Massacre, Unit 731 (responsible for medical experiments on prisoners of war), and so-called "comfort women". (Woods Masalski 2001)

157-158). Japanese newspapers, especially the *Asahi Shinbun*, began to report on the subject of so-called "comfort women" in 1991. In the mid-90s, a revisionist movement started to oppose references to so-called "comfort women" in history textbooks. (Rechenberger 2007: 169-170) The most influential right-wing revisionist groups in this regard has been the *atarashii rekishikyokasho wo tukurukai*, the" Society for History Textbook Reform", which was established in 1996 (Muta 2016: 624).

The 1990s brought international attention to the "comfort women" issue. The United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) suggested in 1994 for the first time that the government of Japan should pay compensation to the survivors (Muta 2016: 625). In August 1999, The UN human rights sub-commission encouraged the Japanese government to provide reparation to the survivors.

In its statement of 2009, CEDAW addressed the issue again, articulating regret at the failure of the Japanese government to achieve an appropriate solution. In its response to this report of 2011, the government did not make any comment on so-called "comfort women". (Muta 2016: 625-626)

1.3.2.3. Women's International War Crimes Tribunal on Japan's Military Sexual Slavery

In 2000, the Japanese network "Violence Against Women in War – Network Japan (VAWW-Net Japan) initiated the "Women's International War Crimes Tribunal on Japan's Military Sexual Slavery", in which about 70 survivors from various countries participated. The Tribunal was held after a two-and-half year preparatory phase in Tokyo in December 2000 and was set up as a result of the failure to take responsibility to ensure justice on the "comfort women issue". More than 50 lawyers from across the world were invited to join seven prosecuting teams. In its final judgement in The Hague in 2001, the tribunal judged the Japanese emperor Hirohito and nine other senior military and government leaders guilty of holding individual responsibility for the crimes of sexual slavery and rape as crimes against humanity. It recommended to the Japanese government to provide full reparations. (Muta 2016: 622)

The final judgement contains seventeen recommendations: twelve to the Japanese government, three to former Allies, and two to the UN (Kim, Yoon-ok 2007: 276-277). However, as a civil tribunal without legislative power, the judgement was not legally binding (Nishono 2007: 162-163 and Kim, Yoon-ok 2007: 273).

Event though the Japanese government and most Japanese newspapers ignored the tribunal and its conclusions, it did gain broad international attention and it was expected that the ruling would be part of a broader resolution. The tribunal stirred up some Japanese citizens and resulted in the lobbying of local groups to make local assemblies adopt resolutions and take actions. So far, 40 different assemblies have formulated resolutions, calling for apologies, reparations, or education on the "comfort women" issue. (Muta 2016: 623)

1.3.2.4. Recent Years

In 2005, the "Women's Active Museum on War and Peace" was opened in Tokyo. It exhibits materials, documents, and statements of witnesses, which were collected throughout the process of the "Women's International War Crimes Tribunal on Japan's Military Sexual

Slavery"(Nishono 2007: 165). The museum is controversial within Japan and received a bomb threat in 2016 (Kyodo, 2016).

In May 2013, the UN Committee Against Torture recommended that Japan should find a "victim-centred" solution and educate the public of the system of so-called "comfort stations" (Amnesty International 2016: 2).

In December 2015, Japanese Prime Minister Abe Shinzo sealed a deal with the government of former and now impeached South Korean President Park Geun-hye. By paying one billion yen to South Korea, the issue was to be dealt with finally, and South Korea was to refrain from criticizing Japan in the future and to remove the "statue of peace", a statue of a girl representing survivors in front of the Japanese embassy in Seoul (Kubo and Adelstein, 2015).

The contribution of one billion yen was for the South Korean government to set up a foundation to support the living survivors. The governments of Japan and South Korea then considered the "final and irreversible" deal sufficient, but public opinion disagreed significantly.

While right-wing conservatives in Japan found the deal unnecessary, a large part of Korea's civil society and critics within the international media described it as " selling out the dignity of survivors of wartime sexual slavery for short-term diplomatic and geopolitical gain" (Panda, 2017), and criticised that the deal was only bi-lateral, leaving out survivors from other countries, didn't involve individual survivors, didn't include any apology, generally lacked a victim-centred human rights approach, and didn't meet standards of state accountability for human rights violations. Importantly, this agreement was not welcomed by the majority of survivors (Amnesty International 2016: 2).

In March 2016, Ban Ki-moon met with survivors and stressed the necessity to put them at the centre of any possible resolution of the issue (UN News Centre, 2016).

In January 2017, the "comfort women issue" led to another diplomatic dispute between South Korea and Japan, when Japan temporarily recalled its ambassador and consul in protest of another copy of the „comfort woman"-statue near the Japanese consulate in South Korea's second largest city of Busan.

A similar incident happened in San Francisco in autumn 2017. After a statue was set up in San Francisco and its mayor signed a confirmation of the city council's acceptance of the monument, the mayor of San Francisco's Japanese sister city, Osaka, threatened to end the 60-year old sisterhood between the two cities. (BBC 2017)

After one year of having the statue on display in San Francisco, the dispute boiled over this October, when Osaka's mayor Hirofumi Yoshimura followed through the threat he issued last year to end his city's longstanding relationship with San Francisco in protest of the monument, saying it presented a one-sided message. He requested the immediate removal of the memorial statue and the accompanying plaque and said that he would revive ties with San Francisco if they were removed from city property. San Francisco's mayor, London Breed, said in a statement that it is not possible for one mayor to unilaterally end the relationship between the sister cities. According to Breed, the memorial is "a symbol of the struggle faced by all women who have been, and are currently, forced to endure the horrors of enslavement and sex trafficking." (Hauser 2018)

This incident not only shows that diplomatic consequences of the "comfort women" issue are not restricted to East Asia, but also documents the actuality of the issue in the realm of international relations.

The first "comfort women" statue in Taiwan was erected in Tainan this year (2018). The Japanese chief Cabinet secretary expressed disappointment over the installation, resulting in a clear statement from Taiwan's Ministry of Foreign Affairs that stressed its unwavering stance on the issue (Hsu 2018).

South Korea's new president and former human rights lawyer Moon Jae-in, who was elected in May 2017 following the impeachment of President Park, promised to revisit the deal of 2015, meaning that the issue will continue to strongly influence relations with Japan. The new government of Moon Jae-in further announced that it intended to designate an official day of commemoration for so called "comfort women" starting next year (2018) (Sala, 2017) and plans to establish a museum in Seoul commemorating former Korean women forced into Japanese wartime brothels (South China Morning Post, 2017).

2. Theory

2.1. Definition of terms and concepts

2.1.1. Documentary

Cultural anthropologist Domitilla Olivieri points out that there are many and contradictory definitions of the term "documentary". Television, news reports and internet websites increasingly present audio-visual material, claiming to show "documentaries" by "using documentary images to explain, demonstrate and provide evidence of theories and practices." Olivieri outlines a working definition as "a film that is haunted by its object, or haunted by reality", entailing "a focus on the materiality of documentary as a sign, and as a system of signs" (Olivieri 2012: 15)

Danish scholar Henrik Juel points out that filming a documentary "is not just about recording what is there; it is also about selecting and presenting and editing (…) Documentary film- making – and also the reception of documentary films – is all about ethics, politics and an aesthetic approach" (Juel 2006: 6). Juel describes different narrative strategies:

- Expository: lecturing, didactic, with an explanatory voice-over
- Observational: the film crew avoids disturbing or even being noticed by the subjects of the documentary
- Participatory/interactive: the film crew takes part in the actions and events
- Reflexive: filmmakers expose and discuss their own role and the ethics and conditions of filmmaking
- Performative: filmmakers create events and situations to be filmed by their own interventions, events are carried out for the sake of filming
- Poetic: focus on aesthetic qualities (Juel 2006: 11)

He further describes different relations of documentaries to "truth":

- Correspondence: statements and details are in accordance with actual or historical facts, events and persons
- Coherence: the documentary is non-contradictory
- Pragmatic/Conventionalist: the film is in line with predominant views and discursive practice
- Relativism/Constructivism: making sense of things
- Illumination theory of truth: focus on gaining a deeper understanding and insight by seeing and hearing more (Juel 2006: 11-12)

2.1.2. "Comfort Woman"

The term "comfort woman" itself is actually contested. "Comfort woman" is a direct translation of the Japanese term 慰安婦 (*ianfu),* but researchers and activists alike describe it as both euphemistic and trivializing, as the word "comfort" evokes vastly positive emotions, glossing over the actual violence and suffering that was forced upon the "comfort women", who were in fact victims of military sexual slavery. In the documentary "The Murmuring" former so-called "comfort woman" Park Doree says ironically: "I have never lived in comfort" (Byun 1995: minute 29-30). The corresponding term "comfort stations" to describe the Japanese military brothels is an equally cynical euphemism.

On the one hand, most people easily recognize the term “comfort women”, which makes it convenient when discussing the issue, as such historical terms ensure authenticity in academic, expert, and political discourse (Drinck 2007: 12). On the other hand, it limits the discussion to the context of Japanese imperialism during World War II for those who want to include the issue into a broader discourse on forced prostitution and violence against women.

Publications by the UN Commission on Human Rights, the International Labour Organization, the International Commission of Jurists and others prefer the terms “Japanese military sex slaves” and “military brothels (Drinck 2007: 12).

The former so-called “comfort women” themselves and activists supporting them mostly call them just “grandmothers”: 할머니 (*halmeoni*) in Korea, 阿嬤 (*ama*) in Taiwan, and *Lolas* in the Philippines.

For the purpose of this paper, I will either use the somewhat cumbersome “former so-called ‚comfort women‘” or simply “survivors”.

2.1.3. “Victim Blaming” and “ideal victims”

Victim blaming occurs when the victim of a crime or any wrongful act is held entirely or partially at fault for the harm that befell them. It further occurs when attention is focused on the choices of the victim rather than the limitations of choices through the perpetrator, for example when asked “why don’t women leave their abusive partners?” rather than “why do men abuse their partners?” or ”why don’t abusive men let their partners go?”. It is victim blaming when we concentrate our search for reasons for a crime or wrongful act on the situation or characteristics of the victim of the crime. (Moser 2017: 17-18)

To give an example, in a Japanese rape case of 2011, the Supreme Court of Japan “doubted the victim because she did not escape or call for help in spite of the fact that the incident occurred on the street” (Muta 2016: 629).

The concept of “ideal victims“ describes the ways in which the credibility of victims, especially women who report sexual assault, is being undermined by stereotypes surrounding the image of “real/ideal victims” (blameless, pure, weaker than the aggressor, etc.) and how victims should respond to violence (fighting back, reporting immediately, etc). “Ideal victims” are recognized by society as deserving of help, assistance, and resources. On the other hand, those who fail to fit the image of “ideal victims” might see their accounts subjected to scrutiny or even be regarded as at fault for what happened and, therefore, not worthy of protection by the justice system (Randall 2010: 407-409).

In consequence, victims of crimes often have limited choices in regard to dealing with their suffering. They might have to act in certain ways in order to fit the image of “ideal victims” and thus gain recognition, solidarity and support. (Moser 2017: 47)

Stereotypical victims are passive, helpless, weak, innocent and don’t make demands. Those who act and speak up risk their recognition as “real victims” and might lose support (Moser 2017: 60).

In her work on victim discourses, Maria Katharina Moser explains that the construction of victims as “affected” but “helpless”, “non-responsible” and “completely powerless” can exclude them from those who support and assist victims, who are constructed as “non-affected”, “completely healthy” and competent”. The discourse offers very little space for feelings such as insecurity, anger and fear on part of the supporters. (Moser 2017: 62-64)

Moser further warns researchers and supporters to never homogenise victims of a certain kind of crime, it is important to be aware that victims of similar crimes can have different problems and need different types of assistance from supporters (Moser 2017: 89)

2.2 Theory on conflict-related sexual violence

It is an unfortunately obvious fact that sexual violence is committed in times of peace as well. However, during armed conflicts, it takes particular forms and is motivated for different reasons (Bastick et al. 2007: 14).

Feminist academics have first offered a perspective on sexual violence as a form of social power characterized by the operations and dynamics of gender. They politicised sexual violence and forced the issue from a private and interpersonal into the public and structural sphere. (Kirby 2012: 800)

In his article on research progress on sexual violence in armed conflicts, Carlos Koos finds that a large proportion of the existing academic literature agrees that factors such as an absence of the rule of law, impunity, weakened state institutions, and above all, gender inequalities, make sexual violence in the context of conflicts more likely. Another important observation of researchers is that the circumstances and consequences of armed conflict 'normalise' the phenomenon of sexual violence. (Koos 2017: 1938)

Research on the multifaceted causes and motives of conflict-related sexual violence shows that intra-group norms and dynamics play a substantial role in explaining the prevalence and extent of sexual violence. There are two main arguments in this regard. First, collective rape increases cohesion between members of armed groups, because jointly committing sexual violence creates bonds between perpetrators by generating collective feelings of power and superiority. Second, the lack of sanctioning norms within the military structure or the perpetuating group's ideology also explains the pursuit of sexual violence in armed conflicts. (Koos 2017: 1940)

In preventing and responding to sexual violence in armed conflict, security sector institutions are key. They are responsible for identifying and arresting perpetrators, while the judiciary is responsible for trial and punishment of perpetrators and awarding reparations to victims. In debates around "security", sexual violence tends to be treated as a marginal issue, as a side effect of insecurity rather than a relevant form of insecurity itself. (Bastick et al. 2007: 7)

Even in times of armed conflict, national courts are responsible for prosecuting crimes of sexual violence. However, it is usually only after a conflict is over that the attention is turned to accountability and justice. (Bastick et al. 2007: 155)

Generally, conflict-related sexual violence occurs not only in the fields and military sites, but also in homes and refugee camps. It occurs during conflict, population displacement and after conflict. Sexual violence is committed during attacks on civilian centre and looting raids, but women and girls are also attacked while performing daily chores such as the collection of water, food and firewood. (Bastick et al. 2007: 13)

Impunity during conflict, post-conflict poverty and weakened rule of law after conflict foster increased sexual violence and make women and girls particularly vulnerable to sexual exploitation and trafficking. Often, people forming specific ethnicities are disproportionally victimised, as well as single women, homosexuals, female heads of households and displaced women and children (Bastick et al. 2007: 14).

Perpetrators include members of armed and security forces, paramilitary groups, non-state armed groups, but also civilians and humanitarian and peacekeeping personnel (Bastick et al. 2007: 9-10).

UN Security Council Resolution 1325 emphasises the responsibility of all states to put an end to war crimes relating to sexual violence. Implications for the security sector may be to reform police and take effective measures to better prevent and investigate crimes of sexual violence and provide specialised services for victims. The justice sector should work on ensuring

accountability for committed crimes. After a conflict, transnational justice institutions, such as tribunals, international courts, truth and reconciliation commissions and reparations programmes should address sexual violence.

In communities affected by armed conflict, state security services provide little protection from sexual violence and fail to assist victims. Civil society organisations such as women's groups often fill this gap. Therefore, it is an important part of post-conflict reconstruction to support such organisations. (Bastick et al. 2007:11)

Stacy Banwell, who analysed forced prostitution in post-invasion/occupation Iraq, points out that a feminist ethics of war involves more than abstracting human suffering in war. It seeks accountability for the immediate and long-term impact of strategic and tactical decision-making on people's lives and pays attention to interpersonal, structural and institutional violence against women suffered during and in the aftermath of war. (Banwell 2015: 717-718)

Banwell explains that women are less vulnerable to gender-based violence on an interpersonal and structural level if they have "access to socioeconomic (full-time professional employment), socio-political (land and property rights), and social (education, welfare, healthcare and social security) structures and institutions." (Banwell 2015: 716)

2.2.1. Exploitation by humanitarian and peacekeeping personnel

The presence of foreign humanitarian and peacekeeping personnel may trigger an increase in the perceived demand for sexual services, leading to women and girls being trafficked and forced into prostitution. There have been cases of humanitarian and peacekeeping personnel exchanging money, food or other assistance items for sexual services. (Bastick et al. 2007: 14)

To give a recent example, in February this year (2018), it was revealed that staff of the British charity Oxfam sexually exploited victims of the Haiti earthquake in 2010 (BBC 2018).

The term "peacekeeper" actually includes a variety of actors: soldiers and military personnel, police, development aid personnel, humanitarian workers and civilians (Bastick et al. 2007: 169). Peacekeepers play an important role; with proper training and in cooperation with local NGOs and women's group they can effectively help to prevent sexual violence. However, poverty during and after conflicts makes populations vulnerable to exploitation, including by peacekeepers, because local populations may be heavily reliant of peacekeepers and humanitarian aid organisations for their subsistence.

The UN is now taking action against sexual exploitation by peacekeepers, but measures to ensure accountability and that codes of conduct and proper training are implemented is still lacking. An increased deployment of women contributes to better relations with host communities and better conduct by peacekeepers (Bastick et al. 2007:10).

However, the UN has a limited capacity to itself train peacekeepers and hold them accountable for misconduct. The UN can generally only take administrative action against offenders, such as suspending them from their duties and repatriation. It relies on concerned countries to prosecute their nationals accused of crimes committed during their peacekeeping mission and to train their personnel. Training should include the "UN Code of Personal Conduct for Blue Helmets and Directives for Disciplinary Matters Involving Military Members of National Contingents" (Bastick et al. 2007: 171-173)

2.2.2. Justice for survivors of sexual violence in armed conflict

Survivors of sexual violence in armed conflict face many challenges when seeking justice. There are economic, educational and socio-economic barriers in gaining access to judiciary institutions. They might be stigmatised and rejected by their spouse or community, and procedures for prosecution may expose them to further humiliation and re-victimisation. Survivors rarely receive adequate reparations for the injury and suffering they experience. (Bastick et al. 2007:155)

Societies that build or rebuild judicial institutions after conflict should be responsive to sexual violence, whether it occurred during the armed conflict or during the post-conflict period, as well as to sexual violence that continues to occur in peaceful societies. (Bastick et al. 2007:155)

The term "justice", in the context of sexual violence can mean "retributive justice": justice based on prosecution and punishment. In some communities, retributive justice is considered to have value in itself. In contrast to retributive justice, "restorative justice" emphasizes processes of healing. Of course, the two notions of justice in this context exist in a continuum. Generally, criminal trials focus on retributive justice, while truth and reconciliation bodies place emphasis on restorative justice. Mechanisms that include the concept of restorative justice offer more possibilities to give a voice to survivors and address poverty, health care needs and the social stigma suffered by survivors. (Bastick et al. 2007:156)

Both the UN General Assembly Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women and the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action state that survivors need to be provided with remedies for the harm they suffered (Bastick et al. 2007:158). According to the Secretary-General's "In-depth Study on all Forms of Violence against Women", the right to a remedy includes access to justice, reparation, restitution, compensation, rehabilitation, and guarantees of non-repetition and prevention (UN General Assembly 2006: 76).

To ensure that reparation programmes include survivors of sexual violence and that reparations are appropriate to their special needs, women's groups should participate in planning and implementation of reparation programmes. Material reparations are necessary to address economic needs of survivors and symbolic reparations are needed to address the social stigma that survivors may be subjected to. (Bastick et al. 2007:162)

Justice is personal for each individual survivor, but at the same time an issue for entire communities and has national and international dimensions as well (Bastick et al. 2007:165).

2.3. Theory on feminist filmmaking and documentary ethics

2.3.1. Politics of (documentary) filmmaking

Feminism is often concerned with the politics and ethics of images, and of representation in art, popular culture, literature and film (Olivieri 2012:17), emphasizing the "male gaze" within art production, but cultural anthropologist Olivieri criticises that feminist film scholars focused their attention mainly on mainstream fiction films, often ignoring documentaries. However, documentary films are important when realizing that they actually influence the way we learn about and look at other cultures, societies and historical events. (Olivieri 2012:18)

In addition to the "male gaze" an "imperial gaze" exists, and in modern patriarchal societies, the two concepts cannot be separated. In dominant discourses, the "Other" is gendered as well as ethnicised. (Olivieri 2012:24) In feminist and post-colonial theory, the "gaze" is a concept that refers to "the act of a subject who looks and one who is looked at, where this relation is a relation of power encoded in hegemonic norms. It is a normative gaze that defines, devalorises or objectifies the Other" (Olivieri 2012:52-53). The concept of the "imperial gaze" also means that filmmakers might unconsciously (re)produce stereotypes and cultural inequalities. Olivieri questions the relation of ethnographic cinema to imperialism and the ethics of anthropological filmmaking. (Olivieri 2012:25)

Expert for cultural studies and comparative literature Maggie Hennefeld describes this concept within feminist filmmaking as an issue "between middle-class white Western feminists and non-Western, marginalized others whose perspectives they frequently assume and ventriloquize." (Hennefeld 2018: 196). She explains that there is a tension between local stories, national representation and international cinema trends that are consumed globally (Hennefeld 2018: 197). The relationship between filmmakers and their subjects as well as local actors is a relationship of different power, even when filmmakers try to adopt a "feminist gaze" (Hennefeld 2018: 203). According to her, feminist filmmakers have the power to "challenge the humanitarian fantasies of immediacy and of transparent identification between Western spectator and Third World Other that they might otherwise authorize." (Hennefeld 2018: 210). It is a filmmaker's right to speak on behalf of their subject, but instead of overwriting their voices, filmmakers should make films that give voices to them (Hennefeld 2018: 210-211).

Documentary films have a tradition of synchronous recording, allowing the audience to listen to the "real", actual voice of individuals. In fact, in the "comfort women" documentaries analysed in this paper, we hear the "real" voice of former so-called "comfort women" quite a lot. This relatively direct representation of women might be a reason why many feminist filmmakers employ the form of documentaries to deal with women's issues and attempt to give voices back to silenced women.

However, the notion that documentary images are more truthful than other forms of representation is problematic. Many traditional documentaries employ the use of a voice-over, an authoritative so-called "voice-of-God", which usually surpasses any other voice in the film and is usually the voice of a male narrator. This voice-over aims to give authority over the narrative of the documentary and should tell the audience the "official" truth. When it comes to historical documentaries, although a nation's history is supposed to be the history of all its constituents, women's stories and sufferings have often been untold in official history. Efforts to bring women's voices to the forefront usually depend on interviews, through recording of their own voice without mediation of a (male) narrator. (Nam 2001: 81-82)

The very aspect of the matter-of-factness of documentaries does not necessarily prove documentaries to be the best method for understanding historical issues, and to approach

documentary films from the perspective of objective truth would be both reductive and unproductive (Nam 2001: 88).

Nam Soo-Young describes the problems of documentaries on the "comfort women" issue as "a mixture of masculinist nationalism, colonialism, the postcolonial question if the representation of the Other, and a historical trauma that causes forgetfulness." (Nam 2001: 98)

2.3.2. Study with Taiwanese former so-called "comfort women"

Taiwanese scholar Hung Su-chen conducted research focusing on the psychotherapeutic aspects of the treatment and recovery process of former Taiwanese so-called "comfort women" during their old age. Her study was carried out using more than ten hours of drama therapy (Hung 2010: 81).

The findings from this study may also shine light on the possible positive effects that being filmed could have on the recovery process of former so-called "comfort women" and are therefore highly relevant for analysing "comfort women" documentary films. According to Hung, reinterpreting the past traumatic experiences of victims contributes to their recovery. In drama therapy, "they could recreate their youth without consciously paying attention to past experience". (Hung 2010: 61)

Hung worked together with four therapists and ten former so-called "comfort women" of the ages 74 to 90, one of whom passed away before the completion of the study. Regarding their past, five of them were sent to China, three stayed in Hualian in Taiwan, one was forced to go to the Philippines and one to Malaysia. At the time, they were 13 to 23 years old and served the Japanese military for one to two years. (Hung 2010: 66-67)

According to Hungs literature review, survivors of sexual abuse typically express four types of emotions: guilt, anger, grief/depression, and loneliness.

The feeling of guilt may be linked to misconceptions and negative responses from society, such as the misconception, in the case of so-called "comfort women", that they willingly served the Japanese military. Survivors may blame themselves, ("the comfort women frequently said they were tricked because they were stupid" (Hung 2010: 63)). In drama therapy, the focus on processing the feeling of guilt is to put the responsibility back on the abusers.

The feeling of anger in the case of "comfort women" may be directed towards the unapologetic Japanese government rather than at themselves. To give an example, one respondent said: "I hated myself for being cheated.…. My only resentment is that I was naïve.", clearly directing her anger on herself (Hung 2010: 72).

Emotions like grief and depression as well as loneliness are often linked with feeling ashamed and having low self-esteem. "Embarrassment and guilt can make victims feel alone and different from other. They are afraid of close relationships and that people will blame them again if they discover their secret." (Hung 2010: 63). The majority of survivors wanted their families' acceptance but felt ashamed to reveal their past. The respondents of Hungs study felt victimized because they were disadvantaged in multiple ways: low social standing and low economic and financial resources, both linked to their past experiences. (Hung 2010: 63-64)

2.3.2.1. Stages of the recovery process

Hung describes a recovery process of four stages:

1. Sense of survival and awareness of trauma, willingness to express emotions
2. Processing of core issues within themselves, process of exploring trauma, acceptance of emotions, sometimes expression of anger
3. Processing of issues with the outside world (family etc.)
4. Integration and overcoming of challenges including spiritual growth

In drama therapy the so-called "dialogue with the past self" was an important instrument, with the aim to make the survivors explore their trauma, make own interpretations of traumatic experiences, release and express emotions and messages, revisit experiences, engage in self-counselling and reflect and introspect. An important outcome of this was that survivors had very similar stories, and as a result, they could relate to each other and relate other's stories to their own experiences. (Hung 2010: 72) In the "dialogue with the past self" some respondents finally apologized to their past selves for having been deceived into becoming a "comfort woman" (Hung 2010: 75).

In the last phase of drama therapy, it was hoped that different activities helped the respondents in dealing with their traumata, which were exposed in the "dialogue with the past self" (Hung 2010: 75). The respondents used a combination of art forms to express their traumata and the healing thereof physically and symbolically, for example by showing different symbolic ways to treat injuries. They recognized that their injuries needed to be treated and they were willing to be cured. According to Hung, this "indicated also that they did not deny the existence of their pain and they wanted to be relieved of them" and "implied the capacity of self-treatment, also meant the realization that although their traumas were caused by others, they did not have to wait for others to provide treatment." (Hung 2010:76)

At the beginning of the study, survivors made excuses to signal that they did not want to revisit their past experiences, such as claiming to have forgotten what happened. At the end, they acknowledged that issues of the past had never passed away and that feelings of pain, anger and disappointment of both themselves and also society still mattered to them. (Hung 2010: 77-78)

2.3.2.2. Outcome

An important result of drama therapy was that the survivors were enabled to see their own experiences in a historical context, and the historical perspective on issues of colonization and abuse by a colonial power relieved them of personal issues of blame and individual responsibility of having been deceived (Hung 2010: 78-79)

The effectiveness of the therapy was evaluated and showed several positiv effects on survivors: awareness that the experience of sexual assault was only one part of their lives, help in processing negative emotions, increased strength to face these emotions and the ability to develop different interpretations of past experiences (Hung 201079-80)

Hung concludes that drama therapy can empower survivors in different ways: they may enjoy the creativity and innovation of drama, develop confidence as creativity is pursued, and explore personal issues in metaphoric ways. Another important aspect is that bonds and friendships developed between the women.

After the study was finished and following suggestions made after the research, the "Taipei Women's Rescue Foundation" continued to host a drama therapy group every other month as well as individual counselling sessions. The production of the documentary "Song of the Reed" was also involved in the therapy group of the "Taipei Women's Rescue Foundation". Hung suggests future studies should investigate the links between historical, political and social strands involved in issues concerning former so-called "comfort women". (Hung 2010: 81)

2.4. State of the Art

2.4.1. On so-called "comfort women"

Obviously, there is lots of on-going research conducted on the issue of so-called "comfort women" in the context of international relations, Japanese and Korean nationalism, and reconciliation and historical justice. To give some examples: Hayashi Hirofumi (2007) "Japanese Imperial Government Involvement in the military "Comfort Women", Daniela Rechenberger, (2007) "The "Comfort Women" Issue: On the Treatment of a Japanese War Crime in the Japanese Mass Media.", Suh Jae-Jung (2010) "Truth and Reconciliation in South Korea.", or the work of Kim Dong-Choon of 2010 "The Long Road Toward Truth and Reconciliation." and "Korea's Movement to Settle the Issues of the Past and Peace in East Asia.".

Kim Yoon-ok' focuses on the legal aspects in her article: "The 2000 Tokyo War Tribunal – the Trial and its Rulings".

Important articles on the issue of so-called "comfort women" in a feminist context are Nishino Rumiko's "The Japanese Citizens' Movement against Nationalism and Gender Issues in their Work using the example of "Comfort Women." of 2007 and Muta Kazue's "The 'comfort women' issue and the embedded culture of sexual violence in contemporary Japan" of 2016.

2.4.2. On feminist documentary analysis

Relevant work on documentary analysis in a feminist context has been written by Maggie Hennefeld in 2018 ("Feminist Filmmaking and the Future of Global Film Politics."), Domitilla Oliviere in 2012 ("Haunted by reality. Toward a feminist study of documentary film: indexicality, vision and the artifice.") and Nam Soo-young in 2001 ("Recounting 'History': Documentary as Women's Cinema.").

On the ethical aspects of documentary filmmaking, I consider Wang Yiman' s article of 2005 ("The Amateur's Lightning Rod: DV Documentary in Postsocialist China.") and the research done by Chris Berry (see for example: Berry, Chris; Lu Xinyu; and Rofel, Lisa (ed.) (2010) "The New Chinese Documentary Film Movement.) relevant for the topic of my paper. They write about the concept ethical responsibility of documentary filmmakers and on the issue of filmmakers exploiting their subject. I tried to include this concept in my analytical framework as well (see 3.2.3)

2.4.3. Analysis of documentaries on so-called "comfort women"

Regarding actual documentaries on so-called "comfort women", little comparative research has been conducted so far. In "Recounting 'History': Documentary as Women's Cinema.", Nam has compared two documentaries of which one was on so-called "comfort women" (Dai-Sil Kim-Gibson's "Silence Broken"). In 3.2.2 I will go into more detail on her research.

Jonwoo Jeremy Kim has written an essay on one of the documentaries I also analyse in this paper, Byun Young-Joo's "The Murmuring". In his essay, he emphasizes gender norms and heteronormative sexuality when analysing the documentary.

Aiko Yoshioka did not comparatively analyse documentaries, but personal histories of time witnesses. In her paper, "Analysing Representations of the comfort women issue", she finds that gender perspectives to the issue are complex and contradictory.

3. Methodology

3.1. Research methods

This paper follows a comparative approach and tries to analyse and compare the following documentaries using the analytical framework of criteria explained in 3.2.:

1. "Senso Daughters" by Sekiguchi Yuka (1989)
2. The trilogy "The Murmuring" (1995), "Habitual Sadness" (1997) and "My own breathing"(1999) by Byun Young-joo
3. "Song of the Reed" by Wu Hsiu-ching (2014)
4. "The Apology" by Tiffany Hsiung (2016)

The conduction of expert interviews with directors of documentaries on the topic is another method I chose to gain more insight and provide different perspectives on the "comfort women" discourse. I had the opportunity to meet and talk to director Wu, who stayed in Vienna on the invitation of the Vienna Center for Taiwan Studies to show the documentary "Song of the Reed" and give lectures in multiple venues. Director Wu let me conduct an expert interview about her documentary during her time in Vienna.

In addition, Byun Young-joo, director of a renowned documentary trilogy on so-called "comfort women" agreed to be interviewed via E-mail. Later, I also got the chance to also interview director Sekiguchi, who directed "Senso Daughters", which we also did via E-Mail.

I tried to reach director Tiffany Hsiung as well, but so far, I was not successful. Unfortunately it was not possible to get into contact with her.

The interviews with the three directors I could talk or write to offered interesting new insights and perspectives to the discourse and the transcript of the interviews are enclosed at the end of this paper.

3.2. Analytical framework

The analytical framework used in this paper is mainly based on "Haunted by Reality. Towards a feminist study of documentary film: indexicality, vision and the artifice" by Domitilla Olivieri and "Recounting 'History': Documentary as Women's Cinema" by Nam Soo.Younng, as well as some important points made by Chris Berry regarding documentary ethics. After studying Hung Su-Chen's paper "Exploring the Recovery Process of Former Taiwanese Comfort Women through Drama Therapy.", which I explained in 2.3.1., I decided to add the criteria of whether the production of the documentaries may have supported the healing process of survivors.

3.2.1. Domitilla Olivieri – feminist documentary analysis

Olivieri's work concerns the relation between documentaries and gender, and tries to answer questions such as: "What is the relation between anthropological film and gender? What is the link between documentary and the hegemonic practices of inclusion and exclusions? How can anthropological films become accountable to their audience as well as useful tools for the production of knowledge and representations sensitive to gender and other cultural and social differences?" (Olivieri 2012:5). Documentary studies, feminist film theory and visual

anthropology are three domains concerned with shared issues: the aesthetics, ethics and politics of representation (Olivieri 2012:19).

Feminism is often concerned with the politics and ethics of images, and of representation in art, popular culture, literature and film, emphasizing the "male gaze" within art production, but feminist film scholars focused their attention mainly on mainstream fiction films, often ignoring documentaries. However, documentary films are important when realizing how much they actually influence the way we learn about and look at other cultures, societies and historical events. (Olivieri 2012: 17-18)

Post-colonialist and feminist scholars elaborated that when analysing documentaries about non-Western societies, one should be aware that the relationship with cultures of former colonies is influenced by power imbalances at an economic, geo-political and social level, and also at the level of cultural representation (Olivieri 2012:23). This is what Oliveri describes as the "imperial gaze" that exists in addition to the "male gaze", which also means that filmmakers reproduce cultural stereotypes. (Olivieri 24-25).

Olivieri understands feminist documentary theory and practice as one that critically reflects on power and knowledge production as well as on methods and politics of representation (Olivieri 2012:11). She proposes a feminist approach to documentaries, one that tries to challenge dominant representations and conceptions, and which studies the relation of reality and documentary film critically (Olivieri 2012:14). Olivieri encourages one to always question patriarchal discourses and ethnocentrism, not only when watching documentary films. She explains that in order to observe and critically produce knowledge on (documentary) films and filmmaking, scholars have to be aware of what they assume, and the reasons for their assumptions, at the basis of their observations. (Olivieri 2012:20) She suggests a way to look at documentaries in a critical, interdisciplinary, feminist perspective and in the context of the contemporary geopolitical situation (Olivieri 2012:10).

I will look at two documentaries on so-called "comfort women" and try to answer some of these questions to analyse whether they are "feminist documentaries" according to Olivieri's framework. For Olivieri, a documentary has to be critical and reflexive about patriarchal gender norms, meaning both social and symbolic norms, aware of hegemonic discourses and cultural and economical power imbalances, and attentive to global and historical implications of current geo-political affairs in order to count as a feminist documentary (Olivieri 2012:5). She considers documentaries feminist that are "*haunted by reality and regarding feminist issues*, namely, issues of gender, power, and processes of representation, inclusion and exclusion." (Olivieri 2012:8). The determining questions in this regard are if the documentaries deal with issues of power and gender and if so, how do they deal with it? Can they eventually trigger political changes? (Olivieri 2012:7)

3.2.2. Nam Soo-Young – Historical documentaries on women's issues

Expert for cinema studies Nam Soo-Young analysed two documentaries that focus on women's stories: Dai-Sil Kim-Gibson's "Silence Broken" on Korean former so-called "comfort women" and Trinh Minh-Ha's "Surname Viet Given Name Nam" on Vietnamese women past and present. She tries to answer the questions of whether documentary films offer a truthful representation of women's voices, if their testimonies lead viewers beyond the so-called "received truth" of official national history, and if women's voices act as mere informants or as central forces of historicization. (Nam 2001: 80-81)

The tradition of documentary filming lies in synchronous recording, allowing the audience to listen to the "real", actual voice of individuals. The two documentaries analysed in Nam's paper use this tool as well as the documentaries analysed in this paper, in which we hear the "real" voice of former so-called "comfort women" a lot. Nam argues that this is the reason why many feminist filmmakers employ documentary forms in dealing with women's issues, opting for a direct representation of women. (Nam 2001: 81)

Nam explains how the notion that documentary images are more "innocent" and truthful than fictional films is problematic. Even in documentary films, there is a hierarchy among representation of voices. Traditional documentaries often use the tool of voice-over, also known as "voice-of-God" as a salient and authoritative voice that surpasses any other voice represented in the film. Female narrators are very rare and are usually excluded from this authoritative position. The voice-over has authority over the narrative of the documentary and tells the audience the so-called "official" truth. Event thought accounts of a nation's history are supposed to include all its constituents, women's lives and sufferings have often been ignored and untold in accounts of "official" history, which includes historical documentary films. Efforts to bring women's life and agony to the forefront of documentaries often depend upon interviews with them, in which their own, real voices are recorded and shown in the film without the voice-over of a male narrator. Nam argues that the perceived true history needs to be reconstituted by women's direct testimonies, which are a particular form of oral history. (Nam 2001: 81-82)

"Silence Broken", the documentary on Korean former so-called "comfort women" that Nam analysed, does not have a voice-over. There is a shift in emphasis from an author-centered voice of authority to a witness-centred voice of testimony (Nam 2001: 100). The only voice other than of the interviewees is the voice of the interviewer. During the interviews in "Silence Broken", the interviewer does not appear on the screen and her presence is only reported through the voice-off, meaning the audience hears here voice asking questions from the background, but never actually sees her. (Nam 2001: 83-84)

The interviews follow a certain pattern: interviewees tell their stories in a similar fashion, giving details regarding their hometown, age, manner of recruitment as so-called "comfort women" and experience at the so-called "comfort station". Nam explains that even though the documentary includes interviews of Japanese soldiers and scholars who argue against the charges or try to justify what happened, the result of the interviews with former so-called "comfort women" is that "One by one, as the stories are told, they form a grand narrative of a crime against humanity." (Nam 2001: 83). "Silence Broken" shows how different the positions of the Korean former so-called "comfort women" on the one side and of the Japanese officials and scholars on the other side are. While the women reveal the atrocities that were committed against them, the other side does not want to hear them, asks for historical truth, for "documents" about it, and denies the charges of sexual slavery. The documentary, in which survivors demand apology and compensation of the Japanese authorities, shows the conflict of sexism, nationalism, colonialism, the postcolonial problem of representation of the Other and the truth of a collective historical trauma. (Nam 2001: 97-98)

Nam concludes that both "Surname Viet Given Name Nam" and "Silence Broken" belong to women's cinema and meet criteria for feminist documentaries in their attempt to give voices back to the silenced women, so that they can tell their stories in their own way. This is done by employing the technique of interviews for projecting the main meaning rather than a traditional male voice-over to give authority over the narrative of the documentary. (Nam 2001: 105-106)

I will also include in my framework the criteria of voice in filming techniques and ask whether or not there is a voice-over and if so, is it a male or female voice? Who belong the voices to that the audience hears the most? Is there an emphasis on the testimonies of former so-called

"comfort women"? Which space do the interviewer and her voice take up? Do the interviews add up to form a greater narrative? Does the documentary give women voices back to tell their stories in their own ways?

3.2.3 Chris Berry – documentary ethics

Expert for film studies Chris Berry, who researches East Asian cinema and screen cultures, documentary films as well as gender and sexuality in cinema, pointed out at a lecture he gave in Vienna that there is always an "ethical dilemma" or "conflict of consciousness" when producing documentary films regarding the exploitation of the subjects of documentaries. He gave an example concerning documentary ethics on former so-called "comfort women": on the one hand, filmmakers need to show emotions in order to touch their audience as on-camera suffering wins empathy, but on the other hand, filmmakers should not exploit the emotions of victims for the success of their production and their benefit, particularly when the subjects might feel discomfort and are reluctant when asked to speak about their past experiences because of shame and victim blaming.

Generally, documentary filming poses multiple ethical issues and questions on how to represent the subjects with dignity and sensitivity, on what to shoot and what not to shoot. The production process of documentaries often includes long-term relationships developed between documentarians and their subjects, in which filmmakers live with those being filmed more in a manner of an anthropologist (Berry et al. 2010: 10).

However, the relationship between them is almost never of equal power and those filmed can only trust that documentarians edit the film so that it is true to its subjects (Bershen 2010). Even if filmmakers are from the same milieu and share common experiences with subjects and are in a position of sympathy and understanding towards them, once filmmakers point a camera at them, the balance of power is no longer equal and shifts in favour of the filmmakers (Reynaud 2010: 163). Hennefeld also points out that the relationship between filmmakers and their subjects is a relationship of different power, because filmmakers speak on behalf of their subject. Filmmakers should make films that give voices to them, rather than overwrite their voices (Hennefeld 2018: 210-211).

Documentary film in general is considered to be a representation of reality, which is why discussions of documentary ethics often proceed from the assumption that one key issue is to represent reality as accurately as possible and consequently, to minimize the impact of the process of documentary filming on the reality that is meant to be represented. Even in the case of activist documentaries, studies in English-language academia mostly focus on the reception of documentaries rather than their social engagement during production. On the contrary, independent documentaries in China often understand documentary filming as part of reality, not a representation separate from it, and therefore filmmakers are concerned that the filming process itself should be a social practice that benefits their subjects. (Berry et al. 2010: 10)

Chris Berry further explained how it is not ethical for filmmakers and broadcasters to build their careers on the suffering of those they film, and filmmakers should be conscious that they might exploit and abuse victims again in their pursuit of audience.

In an article on documentary in China, film and cinema scholar Wang Yiman discusses the necessary cruelty of exposing people's sufferings. She writes about a documentarian who noted that she felt like a thief who had stolen something from poor old men who continued their old lifestyle on the street while she won an award for her documentary on them (Wang 2005: 21). Wang cites another female documentarian, who explained that "the cruelty of a documentary lies

precisely in its excessive proximity to reality (Wang 2005: 22).

Regarding documentaries on former so-called "comfort women", Chris Berry mentioned that a possible solution to this problem is to always treat the women as survivors, rather than as victims, throughout the whole documentary process.

I consider this "ethical dilemma of documentary making" to be an important concept when analysing documentaries, especially but not only when they are about survivors of sexual violence. This is why I will add the question of how the documentaries deal with this ethical dilemma to my analytical framework.

3.2.4. Final Analytical Framework

To summarize, my analytical framework aims to enable me to answer the following questions when analysing the documentaries:

1. Does the documentary represent its subjects in a way that is sensitive to gender and other cultural and social differences?
2. Does the documentary deal with issues of power and gender and if so, how does it deal with it?
3. Is the documentary critical and reflexive about patriarchal gender norms, meaning both social and symbolic norms?
4. Does the documentary (re)produce stereotypes and cultural inequalities? Is it aware of cultural and geo-political power imbalances?
5. Is the documentary aware of economic power imbalances?
6. Is the documentary aware of hegemonic discourses on its topic?
7. Who is included and who is excluded? How does the representation differ to hegemonic practices of inclusion and exclusion?
8. Is the documentary attentive to global and historical implications of current political affairs?
9. Can the documentary eventually trigger political change and justice for survivors?
10. Can the documentary connect to a broader feminist discourse on issues of victim blaming and (conflict-related) sexual violence?
11. Is the documentary a useful tool for the production of knowledge?
12. How does the documentary deal with the ethical dilemma of exploitation of its subjects?
13. Regarding voice in filming techniques: Is there a voice-over and if so, is it a male or female voice?
14. To whom belong the voices to that the audience hears the most?
15. Is there an emphasis on the testimonies of former so-called "comfort women"?
16. Which space do the interviewer and her voice take up?
17. Do the interviews add up to form a greater narrative?
18. Does the documentary give women voices back to tell their stories in their own ways?
19. Could the production of the documentaries have supported the healing process of survivors?

In order to create a more feasible analytical framework that enables me to give concrete examples from the documentaries for these questions, I chose to group questions that are strongly connected into the following categories/criteria. This is my final analytical framework:

1. Gender norms[2] and socioeconomic power imbalances
2. Stereotypical images, cultural inequalities and geopolitical power imbalances
3. Awareness of hegemonic discourses on "comfort women"
4. Inclusion and Exclusion
5. Global and historical implications of current political affairs
6. Can the documentary eventually trigger political change and justice for survivors?
7. Is the documentary a useful tool for the production of knowledge?
8. How does the documentary deal with the ethical dilemma of exploitation of its subjects?
9. Filming and narrative techniques: voice, voice-over, interviews, testimonies
10. Support of the survivors' healing process
11. Connection to a broader feminist discourse on victim blaming and sexual violence

[2] Gender norms refer to a wide set norms and ideas about how women and men should be and act. Internalised early in life through socialisation, gender norms can establish a life cycle of gender socialisation and stereotyping. Gender norms are standards and expectations to which women and men generally conform. The norms are defined by societies cultures and communities at a certain point in time. (EIGE 2018)

4. Analysis

4.1. “Senso Daughters”

4.1.1. Background Information of the documentary

Having been released in 1989, “Senso Daughters” (戦場の女たち, *senso no onnatachi*) is the oldest documentary analysed in this paper. It is directed by Japanese director Sekiguchi Yuka and co-produced by Sekiguchi herself and Tenchijin Productions, Australia, Siglo Co.Ltd., Japan, and the Institute of PNG studies, Papua New Guinea. When I asked director Sekiguchi in the expert interview (see 7.3.) if she had watched other documentaries on so-called “comfort women”, she replied that back then she did not come across similar films at all.

Director Sekiguchi, who changed her first name from Noriko to Yuka by now, actually lived with the women depicted in the documentary for up to six month on end over a time period of seven years and won several awards for her work: Best Documentary in 1989 at the Japanese Catholic Cinema Club, Best Documentary in 1990 at the Melbourne Film Festival, Best Documentary in 1990 at the International Short Film Competition and Best of Category in 1991 at the San Francisco Film Festival (Icarus Films 2018).

The documentary focuses on the legacy of the Japanese occupation of Papua New Guinea during the Second World War that lasted form 1942 to 1945, and on the Japanese imperial army's mistreatment of women and girls.

In the beginning and the end of the documentary, viewers see written explanations about the Asia-Pacific War and Japanese Emperor Hirohito. The documentary also shows older library footage of Japanese soldiers stationed in Papua New Guinea and photographs taken during wartime.

The first scene of the documentary shows the Imperial Palace Plaza in Tokyo of October 1988, when people came to pay respect to the terminally ill Emperor Hirohito, who eventually died in January 1989. In the text that the viewers see before this scene, they learn that the war “was fought in the name of Emperor Hirohito.” (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 1). While seeing people bowing to the Imperial Palace, the audience hears the voice-over of Sekiguchi herself, explaining: “The Palace Plaza had a special significance in modern Japanese history. This is where young soldiers came to salute the Emperor before going to fight his sacred war and this is where the Emperor broadcasted his speech of unconditional surrender.” (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 1-2)

According to Sekiguchi, there is little public recognition in Japan about the occupation of parts of Papua New Guinea and the fights that occurred there, and she learned about it only when studying in Australia after graduating from her Japanese university in 1982 (Ronin Films 2018.). Government numbers say that 127, 000 Japanese soldiers fell during the occupation of Papua New Guinea that lasted from 1942 to 1945. A surviving soldier interviewed claims it were 140, 000. Text at the end of the documentary gives the number 245, 000, which includes indigenous and Taiwanese men conscripted as labourers. Only 11, 000 men returned to Japan alive. (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 17-18 and 52-53)

The voice-over does not last throughout the whole documentary, which is mostly made up of interviews in different locations in Papua New Guinea and in Japan. Interviewees include people from Papua New Guinea, both women and men, who talk about their experiences during Japanese occupation, a Japanese veteran and an ex-corporal who was posted to Papua New Guinea, a Japanese military surgeon and gynaecologist who worked for the Imperial army in Shanghai and Rabaul, a Japanese historian and Japanese women who served as nurses and matrons in the war.

The documentary ends with Papua New Guinean women singing a Japanese song about gratitude to the Emperor's soldiers for fighting for them and protecting them, which seems totally ironical after listening to their testimonies on the abuse they suffered during the occupation. (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 51-52)

4.1.2. Application of the analytical framework

4.1.2.1. Gender norms and socioeconomic power imbalances

In the very beginning we hear Sekiguchi acknowledge that women have little space in war history: "Filming at the Plaza all day, observing these people, so sure of their commitment, I felt like a stranger in my own society. As a woman in Japan, it is difficult for me to review and pass comment on our war history. War is seen as men's business. But I know women definitely had a role in the war and it was this story I really wanted to investigate. However, I would have to start this story with men." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 2-4)

The documentary reveals the blatant sexism that dominated Japan during wartimes, when women were literally treated as commodities, as historian Senda Kako explains: "There were strict rules for troopships. Soldiers, weapons, ammunition and food were the basic cargo. In addition, troopships would carry horses, military horses and military dogs and military homing pigeons. Nothing else. The women weren't horses or dogs or pigeons. When they had to transport women, they created a special category and registered them as "military commodities". So if they wanted to send 100 women, they'd record them as "100 military commodities". It meant that if the ship were sunk, while the names of the soldiers were kept, there were no records for the women." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 30-32). This shows how while the male soldiers were still treated as human beings, women counted almost less than the animals that were transported.

4.1.2.2 Stereotypical images, cultural inequalities and geopolitical power imbalances

On the one hand, the documentary might actually re-enact stereotypical images of Papua New Guinea, because in the interviews there, interviewees are shown singing, dancing and performing menial tasks in a setting of lush nature (scraping coconut for example (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 6-7)) and in traditional clothing, while Japanese witnesses are interviewed mostly in offices-like settings indoors, in professional attire and with books in the background.

On the other hand, Sekiguchi critically shows the colonial mind-set and racism of the Japanese military personnel. Ex-corporal Miya Ichiro explains how there were different brothels for personnel of different ranks; enlisted men had Korean and officers Japanese so-called "comfort women". (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 23-26) When Sekiguchi asked him whether there were any sexual relations with Papua New Guinean women, he replies: "I can't imagine a soldier ever screwed one of them. The women really stank in those days. Now they're clean and tidy but then they weren't. I really wouldn't ever have thought of having sex with them." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 42-43). Veteran Goto Yusaku answers in a similar manner: "The native girls all had skin diseases on them. As you know, it was really bad. They had all sorts of skin diseases. And they were naked, covered in mud. They were dirty things." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 43-44).

Ironically, just before these scenes, two Papua New Guinean women, Makunia Noira and Angela Pirigi, explain how one of them became pregnant from a Japanese soldier and then faced scrutiny from her family for having given birth to a light-skinned baby.

In her interview with veteran Goto, Sekiguchi also reveals the colonial mind-set of the military personnel. She asks him: "So what about compensating Papua New Guinea?" and receives this response: "For what and on what grounds should Japan compensate? If the New Guineans asked for compensation, I'd like to ask them the grounds of their claim. After all, we were defending them. I don't think we caused them any trouble. We only used their land as a battlefield." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 43-44).

This understatement, "We only used their land as a battlefield.", is pushed ad absurdum as a number of Papua New Guinean witnesses recount how the poorly supplied Japanese soldiers at first offered to trade for food and then demanded it at gunpoint, or forced them to produce food and work for them. To give a few examples, Delica Hinasoi states: "Because allied planes cut the Japanese supplies, we were made to heat the milk and boil it off to make their cooking oil." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 6-8), and Kapido Towuat: "Food became scarce during the Japanese occupation" (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 28-29). And Josephine Diai even reports how her crops were permanently destroyed: "Before the war, taro was our staple crop. But then it was completely destroyed. During the Japanese occupation, the Japanese came and looked for women. (…) And they'd threaten women and men, if we didn't give them food." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 12-14).

On the issue of colonialism, I found director Sekiguchi's response to my question on the image of the Japanese language very interesting: "Surprisingly there is no negative image on the Japanese language. You know WHY? Because with previous colonial masters like Dutch, German, English and Aussie, they didn't even bother teaching them languages. To them, they were native slaves. They pride themselves that they were sent school to learn Japanese. I was surprised that their Japanese was intact!"

In the expert interview, I also asked her about the reception of "Senso Daughters" in different countries. She explained to me: "Some overseas Koreans argued that the film undermined Korean comfort women. I realized back then, human hierarchy. What about those native men who touched Japanese comfort women? Their head was cut off. What about native women completely denied their existence? The film must provoke people."

4.1.2.3. Awareness of hegemonic discourses on "comfort women"

As explained in 1.2.2., the discourse on "comfort women" at the time of production of "Senso Daughters" was only at its beginning. To put it in Sekiguchi's words, "Many people in Japan have heard of military prostitutes, or comfort women, conscripted for the sacred war. But this story too, was hidden by silence." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 15-16).

One the one hand, the documentary shows quite a lot of evidence of the existence of so-called "comfort stations", such as the photographs of military surgeon and gynaecologist dr. Aso Tetsuo, who was called to examine about a hundred women in Shanghai, and later worked in Rabaul. Sekiguchi's interview with him offers interesting insights: "It was on 2nd January, 1938, that we received an order from the Army's Department of special services, which was based in Shanghai. (…) There I was told they had women from Japan and from Korea. They said there were about a hundred of them and that I was to examine them. I never expected that a gynaecologist would be so useful to the Army! Twenty of them were Japanese, from here, northern Kyushu. The other eighty were Koreans, from the peninsula. Those women from Korea, most of them…were virgins. The women from northern Kyushu were all professionals." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 19-21), "(…) the number of soldiers was unbelievable. It was hot in Rabaul, so they only had curtains over the windows. Each woman was given a mat. (…) Only

thin curtains, so we could see right through them" (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 23-24).

Dr. Aso took photographs of the Cosmopolitan Hotel in Rabaul in 1943 that is said to have been the largest Japanese military brothel in the South Pacific, a condom used by the Army, and a poster with regulations for military brothels that says: "Japanese military personnel only. (…) Leave the room immediately after ejaculation or face military punishment." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 22-23). Another photograph shows the doorway of a so-called "comfort station" with writing on it: "Welcome, all heroic soldiers of the sacred war! We patriotic Japanese women offer you our minds and bodies." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 32-33). These photographs confirm the existence of official military brothels.

An interview with Kapido Towuat provides proof for the existence of another so-called "comfort station". When given the photograph of the Cosmopolitan Hotel, she says "No, the brothel here was different. (…) We used to wash the women's clothes and prepare their food." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 27-29).

On the other hand, the documentary depicts instances of denial of coercion and victim blaming, like the interview with a former matron in Rabaul, Iizuka Suzu, who claims to not have known that many of the women were Koreans and says: "The military men didn't really take them…They just sprang up from nowhere. They weren't my concern. Near the war's end I was told to train them as nursing aids so that they could return home officially. I told these women: 'I can never forgive you for what you've done'." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 31-32).

The documentary debunks a common justification for the recruitment of so-called "comfort women", that they were necessary to protect the local women from conflict-related sexual assault during the war. Matron Omori Fumiko claims: "Owing to the presence of these comfort women, we nurses were protected from sexual harassment. Well, you see, whatever we did in the military, we all dedicated ourselves to our country. That's how I feel about comfort women. It seems to me that the comfort women were a necessary evil. Particularly as we were fighting for so long. If we hadn't taken those women with us, there would have been a lot of trouble for the native women." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 33-34) This justification is rendered ad absurdum when the next scenes of the documentary show interviews of local survivors testifying of the sexual violence they experienced during the Japanese occupation.

When I asked director Sekiguchi about her thoughts of the hegemonic image of former-so called "comfort women" looking like "sweet little grandma", she said: "It's an all male perspective to me, though 'looking like sweet little grandma' may be NOW, but not in those days. (…) It sounds like very patronizing male point of view."

4.1.2.4. Inclusion and Exclusion

Sekiguchi criticizes how women are excluded in war history ("War is seen as men's business." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 2-3)). Another example of this is the fact that there wouldn't be any records of women if a military ship was sunk, as historian Senda Kako explains (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 31-32).

The documentary itself tries to include all sides; Sekiguchi interviews women and men of different ages on the legacy of the Japanese occupation, and in Japan interviews a former soldier, a former higher-ranking military corporal, a gynaecologist, two matrons, and a historian. To give an example, viewers first hear Josephine Diai report on how the Japanese soldiers first tried to trade for food and then demanded it at gunpoint: "The good ones would ask us before taking food. But others were aggressive. (…) And they'd threaten women and men, if we didn't give them food." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 13-14). A few minutes later in the documentary, viewers hear the

other side from veteran Goto, who explained his limited range of choices: "(…) as the war situation deteriorated, we had hardly any supplies of food or ammunition. In addition to that, we suffered from attacks of diseases like malaria (…) When we ran out of food, we had to procure food for the HQ staff. To "procure" food in normal circumstances would mean to commandeer it. That is, to seize food by force. But of course we never did that in New Guinea. There we would talk to the natives and ask them to deliver food for us." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 17-19).

4.1.2.5. Global and historical implications of current political affairs

The question of responsibility of Emperor Hirohito for the Japanese war crimes is a central theme in the documentary, which even starts with a scene of the Imperial Palace Plaza. We hear international radio programmes of 1988 discussing the critically ill Emperor's role in the war (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 14-15).

Sekiguchi criticizes the silence on the war crimes against women and girls, and how little is know about the battles in Papua New Guinea: "(…) the Emperor represents a barrier to the past (….). It is a war of silence around the Emperor and the sacred war that hides part of our history: The story of New Guinea, and the story of women in the war. Many people in Japan have heard of military prostitutes, or comfort women, conscripted for the sacred war. But this story too, was hidden by silence." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 14-16).

4.1.2.6. Can the documentary eventually trigger political change and justice for survivors?

"Senso daughters" features no references to demands for apology or reparation for former so-called "comfort women" or the survivors of sexual violence in Papua New Guinea, which comes as no surprise as during the time of production, the discourse on the issue was just about to start.

However, Sekiguchi directly asks veteran Goto: "So what about compensating Papua New Guinea?" and receives little understanding for that question ("I don't think we caused them any trouble. We only used their land as a battlefield") (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 43-44).

The documentary often broaches the issue of historical justice in the sense that Sekiguchi criticizes often how history textbooks exclude the role of women in the war and the occupation in Papua New Guinea ("our history books taught us nothing about this battlefield." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 9-10)). When filming the book collection of veteran Goto on the battles in Papua New Guinea, Sekiguchi points out that "most of these are written by survivors (…) these stories of hardship and suffering were only circulating among themselves." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 17-18).

On the subject of political advocacy, director Sekiguchi said in the expert interview: "Politics is very important. The decent government is equally important. The world is slowingly changing and when time comes, the demand of my film will come again. However, my film is not propelling the change itself."

4.1.2.7. Is the documentary a useful tool for the production of knowledge?

Because of the many valuable testimonies of contemporary witnesses from both the Japanese and the Papua New Guinean sides, the documentary is definitely a useful tool for the production of knowledge. It shines light upon an issue largely ignored, and Sekiguchi points out that even

though the harbour of Rabaul became a Japanese city with 100,000 troops and the largest Japanese command centre in the South Seas, from where attacks were made against Australian and American forces in both mainland New Guinea and the Solomon islands, "our history books taught us nothing about this battlefield." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 9-10).

Regarding the discourse on so-called "comfort women", the documentary shows evidence of the existence of "comfort stations" in Rabaul, such as the photographs of the Japanese gynaecologist Dr. Aso (described in 4.1.1.3.) making it a source of knowledge on the issue.

4.1.2.8. How does the documentary deal with the ethical dilemma of exploitation of its subjects?

When conducting the interviews with the women in Papua New Guinea, it appears as if Sekiguchi never pushed them to say anything, but gives them a lot of time to tell their stories their own way. They don't seem uncomfortable or reluctant when speaking abut their past experiences. She never interrupts her interviewees, although Goto Yusaku interrupted Sekiguchi when she tried to give an example for reasons why Papua New Guinea might ask Japan for compensation (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 43-44).

In some interviews, it becomes apparent that Sekiguchi lived with the interviewees and seems to have learned Pidgin English to better communicate with them. When the interviewees talk about experiences of sexual violence, they are portrayed as survivors rather than as victims, and are given space to talk about their past in a way that feels right for them, often quite matter-of-factly.

In the expert interview, director Sekiguchi told me: "(…) my location research method is like anthropological field research. I must learn their language, even a little. That will develop friendship and eventually trust. At one time, I lived there 6 months longest. Sometimes 3-4 months. It took me 7 years to complete the film! (…) LANGUAGE is essential. It's the only way to obtain first hand information."

And when I directly asked her what consideration she had in mind regarding the ethical dilemma of documentary filmmakers, she further replied: "Taking time. You must take time to overcome ethical issues. You have to have mutual respect and trust. You cannot rush. 7 years is the years I took."

4.1.2.9. Filming and narrative techniques: voice, voice-over, interviews, testimonies

Sekiguchi employs the technique of a voice-over, at least in some parts of the documentary. She herself does the voice-over, so obviously it is a female voice. It seems that the voice-over is not intended to give authority over the narrative, as Sekiguchi talks a lot about her own thoughts during her experience of investigation the Japanese occupation of Papua New Guinea.

Sekiguchi's voice is also audible during the interviews in the voice-off and it is her voice that the audience hears the most. During the testimonies of Papua New Guinean women, Sekiguchi never interrupts them and gives a lot of time and space to the women to tell their stories their own ways.

The emphasis of the documentary lies on the testimonies of contemporary witnesses: Papua New Guinean women and men, and former Japanese military personnel. Although some women share their experience of sexual exploitation and rape during the war, there are no testimonies of actual "comfort women" that we see in the other documentaries treated in this paper. It seems that most of the estimated 10, 000 women who stayed in the so-called "comfort station" in the

Cosmopolitan Hotel in Rabaul were Korean and Japanese. In the end titles, we read: "the number of Melanesian women used as "comfort women" cannot be estimated." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 52-53).

Since "Senso Daughters" shows many different sides and perspectives of the issue, there is no greater narrative as Nam describes when analysing "Silence Broken" (see 3.2.2.).

4.1.2.10. Support of the survivors' healing process

From watching "Senso daughter", it is difficult to judge whether the documentary production could have supported the healing process of survivors. The people of Papua New Guinea who appear in the documentary generally seem to enjoy being in front of the camera and sometimes even seem to be excited about being filmed. In some scenes, we see people gathering in the background, maybe out of curiosity, maybe in order to be filmed as well. It is possible that the filmmaking of "Senso daughters" helped the survivors to see their own experiences in the historical context of colonization and thus relieved them of personal issues of blame as described in 2.3.1.2..

I asked director Sekiguchi about examples of how her filmmaking might have supported the survivor's healing process. She said that trust was the most important factor: "I don't believe me or my film have a power to 'HEAL'. Although healing may perhaps be achieved out of mutual (between the subject and the filmmaker) respect and trust."

4.1.2.11. Connection to a broader feminist discourse on victim blaming and sexual violence

Yes, issues raised in "Senso daughters" definitely connect to a broader feminist discourse on victim blaming, prostitution and conflict-related sexual violence. The documentary has many examples of the different forms sexual violence takes on during war and the long-term consequences for its victims (for example, the mixed-raced child of Makunia Noira). We also hear testimonies of survivors who were raped by Australian soldiers, not just victims from the Japanese (see Sekiguchi 1989: minute 47-58). The matter-of-fact manner in which survivors tell their stories in "Senso daughters" shows us how normalized conflict-related sexual violence is.

In today's feminist discussions on (forced) prostitution, the notion that women shouldn't be regarded as commodities to sell, buy and order is highly relevant. In the documentary, we hear historian Senda explain how the Imperial Army very literally treated women as commodities: "When they had to transport women, they created a special category and registered them as "military commodities". So if they wanted to send 100 women, they'd record them as "100 military commodities". It meant that if the ship were sunk, while the names of the soldiers were kept, there were no records for the women." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 30-32).

As mentioned above in 4.1.1.3, there are instances of victim blaming, like matron IIzuka stating, "The military men didn't really take them…They just sprang up from nowhere. (…) I told these women: 'I can never forgive you for what you've done. But I suppose it's all you were capable of'." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 31-32).

The claim of matron Omori Fumiko that so-called "comfort stations" protected the female nurses and local women ("Owing to the presence of these comfort women, we nurses were protected from sexual harassment. (…) If we hadn't taken those women with us, there would have been a lot of trouble for the native women." (Sekiguchi 1989: minute 33-34), is highly problematic from a feminist point of view. Still today, feminist scholars have to continue to prove

that the belief that prostitution keeps men from raping non-prostituted women is simply not true[3]. In the documentary, the two interviews that we see directly after the one with Omori, are conducted with Papua New Guinean rape survivors and can be regarded as evidence that the strategy described by Omori had not worked.

[3] Gender-based sexual violence is associated with sociocultural attitudes that encourage men to feel entitled to sexual access to women. Prostitution and pornography encourage this entitlement. See for example: Cotton et al. 2002: 1790.

4.2. Byun Young-joo's Trilogy

South Korean female director Byun Young-joo released three documentaries on former so-called "comfort women". "The Murmuring" was released in 1995, "Habitual Sadness" in 1997 and "My own breathing" in 1999.

4.2.1. "The Murmuring"

4.2.1.1. Background Information of the documentary

"The Murmuring" (낮은 목소리, *najeun mogsori*) directed by South Korean director Byun Young-joo was released in 1995 and was filmed over the years 1993 and 1994.

Byun Young-joo won two awards for "The Murmuring": the Japanese Shinsuke Ogawa Award, which corresponds to an Asian Newcomer Award, at the Yamagata International Documentary Film Festival in 1995, and the Korean Film Critics Special Award in 1996. In 1996, "the Murmuring" was screened nationwide in Japan and in 1998, "the Murmuring" together with its sequel, "Habitual Sadness" were screened at the Berlin International Film Festival. "The Murmuring" was also invited to the New York Human Rights Film Festival as well as the Montreal Film Festival and other North American and European film festivals (see interview with director Byun in the abstract).

Between 1993 and 1999 Byun Young-joo documented the lives of Korean survivors and partly lived with them. "The Murmuring" focuses on six former so-called "comfort women" who live in the *namun ui jib*, the "House of sharing"[4], a shelter supported by a private Buddhist group: Kim Soon-duk, Park Ok-nyun, Park Do-ree, Lee Young-sook, Kang Duck-yeong and Song Pa-nim.

The documentary shows their life in the "House of sharing" and their struggles in demanding Japan to redress the comfort women problems through weekly protests (Wednesday Demonstrations) in front of the Japanese embassy in Seoul. The documentary explains how the "Korean Council for the Women Drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan", founded in 1990, started to lead the Wednesday Demonstration in 1992. In the years following the first testimony of survivor Kim Hak-soon in August 1991, who also appears in the documentary, 163 women reported that they share her experience." (Byun 1995: minute 0-2)

After a short (written) introduction in the form of text in the opening credits, the documentary starts with recordings of the 100th Wednesday Demonstration in front of the Japanese embassy in Seoul on December 23rd in 1993 (Byun 1995: minute 1-4). Survivor Park Ok-nyun explains the reason why they go to the demonstration: "We want immediate compensation. We want the Japanese to listen to our demands. If we die, the generation after us will continue. But we want the problem solved while we are alive." (Byun 1995: minute 5-6).

In 1994, the filming crew also went to the Chinese city of Wuhan in Hubei province, where Korean women and girls were forced to serve a "comfort station". After the war ended,

[4] The residential project „House of sharing" was founded in the early 1990s to create a home for former so-called "comfort women", who were already of advanced age and without much capability to earn their own income. Donations for the project came from Buddhist communities and individuals from across South Korea. The first house was opened in 1992 and moved to Gwanju in 1995. In 2007, ten survivors lived in the house. The "House of sharing" also runs a museum for the history of so-called "comfort women" about an hour away from Seoul. (Ahn 2007: 315)

some of the survivors returned to Korea, others committed suicide, and some of them stayed in Wuhan. After some discussion, the Chinese government allowed Byun to film three of the 18 Korean survivors there together with local coordinators of the regional government of Hubei.

In addition to the filming, "The Murmuring" shows written explanations as text and also Photographs taken during World War II in between film segments.

4.2.1.2. Application of the analytical framework

4.2.1.2.1. Gender norms and socioeconomic power imbalances

The documentary picks out social and gender differences as a central theme, particularly when it comes to unequal opportunities, and is also aware of economic power imbalances. It becomes apparent in the documentary that almost all of the survivors the audience gets to know are and/or were poor and come from economically disadvantaged backgrounds. For example, survivor Park Do-ree says: "When I was young, my family was so poor, I sometimes begged." (Byun 1995: minute 29-30). Another example is survivor Lee Young-sook explaining how she received not even basic education because she was a girl: "We're even illiterate. What could we have done? Women learning to read and write were considered cheeky. I persistently asked my father for a chance to study. He finally said if I really hoped to, I could study at night if I worked hard during the daytime. But my mother opposed. She said daughters are useless even if they studied. It was a custom not to educate daughters however rich they were." This example further shows that the documentary is critical and reflexive about patriarchal gender norms. In addition to Lee Young-sook, survivor Song Pa-nim also says: "My only wish was to continue schooling." (Byun 1995: minute 16-17). Lee Young-sook also reports: "Women learning to read and write were considered cheeky (…) It was a custom not to educate daughters.". She believes that "if we had studied, we wouldn't be where we are now" (Byun 1995: minute 81-83), connecting her denied opportunity to study to her experience as a so-called "comfort women".

The documentary further raises awareness of the difficult economic situation the survivors face in their old age, as Song Pa-nim points out: "Although it's a big house, only two rooms have heating. (…) It's so cold, but we have no money. We don't know how to manage our life. The sick have no means to receive treatment or buy medicine. Nobody helps us." (Byun 1995: minute 26-27).

Issues of gender and power are intensively dealt with in the documentary. When describing their past, the survivors illustrate that they had indeed almost no power, no agency or control over what happened to them as so-called "comfort women", the problem of illiteracy mentioned above is just one example. However, after the first testimony of Kim Hak-soon that lead to more and more awareness and a discourse in Korean society, they gradually began to gain agency to fight for compensation, as Kang Duck-yeong tells here: "I saw Kim Hak-soon on TV one day. I was so surprised at first, but…I had the same experience, but I couldn't speak up. I kept working. The news told about her many times. (…) The problem was about Comfort Women. I had the same experience. I felt ashamed. It's strange. So I decide to keep my silence. But when Japan denied historical facts, I couldn't remain silent any longer. I'm a live witness, finally talked to MBC, the broadcasting company." (Byun 1995: minute 9-10)

When telling me about reactions to the documentary, director Byun told me that watching "The Murmuring" also helped a young survivor of sexual abuse regain her courage to face life again. She wrote Byun: "I watched the documentary and went back home to write this letter. Now I will also, like the grandmothers, meet people, laugh, talk and live my life." (see 7.2. "Interview with director Byun").

4.2.1.2.2 Stereotypical images, cultural inequalities and geopolitical power imbalances

Regarding the reproduction of stereotypes and cultural inequalities, the documentary does to some extent stress the "Korean-ness" of the former so-called "comfort women", which becomes apparent in the scenes shot in Wuhan, for example when survivor Ha Koon-ja, whose real name is Ha Sang-suk, shows how she insists on eating Korean rice; "Not Chinese but Korean rice. (…) Koreans should eat Korean rice." (Byun 1995: minute 46-47).

Concerning the stereotypical image of so-called "comfort women", the documentary does not paint a picture of the survivors as "sweet little grandmas" or "pure victims". When I asked director Byun how she felt about stereotypical images of "comfort women" in the expert interview we conducted, she replied: "This is their daily life. I thought it would be the very worst thing to do to tell their story while packing them up as 'pure female victims'.".

The documentary definitely challenges the hegemonic image of the former so-called "comfort women" as "sweet little grandmas", by letting them show their bitter, bold, strong and stubborn sides that may contradict the image of "ideal victims". For example, they are shown smoking and drinking, and talk about struggles with suicidal thoughts and substance abuse as a result of their traumatic experiences in the past, like survivors Song Pa-nim - "I drank heavily to forget all. (…) I had no choice but to keep on living, I worked hard in the daytime, drank heavily and came home." (Byun 1995: minute 17-19) - or Lee Young-sook – "All I do is play cards and smoke. I go nuts if I don't smoke, so I smoke again, I don't care if I die." (Byun 1995: minute 31-33) admit.

Park Do-ree even seems to be aware that her bitter talk about suicidal thoughts contradicts with prevalent images of "grandmas", when she mentions that she would be in shame if her words were recorded: "For me, life is nothing but trouble. I think I'm better off dead. They say I shouldn't think that way. But I'm desperate. I'd rather die than live longer in misery. They say I would live longer if I said that. I'd be in shame if my words are recorded. It'll be such a shame." (Byun 1995: minute 28-31).

4.2.1.2.3. Awareness of hegemonic discourses on "comfort women"

On the question of whether the documentary is aware of hegemonic discourses on the issue of "comfort women", it shows some examples of how former so-called "comfort women" were also hurt by their own society, contradicting the hegemonic discourse of the Japanese aggressors and Korean victims, partly reframing the issue from a national to an issue of violence against women. One example is Park Doree talking about her abusive husband: "He was a heavy drinker. I suffered so much because of him. When he died, I didn't cry. Life with him was a series of trouble. I lived with a married daughter and a little son. He didn't cry when his father died. He suffered, too." (Byun 1995: minute 28-29).

"The Murmuring" also broaches the issue of victim blaming/ victim shaming, for example explains survivor Ha Koon-ja, who was held in a comfort station in Wuhan, that she was too

ashamed to return to Korean after the war: “I wanted to, but I was so ashamed that I was in such a terrible place.” (Byun 1995: minute 40-42) or survivor Kim: “I couldn’t tell anyone about it, I was ashamed of what happened.” (Byun 1995: minute 60-62).

Survivor Lee Young-sook felt so ashamed she considered killing herself on the ship bound to Korea after the war: “With my body so unclean how can I get married? I was better off dead. (…) I could have died if I jumped overboard. I regret I didn’t.” ((Byun 1995: minute 68-70). Survivor Park Ok-nyun even said that not only was it humiliating to tell her story, but sometimes she was ashamed to protest at the Wednesday demonstration (Byun 1995: minute 6-7).

4.2.1.2.4. Inclusion and Exclusio

Yun Jung-ok, the representative of the “Korean Council for the Women Drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan” is shown in the documentary speaking about the historical background of so-called “comfort women”. She criticizes that women were and are still often excluded in discourses on the war: “After the Independence, our men, drafted workers and students, returned to Korea. But I heard no news about women returning. I remember the Japanese had all the women finger-printed. But strangely there was no news of women returning. (…) Worst of all, the historians ignored the problem. Their interest lay only in student soldiers and forced draftees, and not in the women. I thought this was wrong. They didn’t take any effort in shedding light on comfort women.” (Byun 1995: minute 13-15).

Kim Kyung-hee, who works as a manager for the Council, is also recorded talking at a Wednesday Demonstration about how exhibitions on war exclude women and neglect their accounts: “The photos here show that the fight for Independence was fought only by men. There were women, too. That’s why we protest. When the war broke out, are you aware that women also had their share? (…) The exhibition ignores such efforts by women.” (Byun 1995: minute 78-79).

4.2.1.2.5. Global and historical implications of current political affairs

The documentary is obviously critical of Japanese imperialism, but it is not only attentive of the relation between Korea and Japan, but also of global implications of the “comfort women” issue. At a Wednesday demonstration, it is mentioned that “the problem is not ours alone. It affects all Asia” (Byun 1995: minute 80-81). By filming in China, too, “The Murmuring” brings attention to the fact that former so-called “comfort women” come from and are living outside of Korea as well.

Yun Mi-hyang from the “Korean Council for the Women Drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan” explains at a Wednesday Demonstration in 1994 that they were trying to include the US government and particularly Hillary Clinton, who was the first lady then, to join their movement and to put pressure on the Japanese government regarding the “comfort women” issue. Yun uses the demonstration to talk about other current international affairs, for example a protest against Japan possibly becoming a permanent member of the United Nations Security Council. She further touches on the issue of the unification of Korea, mentioning that former so-called “comfort women” are in North Korea too. (Byun 1995: minute 79-81)

Other political topics of international relevance the documentary shines light upon are the Japanese history textbook controversy and monuments representing so-called “comfort women”, when survivor Kim Soon-duk says: “The truth must be taught to children though history

textbooks. And as we demanded erect a monument for the teenagers who died or killed themselves." (Byun 1995: minute 98-99).

4.2.1.2.6. Can the documentary eventually trigger political change and justice for survivors?

"The Murmuring" not only documents the lives of former so-called "comfort women", but it also documents their and other's activism for their cause and grants space to the "Korean Council for the Women Drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan". It shows multiple Wednesday Demonstrations, a public hearing (Byun 1995: minute10-12) and an assembly with Korean government members (Byun 1995: minute 27-29).

Not only by lighting up several issues connected to the discourse on so-called "comfort women", but especially by filming the actual demonstrations and assemblies, the documentary is very involved in activism for political change.

As explained in 2.2.2.,"justice" in the context of sexual violence can mean "retributive justice" (emphasis on prosecution and punishment), or "restorative justice" (emphasis on processes of healing). In "The Murmuring", there is space for both elements. To give an example for "retributive justice", the former so-called "comfort women" chant "punish them" together with other activists at a Wednesday demonstration in the first scene of the documentary (Byun 1995: minute 3-4).

As for "restorative justice", the question of reparation is a main theme of "The Murmuring". The survivors collectively say that they refuse to accept "consolation money" (it is not explicitly said in the documentary, but refers most likely to the Asian Women's Fund), but instead want proper reparation and apology (both material and symbolic reparation). After watching the documentary, I had the impression that some of the survivors actually don't care so much where the money they might receive actually comes from, and would accept any means to alleviate their poverty and health care needs, even though they don't explicitly say so. It seems that the refusal to accept the financial compensation from the Asian Women's Fund is more a wish of the "Korean Council for the Women Drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan" than of the individual survivors. (see Byun 1995: minute 7-8)

The biggest wish of the survivors who lived in Wuhan was to go and visit Korea. It is possible that the documentary, in showing their wish to a bigger audience, might help them to eventually be able to visit Korea.

"The Murmuring" touches on the issue of historical justice by mentioning the controversy regarding the "comfort women" issue in Japanese history textbook and monuments representing the survivors (see Byun 1995: minute 98-99).

When I asked director Byun abou the question of political advocacy, she replied: "There are still a lot of people fighting, and after "the Murmuring", many other films by different directors were produced. I think it is important to keep fighting like that."

4.2.1.2.7. Is the documentary a useful tool for the production of knowledge?

Compared to "Senso Daughters", in "The Murmuring", there is less emphasis on uncovering facts about the past, and more focus on the struggles of former so-called "comfort women". The intention of director Byun to help her audience gain a deeper understanding of the suffering of the survivors is obvious when watching the documentary.

However, because "The Murmuring" shows information as text and photographs of wartime Korea and Wuhan, China (Byun 1995: minute 38-40) in addition to film, it is definitely a tool for knowledge production. Another factor is that the documentary includes not only detailed accounts and testimonies of many live witnesses both in Korea and China, but also the explanations of an expert of the, Yun of the "Korean Council for the Women Drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan" (Byun 1995: minute 13-15 and 36-38).

In addition to being a source of knowledge on the so-called "comfort women" system during the war, the documentary is an important source regarding the truth and reconciliation process of the early 1990s, with the scenes of the Wednesday demonstrations, the hearing, the assembly, and the interview with Kim Hak-soon on how she spoke up for the first time in 1991 (Byun 1995: minute 10-11).

4.2.1.2.8. How does the documentary deal with the ethical dilemma of exploitation of its subjects?

On the one hand, there are some scenes in the documentary during which it is questionable if the survivors really consented to being filmed, for example when survivor Kang Duck-yeong is seen passed out or sleeping after the New Years' Eve party (Byun 1995: minute 95-96), or if they really wanted to tell their stories in as much details as the director made them by asking more detailed questions, for example when Byun made survivor Ha Koon-ja specify what kind of disease she had had (Byun 1995: minute 47-48).

On the other hand, the "grandmothers" are never treated as victims, but are always shown as strong individual personalities. In particular, the six survivors who live in the "House of sharing" get to show multiple sides of their personalities, not only those that fit the main narrative and stereotypical images of former so-called "comfort women". There are many scenes where they express anger, bitterness, sadness and regret over the terrible things that happened in their youths, but there are also scenes where they are portrayed as creative, youthful and playful, singing, dancing, entertaining and making fun of each other (for example: Byun 1995: minute 20-21, 33-34 and 64-65).

Before going to the assembly with Korean government members, the survivors of the "House of sharing" even ask director Byun to film at the assembly (Byun 1995: minute 25-26).

When conducting the expert interview with director Byun, I ask her about her considerations regarding the ethical dilemma of possibly exploiting her subjects. Byun replied: "It's about waiting. It's about waiting for the grandmothers to be ready to express themselves in their own terms. I think there is no other way than waiting.".

4.2.1.2.9. Filming and narrative techniques: voice, voice-over, interviews, testimonies

In the very beginning of the documentary, we hear director Byun Young-joo's voice-over, explaining about the "House of sharing". Obviously the voice of the voice-over is a female voice.

During the interviews with the survivors, Byun's voice is audible in the voice-off, but she is never directly seen. Interviews are conducted extensively with the survivors living in the "House of sharing" and the three survivors they were allowed to film in Wuhan, but also with survivor Kim Hak-soon, the art teacher of the survivors of the "House of sharing", and Yun and other members of the "Korean Council for the Women Drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan".

In sum, the voices that the audience hears the most are the voices of the former so-called "comfort women" in the "House of sharing" and in Wuhan. There is obviously an emphasis on the testimonies of former so-called "comfort women".

In some interviews, director Byun in the voice-off is heard asking many questions in a very interactive manner, for example in interrupting to ask for more details, but generally the survivors are given time and space to tell their stories their own ways.

The interviews with the survivors add up to form a greater narrative, in a similar way to how Nam Soo-young describes "Silence Broken" (see chapter 3.2.2.).

4.2.1.2.10. Support of the survivors' healing process

From watching the documentary alone, it is difficult to answer whether the filmmaking of "The Murmuring" helped in the healing process of the survivors. The content of the documentary does cover the survivor's healing process, showing for example the painting lessons they take and their paintings (Byun 1995: minute 21-25). Being filmed might have been a way for them to explore and express emotions such as anger and loneliness.

I asked director Byun for more examples of how filming might have supported the survivor's healing process and she told me about the reason why she started to make "The Murmuring" in the first place: "I started to plan on filming 'the Murmuring' in 1992 after a very casual incident: I went to the "House of Sharing" to meet a friend who volunteered there. While greeting the grandmothers, as soon as they realized I was a director, I was told to leave. The women lived 50 years hiding their wounds and then had the courage to show the world that they existed, but the Japanese government did not apologize. Many reporters and artist created something about these women, but because they never shared the consequences, the grandmothers were left with a deep sense of victimization. When I got home from there I thought that I would make that film. In other words, what interested me was not the fact that they were victims that were greatly harmed by the Japanese military as "comfort women", but I wanted to make a film about how their lives changed when they stepped forward after a living with a secret for so long. So, until January 1994, I went to their home every day for two years and tried to become their friend. During that time I did not take any shots. Eventually, in 1994, I started to film the grandmothers. Then in 1995, it was completed and first screened for one month in three small theatres in Seoul. The grandmothers came to the theatre every day to meet with the audience. I think this probably was a healing process for them. It was a healing process and enjoyable for the women, who never liked themselves, when the audience, after seeing their appearances in the documentary, told them: 'I like you'." In this case, what Byun thinks was a healing process for them was actually the consequence of the film.

4.2.1.2.11. Connection to a broader feminist discourse on victim blaming and sexual violence

Yes, "The Murmuring" raises issues that obviously have a connection to a broader feminist discourse on victim blaming, prostitution and conflict-related sexual violence. The testimonies of the survivors give many examples and details of sexual violence and the long-term psychological and physical consequences thereof. To give an example, survivor Lee Young-sook recounts that she became infertile and how her past as so-called "comfort woman" negatively affected her marriage (Byun 1995: minute 66-67)

Issues such as the objectification of women (Byun 1995: minute 11-12), and the connection of socioeconomic and educational disadvantages (I listed several examples in chapter 4.2.1.1.1.) to gender-based violence and prostitution are still very relevant today and topical in current feminist discourses.

During the expert interview, director Byun, when asked if she thought the documentary could start a discourse on today's societal problems, said: "(…) the important thing is that the Korean patriarchal culture has kept these women silent for such a long time. I think these women are not only victims, but the most important feminist activists fighting against sexual violence in wars. (…) I strongly hope that society will care more about war and women, and also about the sexual violence prevailing in our everyday life."

4.2.2. “Habitual Sadness”

4.2.2. 1. Background Information of the documentary

“Habitual Sadness” (낮은 목소리 2, *najeun mogsori* 2) is the sequel of Byun Young-joo’s “The Murmuring” and was released in 1997. Both documentaries were screened at the Berlin International Film Festival in 1998.

“Habitual Sadness” follows the lives of the Korean survivors we know from “The Murmuring” from summer 1996 to spring1997. With the national support they got after “the Murmuring”, they could build a farm in a quiet rural village in Gwangju, Gyeonggi province, and live a rural life there farming and raising chickens. The focus lies on survivor Kang Duck-yeong, who is slowly dying of late-stage lung cancer at the relatively early age of 69.

“Habitual Sadness” starts with the testimony of Kang Duck-yeong, telling us how she was first forced to work in a Japanese factory when she was 14 years old, escaped, was raped and then taken to a so-called “comfort station”. The documentary also shows her paintings in which she reprocesses her horrible experiences in Japan. Then we see text that explains the historical background of the documentary and the “House of sharing”: It moved from Seoul to the countryside in 1996, 8 months after “The Murmuring” was completed. The survivors themselves asked director Byun to go there and film another documentary since they moved to a new place. The new “House of sharing” is managed by the women themselves and three staff under the director, monk Hyejin, and is run by donations that followed the media coverage of the “House of sharing” project.

“Habitual Sadness” follows the lives of the Korean former so-called “comfort women” in the new “House of sharing” in the countryside. In addition to the survivors who appeared in “The Murmuring”, we meet Yun Kum-rye, Shim Mi-ja, Lee Yong-nyo and Kim Bok-dong, as well as survivor Yoon Du-ri, who does not live in the “House of sharing”, but rather in what seems to be her own apartment in Ulsan. The documentary focuses on the joys and struggles of the women’s lives at their own farm, working hard regardless of their old age, all while seeing Kang Duck-yeong being transferred to the hospital multiple times and eventually dying of cancer at the beginning of the year 1997.

The last scenes show the funeral of Kang Duck-yeong and the mourning of her friends, and older clips and photograph of Kang, as well as her paintings in which she process her past experiences. At the very end we see the remaining women looking to the future when they sow seeds into their field for the coming year. Before the closing credits, there is written explanation on the numbers of so-called “comfort women” in 1945 (80, 000, 65, 000 of whom were Korean), as well as an explanation on numbers of crimes that are related to sexual violence in Korea in 1995. Interestingly, the historian cited is Senda Kako, who appeared in “Senso daughters” as an interviewee of director Sekiguchi.

Apart from the “House of sharing” in the countryside of Gwanju, the locations of “Habitual Sadness” include the hospital in which Kang Duck-yeong is treated and the home of Yoon Du-ri in Ulsan.

4.2.2.2. Application of the analytical framework

4.2.2.2.1. Gender norms and socioeconomic power imbalances

Gender norms and roles, as well as socioeconomic status, are discussed in "Habitual Sadness" in the context of the situations of the survivors when they were forced or cheated into so-called "comfort stations". Almost all of them were poorly educated, could not read and had a poor family background.

This situation made it hard for example to turn down jobs they were offered, and some of them were actually lured into becoming so-called "comfort women" by fake job offers (Park Do-ree for example says: "Anyway, who could say no to job offer back then?" (Byun 1997: minute 38-40). Kang Duck-yeon too, was in a position in which she couldn't refuse to take a job offer in Toyama: "I was 14. My class teacher, the Japanese teacher sent me away. It was an order to be followed (Byun 1997: minute 0-1).

Again, the survivors express regret for not having had the chance to study, like survivor Shim Mi-ja says: "If I could have kept studying, I might have been a professor. Or if I could have studied more, I might have been a lawmaker or a minister (…) Whenever I see my lost youth and hope, it drives me crazy." (Byun 1997: minute 63-64). Some even express regret for being born female, such as Kim Soon-duk: "I want to be reborn as a man. Then, I would become a soldier. (…) Because I have a grudge on lost nation and oppressed lives." (Byun 1997: minute 63-65).

4.2.2.2.2 Stereotypical images, cultural inequalities and geopolitical power imbalances

As in "The Murmuring", the survivors are shown making fun of one another, making jokes about dating (see for example: Byun 1997: minute 36-37), drinking (see for example: Byun 1997: minute 37-40) and smoking heavily in multiple scenes, which contradicts the predominant, stereotype of a former so-called "comfort woman" as "sweet, little grandma". They are all shown as strong and independent. In the case of the survivors living in the "House of Sharing", they are growing their own produce, farming and raising chickens, all of which are hard work, especially considering their age.

Another example is Yoon Du-ri, who lives on her own in Ulsan. She is also portrayed in a way that contradicts the stereotypical image, because not only is her entrepreneurial success in the focus of the scenes that take place in Ulsan, but also her physical strength when she is filmed teaching director Byun about self-defence and showing here some self-defence moves. Yoon Du-ri also reports that she protects women on the street when she sees that men harass them (Byun 1997: minute 51-53)

Ethnical or cultural stereotypes, geopolitical power imbalances and (post-) colonialism are less of an issue in "Habitual Sadness" in comparison to its prequel. All scenes of "Habitual Sadness" are set in Korea, most on the grounds of the "House of Sharing" or inside the hospital.

4.2.2.2.3. Awareness of hegemonic discourses on "comfort women"

Concerning the question of whether the documentary is aware of hegemonic discourses on the issue of "comfort women", "Habitual Sadness" shows testimonies on how former so-called "comfort women" were also hurt by their own Korean society, contradicting the hegemonic images of the Japanese aggressors and pure Korean victims, and therefore reframing the issue

from a national one to an issue of violence against women. To give an example, survivor Kim Bok-dong recounts how her family did not believe her when she returned: "So I only told mom and older sister. But they didn't believe me. They said how a woman get raped by dozens of men in a day. They said I was lying" (Byun 1997: minute 27-28).

The testimony of Park Do-ree is another example of how women were mistreated by their own society, and also connects to the discourse on how Korean women ended up as so-called "comfort women". Not all of them were taken by physical force and were abducted, such as survivor Yun Du-ri (see Byun 1997: minute 44-45). Many were cheated and lured under false promises. Park Do-ree reports: „I was not drafted forcibly, rather I was cheated. (...) They lied that they offered me a job in a factory. (…) If this person is a Japanese come to a village, to figure out through a Korean, which family has a girl, I didn't know that back then, but the Koreans were bad. The Koreans told them all. (…) The Japanese ordered a village representative to report." (Byun 1997: minute 38-40).

4.2.2.2.4. Inclusion and Exclusion

The questions of who is included and who is excluded in "Habitual Sadness" and how the documentary's representation practice differs from hegemonic practices of inclusion and exclusion are hard to answer. "Habitual Sadness" is less political than its prequel "the Murmuring", as I will mention again with the following points of the analytical framework. This makes it quite difficult to apply the analytical framework consistently.

The documentary really focuses on the lives of the survivors living in the "House of Sharing" and the end of the life of the ill Kang Duck-yeong, so it's not really about showing different "sides" of a dispute or about having a space where people of different ethnicities or generations can express their perspective on the issue, as is the case with some of the other documentaries analysed in this paper.

The problem of women's exclusion in historical writing is also not so much a topic as it was in the prequel "The Murmuring". But because of the explicit focus on the everyday life of the survivors, the documentary does not feel like it excludes anybody. We could say that the difference to the hegemonic practices of inclusion and exclusion is this strong focus on the old women themselves.

4.2.2.2.5. Global and historical implications of current political affairs

The "Korean Council for the Women Drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan" appears in the documentary, especially the survivors' welfare committee of the Korean Council in the scenes that are set in the hospital where survivor Kang Duck-yeong gets treated. However, generally, "Habitual Sadness" is less political than "The Murmuring", as I have explained in the previous chapter. It therefore is less attentive to current political affairs and its global and historical implications.

"The Murmuring" had a part that was filmed in China on survivors who live in the city of Wuhan. In "Habitual Sadness", however, former so-called "comfort women" from other countries than Korea do not appear.

While "The Murmuring" was set mostly in Seoul, showing a lot of the activism concerning the "comfort women" issue, such as demonstrations, assemblies and meetings, "Habitual Sadness" is set almost entirely in the countryside, with an obvious focus on the

everyday life of the survivors. But still, showing the testimonies of former so-called "comfort women" on how they were "recruited" as such, the strength of the surviving women, their wish to tell the world what they had experienced and, their fight for historical justice make "Habitual Sadness" a politically relevant documentary.

4.2.2.2.6. Can the documentary eventually trigger political change and justice for survivors?

In comparison to its prequel, "The Murmuring", "Habitual Sadness" focuses less on political activism, although it is implied that some of the survivors still travel to Seoul to participate in the "Wednesday Demonstrations" and work together with the "Korean Council for the Women Drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan".

In "Habitual Sadness", the survivors live in a rather big house in the countryside with better living conditions and facilities than in the old "House of sharing". The media coverage of the "House of sharing" project has facilitated the donations to make the transfer to the new house possible, and "The Murmuring" was certainly an important factor in this, so we can conclude that it helped change the survivors' situation for the better.

When looking for elements of "retributive justice" (emphasis on prosecution and punishment or perpetuators) and "restorative justice" (emphasis on processes of healing) as explained in 2.2.2., "Habitual Sadness" puts more stress on "restorative justice", also in comparison to "The Murmuring". However, the issue of reparation that is a main theme in "The Murmuring" is not a focus anymore, "Habitual Sadness" emphasizes more the processes of healing, health care and community. There is also less emphasis in "Habitual Sadness" on historical justice when compared to "The Murmuring". Still, on top of raising awareness of the issue and the needs of surviving former so-called "comfort women", the documentary draws connections to current problems of sexual violence and related crimes. I will go more in detail on this in 4.2.2.1.11.

Another factor that might be important in this regard is that the death of Kang Duck-yeong could make people aware of the urgency of the issue, since all survivors are of respectable age by now and have not a lot of time left.

4.2.2.2.7. Is the documentary a useful tool for the production of knowledge?

"Habitual Sadness" features interviews and testimonies that we have not seen yet in "The Murmuring", because survivors who did not appear in the prequel and their stories are introduced. Additionally, survivors who did appear in "The Murmuring" recount their stories in more detail, especially on how they were forced into so-called "comfort stations", for example Kang Duck-yeong (Byun 1997: minute 0-3) or Park Do-ree (Byun 1997: minute 38-40).

So yes, "Habitual Sadness" is a tool for the production of new knowledge. The documentary also helps to produce further insights into the "House of Sharing" project, on how the "House of Sharing" is managed, who is involved in the project and what problems it struggles with.

As with "The Murmuring", the intention of director Byun to make her audience better understand the situation then and now, as well as the suffering of the survivors is obvious when watching "Habitual Sadness".

The fact that there is less emphasis on the past of the former-so called "comfort women" as perhaps in other documentaries on the issue doesn't automatically mean that it is not a useful

tool for the knowledge production. On the contrary, by focusing on the everyday life of the survivors in their old age, it offers another perspective.

4.2.2.2.8. How does the documentary deal with the ethical dilemma of exploitation of its subjects?

Director Byun actually asks the survivors who appear in the documentary: "How would you like to be seen in this movie? (…) How'd you like to be seen by people?" (Byun 1997: minute 30-31), and makes sure: "So you want to be seen like this?" (Byun 1997: minute 33-34). Survivor

It is obvious that especially the terminally ill Kang Duck-yeong wanted the rest of her life documented by Byun. She even requests: "Film me a lot while I am still alive" (Byun 1997: minute 10-11). And in January 1997, shortly before she dies, Kang admits: "I've been thinking about this film. I hope lots of people may come to see it. I will pray for that even if I die. So that it will get more of attention. It may move people to help us. That is my utmost wish." (Byun 1997: minute 54-56).

Shim Mi-ja, too, expresses that she is glad to have the opportunity to tell her story: "50 years of our lives with bitterness and deep sorrow…I am glad to be able to tell you all. I am also glad to be witness to history so as to inspire our children and strengthen our nation." (Byun 1997: minute 63-64).

On the other hand, there is a scene shown in which Park Do-ree says: "I don't want to be seen in the movie like this. How embarrassing it really is." (Byun 1997: minute 17-18), when she was quite drunk, and drinking and smoking even more.

The overall feeling when watching the documentary is that the survivors in the "House of Sharing" consider director Byun their friend and put a lot of trust in her, and it seems that they are all working on the documentary together, and that the filmmaking is a common goal of both the director and the women.

4.2.2.2.9. Filming and narrative techniques: voice, voice-over, interviews, testimonies

The first voice we hear when watching "Habitual Sadness" is the voice of survivor Kang Duck-yeong, who explains how she was forced into a so-called "comfort station" when she was a teenager.

In a similar manner as with "The Murmuring", we hear director Byun Young-joo's voice-over (obviously a female voice) in the beginning of the documentary, explaining that Kang Duck-yeong has late-stage lung cancer and wished to be filmed to the very end of her life. However, in "Habitual Sadness", there are multiple scenes in which there is Byun's voice-over, not only explaining things, but also talking about her own feelings, so it is a more reflexive documentary.

During the interviews, director Byun's voice is audible in the voice-off. However, another difference to "The Murmuring" is that in "Habitual Sadness" Byun is seen in multiple scenes also in front of the camera, for example when she harvests and carries home pumpkins with the survivors (Byun 1997: minute 30-32). The filming style is more participative and interactive than with "The Murmuring", another example of this is the scene in which survivor Yoon Du-ri teaches director Byun self-defence moves, and both of them are visible (Byun 1997: minute 51-53). It seems that the survivors themselves are actually sometimes behind the camera as well.

The women get to tell their stories their own ways and seem to have a lot of influence on how they are portrayed and what things are filmed (see examples given in 4.2.2.1.8.). They also

seem very comfortable when in front of the camera.

In the end, the voices that the audience hears the most are again the voices of the Korean former so-called "comfort women". There is an emphasis on their testimonies about their past, but also a strong perspective on their personalities and their current situation.

The interviews with the survivors add up to form a greater narrative, in a similar way to "The Murmuring".

4.2.2.2.10. Support of the survivors' healing process

As mentioned in 4.2.2.1.8., the survivors themselves wanted the documentary to be filmed, and this fact is quite obvious when watching it. In the expert interview I conducted with director Byun, she also stresses this when explaining why she made a sequel: "In 1996, the documentary was screened in Japan, and in the accommodation close to where we screened it in Japan, the grandmothers personally proposed to me to make another documentary. I did not want to. It was too hard. At that time, grandmother Kang Duck-yeong, who is seen dancing drunk in the last scene of "the Murmuring", the scene of the year-closing party, asked me to film her life until the end, because she had late-stage lung cancer and only six months left to live. So we started to produce "Habitual Sadness"."

Throughout the documentary, we hear the survivors requesting to be filmed, or that for example their pumpkins are filmed. Byun asks them: "Why did you ask us to film the pumpkins?" and Kim Soon-duk answers: "Well, because we grew them. We wanted you to film the harvest. Why?" (Byun 1997: minute 30-31). The process of filming the documentary is clearly a way for the women to be creative and express their emotions, as well as an opprtunity to create a truthful image of themselves for the world to see.

In 2.3.1., I presented Hung's study on drama therapy and that it can empower survivors in different ways: they may enjoy the creativity and innovation of drama, develop confidence as creativity is pursued, and explore personal issues in metaphoric ways. Another important aspect is that bonds and friendships developed between the women. It seems that the filming of "Habitual Sadness" helped in a similar way, the survivors really appear to be comfortable and enjoy being filmed, and generally seem more confident than in the prequel, "The Murmuring".

4.2.2.2.11. Connection to a broader feminist discourse on victim blaming and sexual violence

"Habitual Sadness" actively draws a connection to feminist issues and sexual violence. Before the closing credits, there is a text, first giving the numbers of so-called "comfort women" in 1945 and then stating: "In 1995 there were 7,031 sexual violence related crimes officially reported in Korea. Considering only 2.2 percent of them are reported to the police, total number of sexual violence related crimes estimated around 320,000." (Byun 1997: minute 66-67).

Byun also stated in the expert interview: "I strongly hope that society will care more about war and women, and also about the sexual violence prevailing in our everyday life."

The issues of victim blaming and victim shaming are raised in "Habitual Sadness" as survivors recount how they have been blamed for being tricked into so-called "comfort stations" or that even their families did not believe them. To give an example, Kim Bok-dong says: "In Korea, it used to be shameful for a women to have been there. So we only had to keep it in our hearts. We couldn't speak up before. But if we keep silent, our 2nd generation won't know about brutality committed by Japan." (Byun 1997: minute 61-63).

Another issue raised in the context of conflict-related sexual violence are the long-term psychological and physical consequences of it, especially infertility. When asked about their wishes, two survivors say that they wished to have children (Shim Mi-ja: "I feel sorry for myself. Everyone has children, but not me. (…) Whenever I hear others calling 'mom' or 'grandma', I am broken-hearted" (Byun 1997: minute 8-9), "My wish is to wear wedding dress and to get married. I want to have a big happy family.", and Kim Bok-dong: "My only wish is to have a child. Giving birth that is my wish." (Byun 1997: minute 64-65). Kim Bok-dong also talks about her infertility: "There is no way I become pregnant. Women who suffered for a long time like me can't be pregnant." (Byun 1997: minute 28-29).

I also consider the scenes in Ulsan with survivor Yoon Du-ri key scenes in this regard. I have already mentioned it in the previous chapters, but her talks about self-defence and protecting women from harassers definitely connect to current feminist discourses on female empowerment in situations of sexual harassment. In the scene, Yoon Du-ri explains: "When you fight with a man, you have to be close to him. No matter how strong she is. So if you happen to fight with a man, attack under the chin (…) The guy will try to hit you. Then I am like 'You bastard, come on!' He would throw a punch at you. (…) Then let me show how to grab him (…) With this skill, you even could beat down a Goliath. (…)If I see guys pester girls on the street, I would say 'don't you let go of them? Don't you dare? You bastards must go insane', I would say: 'let her go, you little shits!' (…) I pretend to hit them with a stone, then they run away. The girls thank me and run off too." (Byun 1997: minute 50-53).

4.2.3. “My own breathing”

4.2.3.1. Background Information of the documentary

“My own breathing” (낮은 목소리 3 - 숨결, *najeun mogsori 3 - sumgyeol*) is the last part of Byun Young-joo’s trilogy on former so-called “comfort women” and was released in 1999. The final part of the trilogy is about survivors who have died and those who were still alive and fighting for their cause.

According to director Byun, the key element in “My own breathing” is that the survivors interview each other on their experiences in the so-called “comfort stations” (see expert Interview with Byun in chapter 7.2.)

“My own breathing” starts with text that explains the historical background of so-called “comfort women”. The first actual scene shows a ceremony commemorating the former so-called “comfort women” who had already died, including Kang Duck-yeong, whose death was a main topic in the prequel “Habitual Sadness”.

The documentary showcases photographs of the crew of the trilogy’s first two parts, “The Murmuring” and “Habitual Sadness, of late Kim Hak-soon, the first survivor to publicly testify, of other survivors who have passed away, and old photographs of the survivors when they were young.

Survivors who have not yet appeared in the first two parts of the trilogy are introduced, such as Hwang Geum-joo, who was drafted to the so-called “comfort station” in Jilin in China, Lee Yong-su and Kim Bun-seon, who were both drafted to so-called “comfort stations” in Taiwan, Shim Dal-yeon, who was so traumatised that she does not know where she was taken to, Seo Bong-im, who was drafted to Java, Kang Myo-ran, who came back to Korea from Shanghai in 1995 and is now fighting against cancer, and Kim Yoon-shim, who was drafted to a so-called “comfort station” in Harbin, China.

A first part of the film follows survivor Lee Yong-su travelling to different places to interview other survivors. Before travelling to multiple locations in South Korea, Lee Yong-su goes to the Philippines in March 1998, to visit the “Lola’s House” (Lola means grandmother and refers to former so-called “comfort women” in this context).

In Korea, the documentary first show Kim Bun-seon’s birthday party in November 1998, before the survivors Lee Yong-su and Kim Bun-seon visit Kim Bun-seon’s hometown in Gyeongsangbuk province. Lee interviews Kim. In December 1998, they both speak at a meeting of the Daegu citizen’s Forum for Halmeoni.

Lee also interviews the survivors Seo Bong-im, Shim Dal-yeon, and Kang Myo-ran, who they visit in a senior nursing home in Gangwon province.

The second part of the documentary then focuses on survivor Kim Yoon-shim, who is filmed winning the Jeon Tae-il Literary Award for her essay on her life as a so-called “comfort woman” and then interviewed by director Byun. During the interview, passages from her book are inserted into the documentary as text (Byun 1999: minute 61-62 and 68-69).

At the end of the documentary, the 365th Wednesday Demonstration in June 1999 is shown, before the audience sees text: a timeline of events, starting with August 1991 when survivor Kim Hak-soon first testified, and ending with: “As of July 1999, the number of registered survivors is 150.” (Byun 1999: minute 69-70).

Then a dinner with the survivors and the survivors’ welfare committee of the Korean Council is filmed. At the end of the dinner scene, the survivors talk directly to the camera, saying that they want apologies, reparations and punishments of the responsible perpetrators (Byun 1999: minute 72-74)

The very last scenes of "My own breathing" show paintings of the survivors and finally the funeral of Kang Myo-ran, who passed away in June 1999. The style is similar to the scene of Kang Duck-yeong's funeral in "Habitual Sadness", because there is no sound at all when showing the funeral and the preparations for it (Byun 1999: minute 74-76).

4.2.3.2. Application of the analytical framework

4.2.3.2.1. Gender norms and socioeconomic power imbalances

"My own breathing" points out and criticizes patriarchal gender norms both in the past and today, such as the norm that women had to marry a husband chosen for them by their parents or the connection of a women's value to her reproductive abilities (see example in 4.2.3.1.3.)

To give another example, survivor Kim Yoon-shim also tells us how she was able to flee from a so-called "comfort station" and reunite with her mother, just to be immediately married, even though she was only sixteen years old at the time: "So I got married that night, I would not be drafted, they said. That's why they had me married in a hurry. (…) I didn't want to get married at all, with a man. I didn't know that after I got married, I had to share the room with him. (…) I was sixteen" (Byun 1999: minute 45-46). In the end, the rushed marriage had not been necessary: "We were liberated soon after my marriage. So I cried because I didn't have to get married like that. Anyway, it was my fate that my parents set for me, so I somehow managed to keep living." (Byun 1999: minute 46-47).

When discussing victim blaming with director Byun, survivor Kim brings another example of how patriarchal gender norms keep victims of sexual violence from reporting the crimes they endured: "There was an old custom that women shouldn't go outside. My father used to say that. That's why my father wouldn't accept me after I came back. That made me feel that I was the sinner. "(Byun 1999: minute 67-678).

As for economic power imbalances, there are less references in "My own breathing" than in its prequels.

4.2.3.2.2 Stereotypical images, cultural inequalities and geopolitical power imbalances

The documentary is obviously critical of colonialism, as the scenes in the Philippines but also in South Korea show. The issue of Japanese gold diggers that came to dig gold in Korea during the colonial period is broached when Kim Bun-seon reports how Japanese men, who came to her hometown to dig gold in the gold mines, abducted her and four other girls while they were grubbing herbs in their mountainous hometown in Gyeongsangbuk province.

On the other hand, when director Byun interviews survivor Kim Yoon-shim and they talk about the situation of victims of sexual violence in today's South Korea, they tend to generalize Korea as well as the US, as the following example illustrates: "You know, a country like the USA, in there, they encourage sexual violence victims like us to reveal something like that to people. So those victims are naturally empowered in the society like that. But it is not like that in Korea. (…) But we are not like that because of Korean customs." (Byun 1999: minutes 66-68). It is not just a generalization, but also an oversimplification of the actual situation, and the recent discourse on rape culture in the US perfectly shows that it is still not like that, and certainly has not been like that 10 years ago, when the documentary was made.

4.2.3.2.3. Awareness of hegemonic discourses on "comfort women"

On the question of whether the documentary is aware of hegemonic discourses on so-called "comfort women", "My own breathing" shows testimonies of former so-called "comfort women" about being hurt by their own, Korean, society and even their own families, which contradicts the hegemonic discourse of the Japanese aggressors and Korean pure victims, and therefore reframes the issue from a national one to an issue of violence against women.

For example, survivor Kim Yoon-shim reports being blamed by her mother for her husband's infidelity: "(…) the man I married to brought another women, because I couldn't bear a child. So my mother was furious. But they told my mother that she sent me who was a 'disfigured'. She was shocked and asked me what that meant. So I told her everything. (…) I told her what they did to me, she lamented saying that I should have died there and I should have never come home." (Byun 1999: minutes 46-48).

This example further shows how the victims were shamed for what was done to them and silenced. It is no wonder that most kept their experiences as so-called "comfort women" a secret for such a long time when having to expect reactions like that, especially from their close family members. Later in the interview, Kim Yoon-shim says: "I have kept my mouth shut. I was afraid all the time because of my past. (…) Well, I wouldn't say anything to anybody (…) I was afraid that if they might find out my past (…)" (Byun 1999: minutes 63-64).

4.2.3.2.4. Inclusion and Exclusion

In contrast to the first two parts of director Byun's trilogy, "My own breathing" first includes someone from Japan: a Japanese support group, the "Fukuyama Exhibition Committee for the victims' paintings", which comes to pay respect to the gravestone of survivor Kang Duck-yeong, who has recently passed away.

While the film crew travelled to Wuhan in China in "The Murmuring" to meet Korean survivors who live there, and stayed in South Korea the whole time with "Habitual Sadness", "My own breathing" shows a trip to the Philippines and to former so-called "comfort women" living there, as well as their project, the "Lola's House". So although rather brie, the perspective from the Philippines' side is included in the documentary this time.

The inclusion of survivor Kim Yoon-shim's deaf-mute daughter, who is also interviewed in the second part of the documentary, as well as a young woman who volunteers to care for former so-called "comfort women", offer perspectives on the issue from the younger generations' point of view.

The problem of women's exclusion in historical writing is not so much a topic as it was in "The Murmuring", there is just a brief mention that the stories of so-called "comfort women" should be included in history textbooks (see (Byun 1999: minute 71-72).

4.2.3.2.5. Global and historical implications of current political affairs

Compared to its prequel, "My own breathing" is more attentive to politics in general. In the first part of the trilogy, the film crew went to Wuhan in China to film Korean survivors living there. In the sequel "Habitual Sadness", they stayed in Korea and focused on the daily life of the survivors. And in the third instalment, "My own breathing", they travel abroad again, this time to the Philippines.

In the Philippines, survivor Lee Yong-su is filmed while she visits the "Lola's House", in which a group of women were raped in 1944 after their village was burnt down by the Japanese military. The house became a Japanese garrison in 1943 and the Japanese Imperial Army lived there for two years. According to a spokesperson of the "Lola's House", the "Lolas have decided to open up this house because it has become a symbol of violence that was done to women during the war." (Byun 1999: minute 6-7). So the documentary is obviously critical of Japanese imperialism, and not only regarding the relation between Korea and Japan.

The issues of history textbooks and monuments representing so-called "comfort women" are briefly covered in "My own breathing" when survivor Kim Soon-duk says during the dinner with the survivor's welfare committee: "(…) but we have not yet done anything. For example, putting our story on history textbooks or erecting a memorial statue for the victims. We have not done anything yet." (Byun 1999: minute 71-72).

4.2.3.2.6. Can the documentary eventually trigger political change and justice for survivors?

In "My own breathing", there is some emphasis put on the mortality of the already quite elderly former so-called "comfort women" and the resulting urgency to meet their demands for justice. Already the first scene shows a ceremony commemorating the former so-called "comfort women" who had already died. In another scene, the group visits the gravestone of a survivor in Gyeongsangnam province. And the timeline of events that is inserted as text towards the end of the documentary ends with: "As of July 1999, the number of registered survivors is 150." (Byun 1999: minute 69-70). This emphasis on urgency could possibly trigger some acceleration in political change.

At the end of the documentary, a dinner with the survivors and the survivors' welfare committee of the Korean Council is filmed, where the issue of mortality is made a topic again: "We have to make them pay before we die" (Byun 1999: minute 70-71). And at the end of this dinner scene, the women directly face the camera and say that they want apologies, reparations and punishments of the responsible perpetrators (Byun 1999: minute 72-74). Then, the very last scene of "My own breathing" depicts the funeral of survivor Kang Myo-ran and its preparations (Byun 1999: minute 74-76).

"My own breathing" also features the 356th Wednesday Demonstration at the end of the documentary and films meetings of NGOs and support groups, so the documentary is involved in activism for political change.

In "My own breathing", there is space for issues of both "retributive justice" (based on prosecution and punishment) and "restorative justice" (emphasizes processes of healing and reparation, see also 2.2.2). To give an example for "retributive justice", the survivors chant "Punish them! Punish them!" (Byun 1999: minute 69-70) when demonstrating in front of the Japanese embassy to demand an official apology and reparation ("restorative justice"), in the same way as is depicted in the first part of Byun's trilogy, "The Murmuring".

Another example for "restorative justice" is the very first scene of the documentary, in which survivor Lee Yong-su gives a speech in which she states: "we have nothing left to do but make the Japanese government apologize and pay reparation" (Byun 1999: minute 1-2).

4.2.3.2.7. Is the documentary a useful tool for the production of knowledge?

The documentary focuses on interviews with former so-called "comfort women" and therefore on testimonies of live witnesses, a fact which in and of itself makes it a useful tool for the production of knowledge. The unique style of the interviews, meaning that one survivor interviews another so that they feel understood and comfortable, provides the opportunity for more detailed questions. In consequence, the interviews offer new insights and perspectives on issues that have not been breached in the other documentaries.

"My own breathing" features interviews and testimonies of survivors that we have not yet seen in "The Murmuring" or "Habitual Sadness".

To give some examples, Kim Bun-seon tells the interviewing survivor Lee how she was hidden by Taiwanese people: "Once I hid myself in somebody's house (…) I went to a Taiwanese house. Yes, they hid me in, but I got caught and beaten." (Byun 1999: minute 15-16). Accounts of contacts of so-called "comfort women" and the civil society are rather rare.

The long interview with Shim Dal-yeon also offers deep insights and Shim Dal-yeon testifies in detail about the cruel treatment she received, to the point where she went insane and was so traumatised that she didn't even know her name anymore and is afraid of men to this day.

As with the first two parts of her trilogy, the intention of director Byun to make her audience deeply understand the suffering of the women is obvious with "My own breathing" too.

4.2.3.2.8. How does the documentary deal with the ethical dilemma of exploitation of its subjects?

In the expert interview, director Byun states: "I always hated directly asking the grandmothers myself to testify on their life in the "comfort stations". Therefore, in my "My own breathing", one grandmother asks another grandmother questions and they have conversations among themselves, so it is a historical documentary created by victims themselves."

This style of showing interviews with and testimonies of former so-called comfort women is very sensitive, because the interviewees feel well understood by the interviewer. I want to give an example of how the interviewing survivor, Lee Yong-su, helps to put the interviewees stories into a different perspective. Kim Bun-seon talks about her experience as so-called "comfort woman" in Taiwan: "I went to Taiwan, and there were shacks side by side (…). In line, there were swarms of soldiers in line, so many soldiers came in. (…) I tried not to serve the guests, the soldiers-", here Lee interrupts and tells her: "Don't say serve" (Byun 1999: minute 14-15).

Kim Yoon-shim says about talking to other survivors: "We feel the same since we are on the same page, so I could tell them all. All of us had been there and through the same ordeal. Now we can talk openly about what we kept to ourselves. Now we have nothing to hide from each other. That is what I like." (Byun 1999: minute 62-63).

4.2.3.2.9. Filming and narrative techniques: voice, voice-over, interviews, testimonies

In contrast to the first two parts of director Byun's trilogy, there is no voice-over in "My own breathing". Byun is audible in the voice-off. While Byun is also visible in quite a lot of scenes in "Habitual sadness", she never appears in "My own breathing".

Interestingly, apart from the long interview Byun conducts with survivor Kim Yoon-shim, she does not interview the women herself in "My own breathing", but lets a fellow survivor, Lee

Yong-su, conduct the interviews. Therefore, "My own breathing" is less interactive or participative then its prequels, and more observational. This sensitive way of making interviews lets the women tell their stories their own way and puts the emphasis on their testimonies.

The voices that the audience hears the most probably belong to the survivors Lee Yong-su, who interviews most of the other women, and Kim Yoon-shim, whose testimony fills a big part of the documentary. The interviewer and her voice take up minimal space in this instalment of Byun's trilogy. This interviewing style and the overall sensitivity of Byun's filmmaking give the women back their voices to tell their stories in their own ways.

In a similar manner to "The Murmuring" and "Habitual Sadness", the documentary is coherent and the interviews with the survivors add up to form a greater narrative, as described by Nam Soo-young in 3.2.2..

4.2.3.2.10. Support of the survivors' healing process

Regarding the question whether the production of the documentary could have supported the healing process of the survivors, I would like to stress again the key element in "My own breathing", the fact that the former so-called "comfort women" are interviewed by one another. This could have enabled them to feel as part of a community, and to see their own experiences in a broader historical context. The realization that they are not alone with their past as so-called "comfort women" might have helped to relieve them of the feeling of individual blame. The production in general and the interviewing style in particular could also have helped the women to bond with each other and form friendships.

To give another concrete example of how the filming might have helped a survivor, apparently Kim Yoon-shim realized only when her daughter is filmed that her children know a lot more about their mother's past than Kim has assumed. Kim Yoon-shim actually wrote about her experience as so-called "comfort woman" and even won a prize. She thought that her daughter had never read her book: "I didn't show it to her. I never kept it at home. She asked me to bring the book home, but I said no. The book isn't for her (…) She doesn't know what's in the book." (Byun 1999: minute 53-54). However, over the course of this scene, it turns out that her daughter actually has read the book while Kim was in the USA and in fact knows that Japanese soldiers kidnapped her mother. Kim first seems confused and angry upon realizing that her daughter knows her story in more detail than she had assumed, but then it appears as if Kim is actually happy and proud of her deaf-mute daughter for being interested in the book and finding out about it herself.

4.2.3.2.11. Connection to a broader feminist discourse on victim blaming and sexual violence

Yes, the documentary "My own breathing" draws a connection to a feminist discourse on victim blaming and sexual violence, although not as explicitly as in the prequel "Habitual Sadness".

"My own breathing" breaches issues such as the objectification of women (Kim Yoon-shim: "I was called number twenty one" (Byun 1999: minute 49-50) that are still very relevant today and topical in current feminist discourses.

The documentary has many examples of the long-term consequences for victims of sexual violence, their societies and even following generations. Survivor Kim Yoon-shim first thought she was infertile due to the violence she suffered as a so-called "comfort women", but years later, after she remarried, she had a daughter. However, because of syphilis she contracted in the so-

called “comfort station”, her daughter had cerebral palsy as a baby and is still deaf-mute. When she found out that the condition of her baby was connected to syphilis, she ran away out of fear that people, especially her husband, would find out about her past because of the baby’s condition. She explains: “I just didn’t have a heart to tell them that she had cerebral palsy due to my disease. What if my husband found out? Those days, if a woman had syphilis, she wasn’t human.” (Byun 1999: minute 52-53). Kim Yoon-shim’s testimony, and specially this last sentence show how much of a woman’s worth was connected to her reproductive abilities.

Byun directly touches the issue of victim blaming, when she asks Kim Yoon-shim why she felt ashamed or guilty, even though she is a victim (Byun 1999: minute 62-63). Kim replies: “Well, Koreans are really strange on that matter. Whoever it is, if I tell them what happened, I feel like many people would say ‘So what? Why did you bring that up now?’ (…) I feel like they would say that it is not something to be proud of and how could I tell such stories to young people shamelessly? That’s how I feel. So I didn’t want that. And one time, politicians like Kim Jong-pil[5] mentioned that it is of no use, raising such issues. He said like that. That’s what I had in mind since then. I just thought that people would complain”. Byun then asks her: “You know in Korea, sexual violence victims can’t report to the police because they feel ashamed. Is that something like that?” With this question, Byun directly connects the “comfort women” issue to today’s discourse on sexual violence. Kim answers “Exactly. It is”, to which Byun then replies: “But you all know, it is not right, if you are victims, you have every right to report without feeling ashamed (…) You know you have nothing to be ashamed of, because it is not your fault“. (Byun 1999: minutes 64-66)

Survivor Kim Yoon-shim also stresses: “But if you report it to the police, they won’t say that you did the right thing and that they won’t let him get away. If we give victims some encouragement like that, then victims wouldn’t feel afraid.” (Byun 1999: minute 67-68).

[5] Kim Jong-pil was a two-time South Korean prime minister. Under president Park Chung-hee, Kim Jong-pil was involved in brokering a deal in 1965 that established diplomatic ties between South Korea and Japan. The agreement meant free grants and cheap loans from Japan but fuelled protests in Korea, where people complained that a clear apology and sufficient reparations for the atrocities committed during the colonial period and the war were missing in the deal. (Choe 2018)

4.3. “Song of the Reed”

4.3.1. Background Information of the documentary

The documentary “Song of the Reed” (蘆葦之歌), directed by Taiwanese female director Wu Hsiu-ching, was released in 2015 and filmed between 2011 and 2013.

In the expert interview with director Wu, I asked her whether she had watched other documentaries on so-called “comfort women” before she started to make her own and what her opinion on them was. Wu replied: “I watched one, only one. Actually, I don’t like watching these kinds of documentaries first, because I don’t want to be influenced by them. I watched a Korean documentary; I don’t really remember… „The Murmuring“. I feel that the director emphasized the trauma itself.” (see expert Interview in 7.1.)

“Song of the Reed” is only the second Taiwanese documentary on so-called “comfort women” after “A Secret buried for 50 Years” that was released in 1998. Both documentaries were realized with the Taipei Women’s Rescue Foundation. The Taipei Women’s Rescue Foundation was founded in 1987 to prevent child prostitution and human trafficking and organizes workshops for victims of violence.

“Song of the Reed” won the “Best Anthropology Concern Award” at the International Gold Panda Awards for Documentary in Chengdu in 2014.

The documentary “Song of the reed” focuses on the participants of the drama therapy classes (see 2.3.1. Study with Taiwanese former so-called “comfort women”) and workshops for survivors held by the Taipei Women’s Rescue Foundation for 16 years until 2012, when they had to stop because the grandmothers were no longer healthy enough to participate. The author of the study, Hung Su-chen actually also appears in the documentary.

“Song of the Reed” starts with text, a written explanation that the first Taiwanese survivors stepped forward in 1992 and filed a lawsuit in Japan, which was dismissed in 2006 by the Japan’s Supreme Court.

The documentary revolves around the later years of survivors Chen Tao, Wu Hsiu-mei, Lin Sheng-chung, Chen Lian-hua, Lu Man-mei and Chen Yang, as well as their families. Huang A-Tao, who was the first of 58 Taiwanese survivors who came forward after the Tapei Women’s Rescue Foundation started to offer help and locate survivors in 1992, and was a main figure in the first Taiwanese documentary, “A Secret buried for 50 Years”, passed away at the beginning of the production of “Song of the Reed” in 2011 and therefore is seen mostly in photographs and older video clips. Lu Man-mei und Wu Hsiu-mei passed away during the filming process of the documentary, Chen Yang and Lin Sheng-chung shortly after that in 2013 and Chen Tao in 2016.

The documentary is shot all over Taiwan, in the hometowns of the survivors, in Taipei, where most of the workshops are held, in places the survivors travelled to as part of the workshops, but also in Japan. It follows the survivors to Tokyo, where they talk to Japanese politicians and visit the Women’s Active Museum on War and Peace that contains photographs of some of them and other former so-called “comfort women” they recognize. The visit leads to Chen Lian-hua agreeing to get her picture taken and put there too. “Song of the Reed” further includes the Japanese support group “Support Group for Taiwanese Survivors of Japan’s Military Sexual Slavery”, whose members regularly visit Taiwan.

“Song of the Reed” ends with the memorial service for survivor Wu Hsiu-mei, who passed away during the production of the documentary.

In addition to film, the documentary shows written explanations as text, photographs and older video clips of the workshops for the survivors.

4.3.2. Application of the analytical framework

4.3.2.1. Gender norms and socioeconomic power imbalances

The documentary broaches the issue of socioeconomic power imbalances and is critical of patriarchal gender norms. When talking about their past, the survivors illustrate that because of their gender and socioeconomic background, they had no power to control their fate.

Survivor Wu Hsiu-mei explains: "I was sold as a bride when I was nine. I never enjoyed the New Year. Only once did I eat with everyone else at the table, the night they sold me to my uncle. He lived in Pintung. We ate together when he bought me. That was the only time. (…) At 19, I got sold again, down south. Then the Japanese took me. That's what it was like back then." (Wu 2015: minute 3-4). Wu Hsiu-mei's phrasing, "I was sold, I got sold, they took me" reveals that she really had no agency, no say in what happened to her.

It becomes apparent in the documentary that the Taipei Women's Rescue Foundation helped them gain agency to redress their past or even start to open up about it and tell their stories, as Wu Hsiu-mei's grandson explains: "My grandpa could be bossy. (…) He could be domineering. Back when he was around, back in that era, if the Foundation sought her out, I'm sure she wouldn't have said anything. She definitely wouldn't have dared. That happened slowly, after grandpa was gone. (…) And the Foundation gave here some help. So she was willing, slowly, step by step, to speak out." (Wu 2015: minute 50-51). This notion could also imply that the survivor had not expected a lot of support from her husband if she stepped forward.

As for symbolic gender norms, "Song of the Reed" shows photos of the survivors dressed up in wedding dresses (Wu 2015: minute 24-25). After a screening of the documentary in Vienna, in a discussion about this controversial scene, director Wu pointed out that the survivors actually liked the idea of a wedding-photo-shoot when it was first proposed by the social workers and then really enjoyed the dresses and make-up. One could argue that the documentary could have been more reflective about the implication of showing such a symbolic gender norm in this context, especially considering that white wedding dresses symbolize virginity, which as a concept is very harmful from a feminist perspective because it further hurts and shames survivors of sexual violence. On the other hand, a scene like the one mentioned might be much more impressive when not explicitly explained and analysed. In our case, the scene led to discourse and reflection amongst the audience.

4.3.2.2 Stereotypical images, cultural inequalities and geo-political power imbalances

On the issue of cultural inequalities, the overall atmosphere in "Song of the Reed" seems very inclusive of cultures. For instance, the audience gets to hear many different languages: Mandarin, Taiwanese, Japanese and the indigenous language Ayatal, all of which are portrayed in a positive way.

The documentary makes Japanese imperialism a subject of discussion without reproducing stereotypes of either Taiwanese or Japanese culture. To give an example, survivor Wu Hsiu-mei recalls being called two different Japanese names; Matsuko and Kiyoko: "They gave them to me at the "station". The girls couldn't keep their own names, they gave us names" (Wu 2015: minute 5-6).

One of the survivors, Lin Sheng-chung (Iyang Apay in Ayatal language) is an aboriginal woman. This fact is stressed in the documentary, for instance when the audience first gets to know her and her story at the beginning of the documentary, she is shown in traditional

indigenous clothing, taking part in a dance (Wu 2015: minute 14-15). In scenes like that, it could easily happen that filmmakers resort to stereotypical representations of culture, so it is worth mentioning that director Wu employed a certain sensitivity in this context.

On the note of stereotypical images of so-called "comfort women" as "ideal victims", the documentary also challenges and contradicts the hegemonic image of them as "sweet little grandmas". For instance the fact is revealed that some of the survivors are heavy smokers, like Lu Man-mei in minute 26 – 27.

4.3.2.3. Awareness of hegemonic discourses on "comfort women"

"Song of the reed" challenges the dichotomy of the Japanese perpetuators on one side and only victims on the other side that often characterizes the discourse on the topic by showing examples of how the survivors were hurt by victim blaming by their own people, their own society, upon surviving Japan's military sexual slavery.

One example is survivor Chen Tao, who describes how her uncle mistreated her when she finally found home after returning: "When I saw him, I said, "Uncle, I've come home." Tears fell from my eyes. (…) He stood up and walked over. He threw my suitcase out. He threw it outdoors. And then he swore at me. Our family doesn't have cheap women like you." (Wu 2015: minute 9-10).

In the interview I conducted with director Wu, she said in reference to that scene: "70 years have passed, but why is she still remembering these things with her uncle? So yes, the Japanese did something bad to them, but how about their families, how about their society, how about their people? I feel, if you see a comfort woman, you just see „Japan" or these topics, but this is not enough. I want to remind all the people in Taiwan's society how we treated them.".

Survivor Lin Sheng-chung, too, was shamed by her neighbours: "Sometimes they would ask: How many men were there? How many times did you do it? Then I'd answer back: I'm not a loose woman. The Japanese ordered me to do it. I had no choice. Actually, they knew. If Japan gave a command, you had to do it. Slowly, after they learned the truth, they stopped saying bad things about us. That's how it was." (Wu 2015: minute 14-15)

Counsellor Hung Su-chen explains that victim blaming by their society also led to the survivors blaming themselves: "The whole social context they lived in was very conservative. So the idea of chastity was over-emphasized. Maybe they can adopt a new viewpoint, gain a new way of thinking, and forgive themselves: Actually, that wasn't my fault. It was due to the Japanese, or the war." (Wu 2015: minute 17-18).

Another scene that illustrates that the survivors in the documentary are aware of the hegemonic discourse is when survivor Wu Hsiu-mei, in a workshop, chose a Japanese soldier as someone she'd like to thank: "He said he wanted to move to Taiwan and marry me. (…) He was a client of mine. After I returned, I often thought of him. I missed him in my heart. I'm not supposed to say that." (Wu 2015: minute 17-18). Survivor Wu is aware that she is "not supposed to say that", that her response contradicts what is expected of an "ideal victim".

4.3.2.4. Inclusion and Exclusion

As mentioned above in 3.2.1.2, the overall atmosphere in "Song of the Reed" feels very inclusive; the documentary recorded the voices and opinions of people from different countries, ethnicities, genders and generations in different languages.

It is remarkable that Japanese support groups are included and are given an extensive amount of space in the documentary. The audience learns that members of the Japanese "Support Group for Taiwanese Survivors of Japan's Military Sexual Slavery" regularly visit Taiwan since the late 1990s and that one of them actually acted as pro bono attorney in the lawsuit against the Japanese government. Another member of said support group, Shiba Yoko, is seen taking part in many of the workshops and is interviewed multiple times in the documentary.

The inclusion of some of the family members of the survivors and interviews with them offers the perspectives of people from the younger generation, which leads to interesting insights. A good example for this is survivor Wu Hsiu-mei's grandson, who shares his observation of his grandparents relationship in the context of Wu's past as so-called "comfort women": "My grandpa could be bossy. (…). Back when he was around, back in that era, if the Foundation sought her out, I'm sure she wouldn't have said anything. She definitely wouldn't have dared. That happened slowly, after grandpa was gone. (Wu 2015: minute 50-51).

4.3.2.5. Global and historical implications of current political affairs

The documentary is attentive to political affairs connected to the issue, not only between Taiwan and Japan, but other affected countries as well. The documentary explains how the lawsuit filed against Japan resulted in the "Women's International War Crimes Tribunal on Japan's Military Sexual Slavery" in 2000 that included survivors from different countries (see 1.2.2.3).

The Japanese history textbook controversy is briefly covered. In Tokyo, the survivors speak to Fukushima Mizuho[6], then chair of the Social Democratic Party of Japan. Survivor Chen Tao stresses: "The Japanese government is devious, hiding the history of 60 years ago from young people. So the youth know nothing of the past. Hiding history: too sneaky." (Wu 2015: minutes 30-32).

Watanabe Suzume, a member of the "Support Group for Taiwanese Survivors of Japan's Military Sexual Slavery" refers to the history textbook controversy as well: "We have to tell this truth to posterity and inform the younger generation." (Wu 2015: minutes 37-39).

Another example of global and historical implications is the scene where the survivors are shown visiting the Women's Active Museum on War and Peace in Tokyo that contains photographs of some of them and other former so-called "comfort women" they recognize. From a picture, survivor Chen Lian-hua recognizes the face of another survivor, who was held at the same station in the Philippines, which leads to Chen Lian-hua agreeing to get her picture taken and put there too (Wu 2015: minutes 33-35).

4.3.2.6. Can the documentary eventually trigger political change and justice for survivors?

"Song of the Reed" documents the political activism of the survivors and support groups within Taiwan and Japan, possibly leading to more people becoming aware of the issue and joining their activism, thereby putting more pressure on the Japanese government. Shiba Yoko from the

[6] Fukushima Mizuho acted as chair of the Social Democratic Party of Japan from 2003 to 2013. She served as Minister of State for Consumer Affairs and Food Safety, Social Affairs, and Gender Equality from 2009 to 2010. The human rights lawyer published several books and topics like women's rights, family, marriage and domestic and sexual violence. (Fukushima 2016)

"Support Group for Taiwanese Survivors of Japan's Military Sexual Slavery" explains the goal of their activism: "Our goal is to get a law passed addressing the comfort women, to make the Japanese government apologize to these Korean, Philippian, Taiwanese, and all women, and to pay them compensation." (Wu 2015: minutes 39-30).

Through the documentary, the audience understands the urgency in the survivor's pursuit of justice, as it sees how more of them pass away. The documentary shows how the survivors travel to Tokyo to meet Fukushima Mizuho. When talking to her, survivor Chen Tao stresses the urgency of their cause: "Two of us old ladies died this year, and two last year. Two have passed away each year. Now only ten remain. So I hope the Japanese government will apologize soon." (Wu 2015: minutes 30-32), so does survivor Chen Lian-hua: "Everyone's so old and in bad health. I call on them to compensate us soon, or see how this can be resolved, so that those few of us still around don't have to think of this all the time." (Wu 2015: minutes 32-33).

Member of the "National Project for Redressing Japan's Military Sexual Slavery" Morita Toshiya also raises awareness for the urgency: "(…) in 2004, my friend's daughter visited the "House of sharing" in Korea. She met with some of the victims there. This teen told me earnest, if we don't apologize now for the crimes Japan committed, those who can forgive us will pass away. So Japan has to reflect on these crimes we've committed while these ladies are still alive." (Wu 2015: minutes 36-37).

As the examples above demonstrate, the emphasis in "Song of the reed" lies on "restorative justice" (based on processes of healing, apology and compensation, see also 2.2.2), rather than on "retributive justice" (based on prosecution and punishment).

In a lecture she gave in Vienna, director Wu explained that Taiwanese people gave up hope to convince the Japanese government to redress the issue after the lawsuit was finally lost in 2005, and that she hopes to raise awareness again with her documentary.

4.3.2.7. Is the documentary a useful tool for the production of knowledge?

On the question of whether "Song of the Reed" is a useful tool for the production of knowledge, the documentary is one of only two Taiwanese documentaries on so-called "comfort women", a fact which already means that it definitely serves as a source on detailed accounts of Taiwanese live witnesses.

"Song of the Reed" not only features testimonies of survivors on their experiences as so-called "comfort women", but also films their psychotherapeutic treatment and recovery process, and follows them to Japan, depicting their activism for justice and support from Japanese NGOs. The situations recreated in the workshops of the Taipei Women's Rescue Foundation help to explore aspects of the issue that "normal" documentaries, although focused on testimonies, probably wouldn't.

For example, in the workshop, the survivors were supposed to think of someone to thank, and survivor Wu Hsiu-mei chose a Japanese survivor and said: "After I returned, I often thought of him. I missed him in my heart. I'm not supposed to say that." (Wu 2015: minute 17-18), which is something that probably wouldn't be talked about in a "normal" setting of producing a documentary on an issue like that.

By emphasizing the recovery process rather than the traumatic past of the survivors and including the voices of psychological counsellors, the family members of so-called former "comfort women", and Japanese support groups, the documentary offers new perspectives on the issue.

4.3.2.8. How does the documentary deal with the ethical dilemma of exploitation of its subjects?

As for the issue of exploiting the subjects of a documentary, I directly addressed this question when I interviewed director Wu. She stressed that she wouldn't push the survivors to say things they didn't want to say: "I respect them. If they want to say something, I shoot something. But if they don't want to say anything, I'm not pushing."

As an example, director Wu mentioned that Chen Tao didn't want to be shot smoking at the beginning: "When we first shoot, she smoked, even though she is a heavy smoker, she was very angry. But yesterday you watched the short clip. She felt very peaceful smoking before me. So, that's the relationship: When she felt that I'm her friend, it was ok for her to show a negative part. That's why I feel, everything you can shoot, if they feel okay. This is very natural, this is okay. But don't bring up the negative things, I don't think it's fair to them."

"Song of the Reed" never treats the former so-called "comfort women" as victims, but as women with their own individual and multifaceted personalities. Watanabe Nobuo from the "Support Group for Taiwanese Survivors of Japan's Military Sexual Slavery" states the importance of this attitude: "If we don't purely treat these ladies as victims to be pitied, but view them as ordinary women, who want to live with dignity and beauty, if we use this angle to communicate, this might be a brand-new perspective for those who look at them only with sympathy." (Wu 2015: minutes 36-38).

There are many scenes in the documentary that show the survivors express emotions and sides of their personalities that don't necessarily fit the narrative of them as victims. To give some examples, they are shown exploring their creativity in the workshops (Wu 2015: minutes 15-17), having fun travelling, playing, taking photos, eating ice-cream (Wu 2015: minutes 20-22) and singing, even singing in Japanese (Wu 2015: minutes 20-23).

"Song of the Reed" also covers the Taipei Women's Rescue Foundation's endeavours to help the survivors fulfil their dreams, which further emphasizes the survivor's individual personalities and the forward-looking perspective of the documentary. The audience sees Wu Hsiu-mei become a flight attendant for one day, Lin Sheng-chung a postal courier, Lu Man-mei a police woman, Chen Lian-hua professionally record a song and Chen Tao giving a scarf she knitted herself to then president Ma Ying-jeo (Wu 2015: minutes 66-70).

4.3.2.9. Filming and narrative techniques: voice, voice-over, interviews, testimonies

While most of the documentaries analysed in this thesis employ the use of a voice-over, there is no voice-over in "Song of the reed".

The audience hears the voice of director Wu Hsiu-ching from the voice-off when she asks the survivors questions, but only in some of the interview scenes, which is an obvious difference to the other documentaries analysed in this paper, in which the interviewer's voice in the voice-off is more audible. Her voice, as well as the voices of the other interviewing women, like social workers and members of the Taipei Women's Recue Foundation, takes up minimal space in the documentary.

"Song of the reed" is a performative documentary according to Juel's classification of narrative strategies of documentaries (see 2.1.1.). That means filmmakers create events and situations to be filmed by their own interventions. However, it is not clear in "Song of the reed" if the situations are created for the production of the documentary or if they are part of the workshops of the Taipei Women's Rescue Foundation.

There is an emphasis placed on the testimonies of former so-called "comfort women", which add up to form a greater narrative. "Song of the Reed" gives women back their voices to tell their stories in their own ways. In the end, the voices that the audience hears the most when watching the documentary are the voices of the survivors, especially of Wu Hsiu-mei, Chen Tao, Lin Shen-chung and Chen Lian-hua, followed by those of social worker Yang Li-fang, counsellor Hung Su-chen and Shiba Yoko of the "Support Group for Taiwanese Survivors of Japan's Military Sexual Slavery".

4.3.2.10. Support of the survivors' healing process

The documentary puts the focus on the workshops and the healing process rather than on the traumatic past of the survivors. As already mentioned, "Song of the Reed" films the participants of drama therapy workshops organized by the Taipei Women's Rescue Foundation, so the healing process is the key point of the documentary. "Song of the Reed" shows and affirms what Hung Su-Chen wrote in her 2010 article, "Exploring the Recovery Process of Former Taiwanese Comfort Women through Drama Therapy.", so please also refer to 2.3.1., Study with Taiwanese former so-called "comfort women".

Through the workshops, the survivors became friends and according to the executive director of the Taipei Women's Rescue Foundation, Kang Shu-hua "gained a feeling of sisterhood (…), they gained support from their peers" (Wu 2015: minutes 45-47) and through travelling and filming the documentary, they became even closer.

Director Wu said at a lecture she gave in Vienna that the making of the documentary itself helped to accelerate the healing process. She gave an example concerning survivor Wu Hsiu-mei, who heard her grandchildren express their opinions on former so-called "comfort women" for the first time in front of her when they were interviewed for the documentary, and she drew courage from her grandson's words in the interview: "You were forced into it. We understand the situation at the time. We can read about it in a lot of books. Many nations had women forced into this. Should we support them today? I'm willing to give them my support." (Wu 2015: minute 50-51).

In the interview I conducted with director Wu, she gave another example: "Shen-Chung Ama, when I interviewed her son, I found she was very nervous about what her son will answer to my question. At that time, I understand that those Ama, they keep silence in their families, even though they all knew the Ama went to the workshop. In the documentary you see her grandson speak and the Ama also listened to her grandson saying something. The Ama felt very comforted."

4.3.2.11. Connection to a broader feminist discourse on victim blaming and sexual violence

When I asked director Wu in the expert interview about the connection to a broader feminist discourse in today's society, she replied: "Yes, yes, sex discrimination and every family likes sons better than daughters, like this kind of gender things still exist, but it's already better now than in the generation of Ama.", indicating that the situation is already a lot better now. So I don't think director Wu intended to directly draw a connection to current feminist discourses.

However, "Song of the reed" shows the long-term physical and psychological consequences for victims of sexual violence. For one thing, the issue of infertility is introduced, when survivor Wu Hsiu.mei's granddaughter explains: "She'd been force to be a 'Comfort

Woman', her uterus had problems. She had to have it removed. So she couldn't give birth. She couldn't bear descendants. Then when she married my grandpa, they adopted my mother. (…) The experience as a 'Comfort Woman' left both physical and mental scars." (Wu 2015: minute 6-7).

As for long-term mental consequences, the simple fact that the survivors are still in therapy at the very end of their lives shows the seriousness of their traumata.

Issues of victim blaming are also touched in the documentary, as the examples given in 4.3.1.3. show.

4.4. “The Apology”

4.4.1. Background Information of the documentary

The documentary “The Apology. (Before it’s too late)” was written and directed by Canadian female director Tiffany Hsiung and produced by Anita Lee for the National Film Board of Canada. “The Apology” was released in 2016, meaning that it is the most recent of the documentaries analysed in this paper.

Tiffany Hsiung worked on the documentary for nearly a decade. In 2012, she had released her first documentary on so-called “comfort women”, “Within every Woman”. “The Apology” shows footage filmed from 2011 to 2014.

“The Apology” won the Busan Cinephile Award at the Busan International Film Festival's Vision Awards and the Audience Award at the 2016 Cork Film Festival in 2016 (Lee 2016).

The documentary focuses on three former so-called “comfort women”: Gil Won-ok in South Korea, who has attended the weekly Wednesday Demonstration for years, “Grandma” Cao in China and “Grandma” Adela in the Philippines.

“The Apology” starts with text, saying: “Over 200, 000 women and girls were forced into sexual slavery by the Japanese Imperial Army during World War II across Asia. History refers to them as ‘comfort women’, but to many they are ‘the grandmothers’.” (Hsiung 2016: minutes 0-2). Throughout the documentary, the women are called Grandma Cao, Grandma Adela and Grandma Gil, and other survivors are also referred to as “Grandmas” or as “’Comfort Women’ survivors”. In the beginning of the documentary, the three “Grandmas” who are the main protagonists are introduced by showing their daily morning routine.

“The Apology” follows the daily lives and struggles of the three survivors and their families. Especially survivor Gil Won-ok, or Grandma Gil, is very involved in activism and the Korean Council for Women drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan. She lives in a home for former so-called “comfort women” that is run by the Korean Council. It is called “Our Peaceful House”. Grandma Gil protests in the Wednesday Demonstrations and travels to Japan, China, and even to Geneva in Switzerland to give speeches about her experience as so-called “comfort woman” and to fight for justice.

Grandma Cao still lives in the village in Yu Xian in County, China, where she was kidnapped in 1941. She has contact with author Zhang Shaun Bing, who published the book “Women in the comfort station” in 2011, for which he interviewed 122 survivors, Grandma Cao being one of them.

Grandma Adela lives in Roxas City on Panay Island in the Philippines and is a member of the Lola’s Kampaneras (Lola means grandmother and in the Philippines refers to former so-called “comfort women” in this context). She regrets not having told her late husband about her past and struggles with telling her family, especially her son Eric.

The second part of the documentary shows the process of an international petition to demand reparations for the survivors. They collect signatures to present to the Japanese and Korean government and the United Nations. This connects the three storylines in the three different countries, as they are shown working together collecting signatures.

In 2014, Grandma Gil accompanies the signatures to the United Nations Human Rights Council in Geneva. She gives a speech there and submits the signatures to the office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights.

In the last scene of the documentary, Grandma Gil is travelling back to Korea from Switzerland and eventually decides to stop travelling and fighting for justice to focus her remaining time on sleeping and eating.

Apart from filming, “The Apology” shows clips from television news about remarks on so-called “comfort women” by Japanese politicians and text as explanations, for example when they are not allowed to film inside the room of the chair of United Nations Human Rights Council.

4.4.2. Application of the analytical framework

4.4.2.1. Gender norms and socioeconomic power imbalances

The documentary is obviously critical of patriarchal gender norms, as for example Grandma Cao says: “I can’t read. I never went to school. Only boys were allowed to go, not girls. If they let us go to school then, I would be able to read. ” (Hsiung 2016: minute 36-37). The negative impact of her illiteracy is also illustrated: Because she has bad hearing, director Hsiung writes down her interview questions, only then it turns out that Cao cannot read.

Socioeconomic power imbalances are not as explicitly mentioned, but the living conditions especially of Grandma Cao, who lives on her own in a small, old room, are very humble.

In a manner that reminded me of “The Murmuring”, where the survivors illustrate that they had almost no power, agency or control over what happened to them during the war because of gender norms, poverty, illiteracy and so forth. With the advancement of awareness on the issue of so-called “comfort women”, they gained agency to fight for justice and historical visibility. To give an example, Grandma Adela reports: “I told my mother and we kept it to ourselves. Because at that time, it was really a great shame as a woman, to be raped. It’s only when I heard about Lola Rosa’s story, that she was one of the victims. And then they asked the victims to come out in the open and that was the time when I joined the Lola’s Kampaneras.” (Hsiung 2016: minutes 22-24.)

4.4.2.2 Stereotypical images, cultural inequalities and geopolitical power imbalances

Although the documentary is shot in five different countries (South Korea, China, the Philippines, Japan, and Switzerland), director Hsiung refrained from using stereotypical images of these countries and their people and cultures.

Regarding geopolitical power imbalances, “The Apology” is obviously critical of colonialism and there are many instances in which the hardships suffered by the local population after the Japanese invasion are mentioned. The three main protagonists in their three different countries all talk about painful memories they have regarding colonization. Grandma Cao also talks about other atrocities besides the “comfort women” system that she also witnessed during the Japanese invasion, like the killing of civilians, including women and elderly people in China (Hsiung 2016: minute 59-60).

It is not made explicit, but when watching the documentary it is clear that the situation of the women is worse in Mainland China compared to the other countries. This refers both to the general standard of living and to the advancement of activism for former so-called “comfort women”.

As for stereotypical images of former so-called “comfort women”, Hsiung doesn’t depict them as “sweet, little grandmas”, even though they are referred to as Grandmas throughout the documentary. For the three main protagonists, they all get to show their individual personalities

and are depicted as strong and independent women. To give an example, Li Gui-hua, the adoptive daughter of Grandma Cao says that her mother refused to live with them, because she doesn't want to bother anyone and insists on living independently. She even still chops wood, regardless of her old age (Hsiung 2016: minute 19-20). Grandma Cao is also seen smoking, which is another feature that might contradict the hegemonic image (Hsiung 2016: minute 39-40).

4.4.2.3. Awareness of hegemonic discourses on "comfort women"

In contrast to the other documentaries analysed in this thesis, "The Apology" also shows right-wing activists who counter-protest a demonstration in Tokyo that is attended by Grandma Gil. They insult the women, saying: "Go home, dirty old bitches! Get our, you shameless Korean hag. Fuck off, Korean whores!" (Hisung 2016: minute 4-5).

In another scene, members of the Japanese far-right party *zaitokukai* protest in front of the building where Grandma Gil gives her speech, which appears to be a Japanese university, saying: "Stop begging us for money using your lies. If you study, the facts will be revealed. The fact is that you're lying is already out in the open. Anti-Japan left-wingers, just get out already!" (Hsiung 2016: minute 28-29). Another protester adds: "If you think we're going to apologize for anything, you are wrong." (Hsiung 2016: minute 29-30).

On the discourse on how women ended up as so-called "comfort women", "The Apology" shows that not all of them were taken by physical force, such as Grandma Adela or Grandma Cao, who were kidnapped with three other girls (Hsiung 2016: minute 37-38). Other victims, however, were cheated and lured under false promises, like Grandma Gil who, as a 13-year-old, followed a man who offered her a job in a factory (Hsiung 2016: minute 28-29).

4.4.2.4. Inclusion and Exclusion

As for the issue of exclusion of women in historical writings, author Zhang Shaun Bing, who published a book on so-called "comfort women" in 2011, "Women in the comfort station", criticises: "There is no historical record about these female victims. If we resolve this, we can address the omission in history books." (Hsiung 2016: minute 17-18). He refers to Chinese former so-called "comfort women" and also says: "These Chinese survivors could not speak out. Nobody cared to listen." (Hsiung 2016 minute 16-17).

Compared to the other documentaries analysed in this thesis, "The Apology" is the most international and shot in five different countries, whereas the other five documentaries mainly concentrate on survivors in one country. Director of the Korean Council for Women drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan, Yoon Mee-hyan speaks at a Wednesday Demonstration and points out: "Survivors of the 'comfort women' system are not just Koreans. Philippines, Indonesia, Taiwan, China, North and South Korea. There are survivors from all across the Asia-Pacific region." (Hsiung 2016: minute 44-45).

Not only survivors and activists from different countries are visible in the documentary, but also people from different generations, and the family members of the survivors also get chances to speak.

4.4.2.5. Global and historical implications of current political affairs

The Apology is very attentive to current political affairs and their global and historical implications. There are clips from Korean television news of 2013 shown, about the remarks made by Osaka's mayor Hashimoto, who said that sex slaves were necessary during World War II (Hsiung 2016: minute 10-11).

As a consequence, Grandma Gil is interviewed by the Korean broadcasting channel YTN News and tells them: "I want the Japanese to speak the truth." (Hsiung 2016: minute 11-12). She eventually embarks on a trip through Japan to protest this offensive remark.

Later on in the documentary, we see the news again: Hashimoto refuses to take back his statement and is backed by other politicians (Hsiung 2016: minutes 29-31).

The documentary shows the 1000th Wednesday Demonstration in 2011, when the Korean Council also installs a Statue of Peace in front of the Japanese embassy (Hsiung 2016: minute 9-10). The bronze statue depicts a girl sitting on a chair with an empty chair next to her. Compared to the Wednesday Demonstrations that were film by Byun Yong-joo, the crowd that attends the Demonstrations shown in "The Apology" is huge.

The Japanese history textbook controversy is also covered in "The Apology". After Grandma Gil gave her speech at a Japanese women's university, a student says: "This issue is not covered in our textbooks, so I'm learning about this issue for the first time", to which Grandma Gil replies: "So what we need is history books to educate students, so that this doesn't happen in the future." (Hsiung 2016: minutes 32-34).

Another interesting political issue raised in "The Apology" is the unification of Korea. Grandma Gil was actually born in Hichun, Pyeonganbukdo, in North Korea. At the age of 13, she was deceived and ended up as a so-called "Comfort Woman" in Harbin, Manchuria, in the winter of 1940: "When I was 13 years old, I got separated from my family without a single word. When I got there, I was made into what they call a 'comfort woman'. I was kept there until liberation day when I was 18 years old." After the liberation she boarded a boat, falsely thinking it was going to Pyongyang in North Korea. Later the border was closed, so she was never able to go home or contact her family. (Hsiung 2016: minutes 67-69).

In 2014, Grandma Gil attended a conference in Shenyang, China organized by South Korean and North Korean women's groups. During the meeting, Grandma Gil gave another speech and talks about reunification and disarmament (Hsiung 2016: minutes 69-73).

4.4.2.6. Can the documentary eventually trigger political change and justice for survivors?

Rather than on the past, "The Apology" focuses on the present lives of the survivors, meaning their last years. Grandma Adela actually passed away before the documentary was finished and her funeral is shown in the documentary (Hsiung 2016: minutes 85-89). In China, too, they visit the funeral of survivor Zhang Caixiang (Hsiung 2016: minutes 16-19).

The oldest living survivor, Soon Dak, is also introduced in "The Apology". She lives together with Grandma Gil in "Our Peaceful House". She seems to have given up hoping to receive reparation: "They're never going to pay. If they were going to, they would have done it already." (Hsiung 2016: minute 46-47).

So the emphasis lies upon the urgency of their activism, and on healing in terms of opening up to their families. At the very beginning, there is a text saying: "Now in their 80s and 90s, they demand an official apology for the war crimes and for history to reveal the truth" (Hsiung 2016: minute 2-3).

In all of the three countries that the documentary focuses on, activists or support groups are introduced: The Korean Council for Women drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan that I have mentioned many times in this thesis already, the Lola's Kampaneras in the Philippines that are also demandinh compensation, and in China, author Zhang Shaun Bing who says: "As far as fighting for compensation from the Japanese, I feel responsible to continue this work." (Hisung 2016: minute 17-18). Zhang is also involved in collecting signatures for the petition, so he can be regarded as an activist too. It seems that the documentary production could have helped in connecting the different activists, and at the end the survivors and their family members sign the petition also in China and the Philippines (Hsiung 2016: 92-93).

The examples above, and also the title of the documentary, demonstrate that the emphasis in "The Apology" lies on "restorative justice" (based on processes of healing, apology and compensation, see also 2.2.2), rather than on "retributive justice" (based on prosecution and punishment).

4.4.2.7. Is the documentary a useful tool for the production of knowledge?

Yes, the documentary is a useful tool for the production of knowledge. It depicts the situation of former so-called "comfort women" in three different countries: South Korea, China and the Philippines. Although there are many documentaries on former so-called "comfort women" in South Korea, accounts of survivors in the Philippines and Mainland China are relatively rare, so this quite recent documentary is an important source.

"The Apology" not only features their testimonies, but also shows the international activism for so-called "comfort women". It also includes the backlash from right-wing groups in Japan, a rarity with documentaries on this issue.

The testimonies of the life witnesses actually show insight into historical issues besides the system of so-called "comfort women", for example as Grandma Cao talks about other atrocities committed by the Japanese during the invasion (Hsiung 2016: minute 59-60). The testimony of Grandma Cao also shines light upon an issue that is only rarely mentioned in the discourse: the fact that she became pregnant in the so-called "comfort station" and had to kill the baby (Hsiung 2016: minutes 60-63).

"The Apology" also shows the relicts of actual former so-called "comfort stations" in China (Hsiung 2016: minutes 60-63) and in the Philippines. I think the Dona Barray Garrison (Hsiung 2016: minutes 40-45) is the same building that is seen in Byun Young-joo's documentary "My own breathing".

4.4.2.8. How does the documentary deal with the ethical dilemma of exploitation of its subjects?

Generally, the Grandmas in "The Apology" are never treated as victims to be pitied, but are rather represented as strong individuals. The interviewees are never pushed to say anything, or pressured to give more details when testifying. They seem quite comfortable when talking to Tiffany Hsiung about their past or their present worries.

Especially with Grandma Cao in China and Grandma Adela in the Philippines, I got the feeling that director Hsiung has established a trusting relationship with her subjects. She is also seen in front of the camera when talking with them (see example in 4.4.1.9.). When interviewing Grandma Gil in Korea, I didn't get that feeling so much, which might be connected to the language situation: director Hsiung speaks Chinese and obviously English, but not Korean.

There is one example that shows how subjects might immediately benefit from filmmaking: because Grandma Cao has bad hearing, it's difficult for Tiffany Hsiung to interview her, and a written interview is also not possible because she never learned to read. So director Hsiung and Cao's daughter decide to get her a hearing aid. Grandma Cao then seems really happy to be able to hear again and is seen joking around with director Hsiung (Hsiung 2016: minutes 57-59).

4.4.2.9. Filming and narrative techniques: voice, voice-over, interviews, testimonies

There is no voice-over in the "The Apology", but actually, the text that is inserted often throughout the documentary acts like an explanatory voice-over to give authority to the narrative.

The voice of director Tiffany Hsiung is audible from the voice-off, and in multiple scenes she is also visible in front of the camera. "The Apology" is an interactive documentary, and at the end of the film, after the closing credits, Grandma Cao is seen using the camera to film Hsiung (Hsiung 2016: minute 104-105).

Still, the interviewer's voice takes up almost no space and all interviewees (survivors, activists, family members) are given space to tell their stories their own ways. The voice that the audience hears the most is the voice of Grandma Gil, who is interviewed and gives speeches and her testimony all over Japan, in Korea and China, as well as in front of the United Nations in Geneva.

The emphasis is on the testimonies, which add up to form a greater narrative. Another focus is put on the connection of activists all around Asia.

I realized that the filming style in "The Apology" is very "close" compared to the other documentaries analysed in this thesis, meaning that the documentary features many close-ups of faces. This could also be related to the simple fact that it is a newer film and has a better quality overall, but it could also be a deliberate decision by director Hsiung to make the audience better understand the emotions of the people filmed.

4.4.2.10. Support of the survivors' healing process

I think that especially the fact that through the production of the documentary, the survivors had the opportunity to open up and tell more about their past to their families, might have supported their healing process. In the beginning of the documentary, Grandma Adela explains that her mother was the only one who knew what happened (Hsiung 2016: minute 43-44) and that her current living family doesn't know that she is actually a former so-called "comfort woman". They think she is only helping the Lola's Kampaneras. She regrets not having told her late husband and says: "If I can tell my children all about it, I would be very happy. If they will accept what I was and what happened to me." (Hsiung 2016: minute 25-26).

Together with the film crew, Grandma Adela travels to her son Eric's home to tell him her story (Hsiung 2016: minutes 80-82). Afterwards, she feels a lot better: "My spirits have been lifted, I feel 10 kilos lighter." (Hsiung 2016: minute 82-83).

In the case of Grandma Cao, her adoptive daughter Li Gui-hua has not known many details about her story, especially that she had given birth before but had to kill the baby (see example given below). Author Zhang shows Li his book and lets her read her mother's story and tells Li about the international petition to the Japanese government for an official apology. Cao and her daughter then sign together and both seem happy to have become a little closer after Li

learned more about her mother's past. (Hsiung 2016: minutes 89-91)

Another important aspect in this regard is that the production of "The Apology" seems to have helped to connect the survivors in the different countries. Tiffany Hsiung records and shows video messages and the Lola's Kampaneras in the Philippines watch the footage of the 1000th Wednesday Demonstration in Seoul on the computer. Via video message, Grandma Gil tells them: "Even though I don't know your names, be strong, live long so we can all meet in Korea. If possible, come to Korea as soon as you can." (Hsiung 2016: minutes 82-83).

The women in the Philippines also record a video message in reply, saying that they want to go to Korea (Hsiung 2016: minutes 83-84). A photograph of Grandma Adela is shown at another demonstration in Seoul and it is explained that they have planned to invite her to visit Korea, but before they could do that, they found out that she had passed away (Hsiung 2016: minutes 84-86).

4.4.2.11. Connection to a broader feminist discourse on victim blaming and sexual violence

There is an explicit connection to a broader feminist discourse, especially regarding sexual violence in times of war and victim shaming. Yoon Mee-hyan, director of the Korean Council, states about the petition: "And not just for 'comfort women' victims, to restore their human rights, but for all the victims of wartime sexual violence." (Hsiung 2016: minute 92-93).

Grandma Adela talks a lot about the shame she feels and that she was afraid to tell her husband about her past, out of fear that he might leave her: "They would be ashamed of me. (…) Not even my husband, until he died. That's why I repent now, because I did not tell him. Because I was afraid to lose him. I feel guilty. I feel guilty all about it." (Hsiung 2016: minute 24-25) and: "If I told everything, it might've caused trouble or separation, or a broken home, so I thought I'd better keep it." (Hsiung 2016: minutes 77-79).

Grandma Adela actually experienced negative consequences after telling the truth. She reports: "It's very shameful to be a victim. That's the attitude in Roxas, in the Philippines (…) Before they invited you to (…) a Christmas party (…) But these two years, I think they did not invite me now. Maybe they have read the article…that was published." (Hsiung 2016: minutes 54-56).

As in most of the documentaries analysed in this thesis, the long-term consequences for victims of sexual violence, especially infertility, are talked about in "The Apology". Grandma Cao und Grandma Gil both adopted their children.

In the case of Grandma Gil, she got a disease at the so-called "comfort station" and had surgeries. (Hsiung 2016: minutes 26-28). She never married, saying: "I couldn't get married, but not by choice. Because I'm not intact, not whole." She then explains how she lived with three other women and eventually adopted her son: "We made soup and delivered it to a woman who just gave birth. The others knew this woman had decided to give up the baby, but I didn't know. It was hard enough to support myself, so I said no, it won't be possible. But they just left the baby with me (…) so I raised him (…). Someone else's child became my responsibility." (Hsiung 2016: minutes 47-52).

In the case of Grandma Cao, she gave birth before, but had to kill her baby: "I had to strangle the baby. It was conceived at the comfort station. When the baby died, it impacted me deeply. I was impregnated by the Japanese soldiers. (…) I had the baby on my way home. I had to throw it away. I was damaged so badly, I would never bear any more children." (Hsiung 2016: minutes 60-63). She adopted her daughter only when she was 53 years old (Hsiung 2016: minute 38-39).

5. Conclusio

Between the release of the oldest documentary analysed in this paper, “Senso Daughters” (1989) and the most recent one, “The Apology” (2016), almost three decades had passed and this significant time gap is to be noted when comparing the documentaries, because research on and awareness of the injustice suffered by former so-called “comfort women” has expanded as well as institutional advocacy for the survivors.

The earlier documentaries on the topic, “Senso Daughters” and Byun Young-joo’s trilogy “The Murmuring”, “Habitual Sadness” and “My own breathing”, needed to raise awareness and educate the audience, while “Song of the Reed” and “The Apology” had to stress the urgency of the issue, as the now older survivors are gradually passing away, even during the process of making the documentary. “Habitual Sadness” and “My own breathing” also featured the funerals of survivors who passed away during their productions.

In the more recent documentary films by directors Wu and Hsiung, we see references to people and places we learned about in the older ones by directors Sekiguchi and Byun: Historian Senda Kako, who appeared in “Senso daughters” as an interviewee of director Sekiguchi, is cited before the closing credits of “Habitual Sadness” (see 4.2.2.).

Member of the “Support Group for Taiwanese Survivors of Japan’s Military Sexual Slavery” Shiba Yoko for example recalls a lecture from Yun Jung Ok, who is shown in “The Murmuring” speaking about the historical background of so-called “comfort women”: “In the early 90s, Professor Yun Jung Ok from Korea delivered a lecture in Japan. The subject of the lecture was a survey of Comfort Women from Hokkaido to Okinawa. Only after I went to the lecture did I realize that Comfort Women existed. (…) But Prof. Yun told us Comfort Women really existed and they’re still living quietly. After that, several groups were founded in Japan to learn about Comfort Women. We are one of those groups. That’s where my understanding and concern for Comfort Women began.” (Wu 2015: minutes 28-30). Morita Toshiya from the “National Project for Redressing Japan’s Military Sexual Slavery” refers to the “House of sharing” shown in “The Murmuring”, when he explains that “in 2004, my friend’s daughter visited the “House of sharing” in Korea. She met with some of the victims there.” (Wu 2015: minute 36-37) It’s even possible that his friend’s daughter met with the survivors portrayed in “The Murmuring”.

And the Dona Barray Garrison in the Philippines we see in “The Apology”, which became a Japanese garrison in 1943, was shown in detail in “My own breathing”, when Korean survivor Lee Yong-su visits the “Lola’s House” in the Philippines (Byun 1999: minute 6-7 and Hsiung 2016: minutes 40-45)

There are a lot of similarities in the documentaries. All, except maybe “Senso Daughters”, focus on a small group of three to six survivors and their pursuit of recovery and justice. While “The Murmuring” and “The Apology” concentrate more on the activism for justice, “Habitual Sadness“ and “Song of the Reed” put the emphasis on the personal healing process itself

In addition to the testimonies of the survivors, most of the documentaries include the voices of supporters as well as experts. As for support groups and activists, we see the Korean Council for the Women Drafted for Military Sexual Slavery by Japan in Byun’s trilogy as well as in “The Apology”, we see the Japanese “Support Group for Taiwanese Survivors of Japan’s Military Sexual Slavery” in “Song of the Reed”, and we meet the Lola’s Kampaneras in “The Apology”, although it is possible that members of the Lola’s Kampaneras are also visible in the scenes shot in the Philippines in “My own breathing”.

As for experts, historian Senda Kako is interviewed in “Senso Daughters”. Expert on the history of so-called “comfort women” Yun Jung-ok is interviewed in “The Murmuring”, and psychology scholar Hung Su-Chen is interviewed in “Song of the Reed”.

All six documentaries show written explanations as text in addition to film and "Senso Daughters", "The Murmuring", and "Song of the Reed" also show photographs taken during the war.

All of the documentaries analysed in this paper challenge the "sweet little grandma"-image prevalent in the hegemonic discourse on so-called "comfort women". All three parts of Byun Young-joo's trilogy and "Song of the Reed" tell stories of how survivors were hurt by their own society on top of the Japanese perpetrators, challenging also the black-and-white-thinking predominant in the discourse.

Most of the documentaries are to some extent attentive to current political affairs and shine light upon problems such as the Japanese history textbook controversy, in comparison, "Senso Daughters", "The Murmuring" and "The Apology" focus more attention on global geo-politics, for example by criticising the Japanese colonialist attitude or connecting the "comfort women" issue to the United Nations Security Council and the Human Rights Council. Although "Song of the Reed" includes an important scene involving an actual Japanese politician, Fukushima Mizuho, "Song of the Reed" and "Habitual Sadness" put more emphasis on the daily lives and the healing processes of the survivors.

Because the documentaries not only light up several issues connected to the discourse on so-called "comfort women", but also document the activism, demonstrations, assemblies and hearings of the survivors and support groups and their interaction with politicians, the documentaries could help in triggering political change by raising awareness of the urgency of the issue.

In the theoretical part of my thesis I explained that in the context of sexual violence, the term "justice" can mean "retributive justice" (justice based on prosecution and punishment), or "restorative justice" (justice that emphasizes processes of healing). Of course, the two notions of justice in this context exist in a continuum, also in the documentaries. Generally though, the documentaries analysed in this thesis focus more on elements of "restorative justice": truth and reconciliation, compensation and reparation, healing and recovery.

In "Senso Daughters", "The Murmuring", "Song of the Reed" and "The Apology", there is criticism of women's exclusion from historical records, meaning that all of the four directors included this issue in their work. In a similar manner, five of the six documentaries analysed have references to the history textbook issue and demand that so-called "comfort women" are included in Japanese history textbooks. Only in "Habitual Sadness" this is not so much of an issue. In comparison, "Habitual Sadness" is the least political of the six documentaries analysed.

All of the documentaries are critical of patriarchal gender norms and that girls had little access to education, which was a relevant factor why they could be easily deceived and ended up as so-called "comfort women". Access to education is made a topic especially in "The Murmuring", "Habitual Sadness" and "The Apology".

As sources of multiple detailed accounts of live witnesses from Japan, Papua New Guinea, Korea, Taiwan, China and the Philippines, the documentaries are all useful tools for the production of knowledge on so-called "comfort women".

None of the documentaries treat the former so-called "comfort women" as victims to be pitied, but rather as women with their own individual and multifaceted personalities. They all get to show multiple sides of their personalities, not only those that fit the main narrative. "Song of the Reed" employs the most forward-looking, future-looking perspective by emphasizing the present and future of the survivors over what they had endured in the past. As Hung's study with Taiwanese former so-called "comfort women" explained in 2.3.1., the actual production of "Song of the Reed" might indeed have helped in the healing process of the survivors.

In conclusion, although the documentaries analysed and compared in this paper originated in four different countries and were produced in three different decades and emphasize different aspects of the issue, all of them qualify as "feminist documentaries" according to the analytical framework applied. Without exception, all six documentaries I analysed for my thesis can be integrated in a broader feminist discourse as they all connect the issue of so-called "comfort women" to other forms of conflict-related sexual violence. The documentaries show the severe long-term physical and psychological consequences for victims of sexual violence.

An issue that is not reserved for situations of armed conflict is the issue of victim blaming, victim shaming and "ideal victims". In all of the six documentaries, we can see multiple testimonies of how the survivors were shamed when telling their surroundings about the crimes they suffered, sometimes even by their closest relatives. In consequence, many of them kept their horrible experiences to themselves for decades.

6. List of references and secondary literature

6.1. Literature

Ahn, Shin-kweon (2007) "The House of Sharing – A Report on *Namun-ui jib*" In: Drinck, Barbara; Gross, Chung-Noh (ed.) (2007): "Forced Prostitution in Times of War and Peace." Bielefeld: Kleine Verlag, 315-320.

Amnesty International (2005) "Japan: Still waiting for justice after 60 years – justice for survivors of Japan's military sexual slavery system." *Amnesty International* (October 27, 2005) https://www.amnesty.org/download/Documents/84000/asa220122005en.pdf (last accessed on September 15, 2018)

Amnesty International (2016) "Japan- Submission to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women." *Amnesty International* (January 2016) https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CEDAW/Shared%20Documents/JPN/INT_CEDAW_NGO_JPN_22855_E.pdf (last accessed on September 15, 2018)

Asian Women Human Rights Council (1998) "War Crimes on Asian Women." Manila: Paperchase Printing Services.

Banwell, Stacy (2015) "Globalisation masculinities, empire building and forced prostitution: a critical analysis of the gendered impact of the neoliberal economic agenda in post-invasion/occupation Iraq". In: Third World Quarterly, Vol. 36, No. 4, 2015. Routledge: 705-722.

Bastick, Megan, Grimm, Karin and Kunz, Rahel (2007) "Sexual Violence in Armed Conflict." Geneva: SRO Kundig.

BBC (2017) "San Francisco accepts 'comfort women' statue", *BBC News* (November 23, 2017) https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-42092477 (last accessed on September 11, 2018)

BBC (2018) "Oxfam Haiti allegations: How the scandal unfolded", *BBC News* (February 21, 2018) https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-43112200 (last accessed on September 6, 2018)

Berry, Chris; Lu Xinyu; and Rofel, Lisa (ed.) (2010) "The New Chinese Documentary Film Movement. For the public record." Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.

Bershen, Wanda (2010) "A Question of Ethics: The Relationship between Filmmaker and Subject", *international documentary association* (September 30, 2010) https://www.documentary.org/feature/question-ethics-relationship-between-filmmaker-and-subject (last accessed on November 9, 2017)

CEDAW (Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women) (2009) "Concluding observations of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women", *United Nations Human Rights* https://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/cedaw/docs/co/CEDAW.C.JPN.CO.6.pdf (last accessed on September 2, 2018)

Choe, Sang-Hun (2018) “Kim Jong-pil, Political Kingmaker in South Korea, Dies at 92”, *The New York Times* (June 23, 2018) https://www.nytimes.com/2018/06/23/obituaries/kim-jong-pil-south-korea.html (last accessed on October 21, 2018)

Cotton, Ann; Farley, Melissa; and Baron, Robert (2002) “Attitude towards prostitution and acceptance of rape myths”. In: Journal of Applied Social Psychology, Vol.32, No. 9, 2002. 1790-1796.

Davenport, Kiana (2001) “Gesang der verlorenen Frauen.” München: Deutscher Taschenbuch Verlag.

Dewey, Susan; St. Germain, Tonia (ed.) (2012) “Conflict-Related Sexual Violence.” Virginia: Kumarian Press.

Drinck, Barbara; Gross, Chung-Noh (ed.) (2007) “Forced Prostitution in Times of War and Peace.” Bielefeld: Kleine Verlag.

EIGE European Institute for Gender Equality (2018) “gender norms”, *European Institute for Gender Equality* https://eige.europa.eu/rdc/thesaurus/terms/1194 (last accessed on December 20, 2018)

Fisher, Barry A. (2007) “Japan’s Wartime Sexual Slavery and the Courts: Coordinating Legal Strategies” In: Drinck, Barbara; Gross, Chung-Noh (ed.) (2007): “Forced Prostitution in Times of War and Peace.” Bielefeld: Kleine Verlag, 278-287.

Fukushima, Mizuho (2016) “Profile”, *Fukushima Mizuho campaign page* http://www.mizuhoto.org/profile/ (last accessed on December 7, 2017)

Hayashi Hirofumi (2007) “Japanese Imperial Government Involvement in the military “Comfort Women” System.” In: Drinck, Barbara; Gross, Chung-Noh (ed.) (2007): “Forced Prostitution in Times of War and Peace.” Bielefeld: Kleine Verlag, 145-155.

Hauser, Christine (2018) “‘It Is Not Coming Down’: San Francisco Defends ‘Comfort Women’ Statue as Japan Protests”, *The New York Times* (October 4, 2018) https://www.nytimes.com/2018/10/04/us/osaka-sf-comfort-women-statue.html (last accessed on October 13, 2018)

Hennefeld, Maggie (2018) “Feminist Filmmaking and the Future of Global Film Politics.” In: Cultural Critique, Volume 99, Spring 2018. Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press, 194-216.

Hou, Elaine and Lee Yu-cheng (2016) “Taiwan's first 'comfort women' museum opens after decade of effort”, *Focus Taiwan* (December 10, 2016) http://focustaiwan.tw/news/asoc/201612100009.aspx (last accessed on November 29, 2017)

Hsu, Stacy (2018) “MOFA stands by ‘comfort women’”, *Taipei Times* (August 18, 2018) http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/front/archives/2018/08/16/2003698600 (last accessed on September 11, 2018)

Hung, Su-Chen (2010) “Exploring the Recovery Process of Former Taiwanese Comfort Women through Drama Therapy.” In: Asian Centre for Women’s Studies, AJWS Vol 16 No. 2. Seoul: Ewha Womans University Press, 60 – 83.

Icarus Films (2018) “Senso Daughters”, *Icarus Films* http://icarusfilms.com/if-sens (last accessed on September 11, 2018)

Juel, Henrik (2006) “Defining Documentary Film”, In: p.o.v. A Danish Journal of Film Studies, Vol. 22, December 2006, 5-14. https://pov.imv.au.dk/pdf/pov22.pdf (last accessed on October 3, 2018)

Kim, Dong-Choon (2010) “The Long Road Toward Truth and Reconciliation.” In: Critical Asian Studies, Vol. 42, No. 4, 2010. Routledge, 525-552.

Kim, Dong-Choon (2010) “Korea’s Movement to Settle the Issues of the Past and Peace in East Asia.” In: Korea Journal, Vol. 50, No. 4, 2010, 152-185.

Kim, Jonwoo Jeremy (2014) “Filming the Queerness of Comfort Women: Byun Young-Joo’s *The Murmuring* , 1995.” In: positions: east asia cultures critique, Volume 22, Number 1, Winter 2014. Durham: Duke University Press, 7-39.

Kim, Yoon-ok (2007) “ The 2000 Tokyo War Tribunal – the Trial and its Rulings” In: Drinck, Barbara; Gross, Chung-Noh (ed.) (2007): “Forced Prostitution in Times of War and Peace.” Bielefeld: Kleine Verlag, 261-277.

Kirby, Paul (2012) “How is Rape a Weapon of War? Feminist International Relations, Modes of Critical Explanation and the Study of Wartime Sexual Violence.” In: European Journal of International Relations, Vol. 19, No. 4, 2012. 797–821.

Koos, Carlo (2017) “Sexual violence in armed conflicts: research progress and remaining gaps.” In: Third World Quarterly, Vol. 38, No.9, 2017. Routledge, 1935-1951.

Koreanische Frauengruppe in Deutschland (ed.) (1996) “In die Prostitution gezwungen. Koreanische Frauen erinnern sich. Zeugenaussagen aus dem japanischen Asien-Pazifik-Krieg.” Osnabrück: secolo Verlag.

Kubo, Angela and Adelstein, Jake (2015) “'Gesture of healing': South Korea and Japan reconcile on World War II sex slaves”, *Los Angeles Times* (December 28, 2015) http://www.latimes.com/world/asia/la-fg-korean-sex-slaves-20151228-story.html (last accessed on September 5, 2017)

Kyodo (2016) “NGO that runs ‘comfort women’ museum receives bomb threat”, *The Japan Times* (October 31, 2016) https://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2016/10/31/national/crime-legal/group-running-tokyo-comfort-women-museum-reveals-got-bomb-threat/#.WcKgWUpJaAw (last accessed on September 20, 2017)

Lee Hyo-won (2016) “Busan: Vision Awards Go to South Korean Indie Filmmakers”, *The Hollywood Reporter* (October 14, 2016) https://www.hollywoodreporter.com/news/busan-vision-awards-go-south-938318 (last accessed on October 25, 2017)

Lin, Liang-sheng and Hsiao, Sherry (2018) “Comfort women belong in transitional justice act: Ma”, *Taipei Times* (September 4, 2018) http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/taiwan/archives/2018/09/04/2003699767

Lipinsky, Astrid (2016) “Asiatischer Feminismus. Feminismen in Theorie und Praxis in China und Taiwan.” In: Frauensolidarität 135 1/16. Wien: Frauensolidarität, 18-19.

Moser, Maria Katharina (2007) “Von Opfern reden. Ein feministisch-ethischer Zugang.” Königsstein/Taunus: Ulrike Helmer Verlag.

Muta, Kazue (2016) “The ‘comfort women’ issue and the embedded culture of sexual violence in contemporary Japan.” In: Current Sociology, Vol.64(4), July 2016, 620-636.

Nam, Soo-Young (2001) “Recounting ‘History’: Documentary as Women’s Cinema.” In: Asian Centre for Women’s Studies, AJWS Vol 7 No. 1. Seoul: Ewha Womans University Press, 80 – 110.

Nishino, Rumiko (2007) “The Japanese Citizens’ Movement against Nationalism and Gender Issues in their Work using the example of “Comfort Women.” In: Drinck, Barbara; Gross, Chung-Noh (ed.) (2007): “Forced Prostitution in Times of War and Peace.” Bielefeld: Kleine Verlag, 156-167.

Okano, Yayo (2012) “慰安婦問題解決へ向けて――ソウルにおける１０００回目の水曜抗議集会と日本の非妥協性” In: The Asia-Pacific Journal Japan Focus, Volume 10, Issue 50, Number 2 (December 9, 2012) http://apjjf.org/data/okano.j_.text.pdf (last accessed on November 15, 2017)

Olivieri, Domitilla (2012) “Haunted by reality. Toward a feminist study of documentary film: indexicality, vision and the artifice.” Utrecht: All Print.

Panda, Ankit (2017) “The 'Final and Irreversible' 2015 Japan-South Korea Comfort Women Deal Unravels”, *The Diplomat* (January 9, 2017) http://thediplomat.com/2017/01/the-final-and-irreversible-2015-japan-south-korea-comfort-women-deal-unravels/ (last accessed on September 8, 2017)

Pohl, Rolf (2012) “Die Zerstörung der Frau als Subjekt. Macht und Sexualität als Antriebskräfte männlicher Vergewaltigungsstrategien im Krieg.” In: Gender Initiativkolleg (ed.): “Gewalt und Handlungsmacht. Queer_Feministische Perspektiven.” Frankfurt: Campus Verlag, 113–124.

Randall, Melanie (2010) “Sexual Assault Law, Credibility, and "Ideal Victims": Consent, Resistance, and Victim Blaming.”, in: Canadian Journal of Women and the Law, Volume 22, Number 2, 2010. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 397-434. https://muse-jhu-edu.uaccess.univie.ac.at/article/409075/pdf (last accessed on November 26, 2017)

Rechenberger, Daniela (2007) “The “Comfort Women” Issue: On the Treatment of a Japanese War Crime in the Japanese Mass Media.” In: Drinck, Barbara; Gross, Chung-Noh (ed.) (2007): “Forced Prostitution in Times of War and Peace.” Bielefeld: Kleine Verlag, 168-180.

Reynaud, Bérénice (2010) “Translating the Unspeakable: On-screen and Off-screen Voices in Wu Wengguang’s Documentary Work” in: Berry, Chris, Lu Xinyu and Rofel, Lisa (ed.) “The New Chinese Documentary Film Movement. For the public record.” Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 157-176.

Ronin Films (2018) “Yuka Sekiguchi.”, *Ronin Films* (2018) https://www.roninfilms.com.au/person/286/yuka-sekiguchi.html (last accessed on September 17, 2018)

Sajor, Indai Lourdes (1995) “Rape as a war crime: A continuing injustice” in: Schuler, Margaret A. (ed.) “From basic needs to basic rights.” Washington, D.C. : Women, Law and Development International, 507-514.

Sala, Ilaria Maria (2017) “Why Is the Plight of ‘Comfort Women’ Still So Controversial?”, *The New York Times* (August 14, 2017) https://www.nytimes.com/2017/08/14/opinion/comfort-women-japan-south-korea.html?mcubz=3 (last accessed on September 20, 2017)

South China Morning Post (2017) “South Korea plans ‘comfort women’ museum as old war wounds with Japan struggle to heal”, *South China Morning Post* (July 10, 2017) http://www.scmp.com/news/asia/east-asia/article/2101996/south-korea-plans-comfort-women-museum-old-war-wounds-japan (last accessed on September 20, 2017)

Suh, Jae-Jung (2010) “Truth and Reconciliation in South Korea.” In: Critical Asian Studies, Vol. 42, No. 4, 2010. Routledge, 503-524.

Taipei Women’s Rescue Foundation (2017): “The brave Ones and Their Rainbows.” Taipei: Ama Museum.

Terre des Femmes (2001): “Zwangsprostitution von Frauen in bewaffneten Konflikten : Kriegsverbrechen und Menschenrechtsverletzung - Dokumentation der Fachtagung am 15.03.2001.” Bonn: Terre des Femmes.

UN General Assembly (2006) “In-depth Study on all Forms of Violence against Women”, Report of the Secretary General (July 6, 2006) https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N06/419/74/PDF/N0641974.pdf?OpenElement (last accessed on September 2, 2018)

UN News Centre (2016) “Voices of survivors must be heard, UN chief says after meeting ‘comfort women’ victim”, *UN News Centre* (March 11, 2016) http://www.un.org/apps/news/story.asp?NewsID=53428#.WcI5F0pJaAw (last accessed on September 20, 2017)

Wang, Yiman (2005) “The Amateur's Lightning Rod: DV Documentary in Postsocialist China.” In: Film Quarterly, Vol. 58 No. 4, Summer 2005. Oakland: University of California Press, 16-26.

Woods Masalski, Kathleen (2001) “Examining the Japanese History Textbook Controversies” In: Japan Digest, November 2001. Bloomington: Indiana University. http://spice.fsi.stanford.edu/sites/default/files/textbook.pdf (last accessed on November 28, 2017)

Yamazaki Tomoko (2005) “Sandakan Bordell Nr.8. Ein verdrängtes Kapitel japanische Frauengeschichte.” München: Iudicium Verlag.

Yoshioka Aiko (1997) “Analysing Representations of the comfort women issue.” Adelaide: University of Adelaide.

6.2. Documentaries

"A Secret Buried for 50 Years – The Story of Taiwanese "Comfort Women", directed by Yang Jia-yun (1998; Taipei: Taipei Women's Rescue Foundation, Shengchi Media, 1998), DVD.

"Senso Daughters", directed by Sekiguchi Yuka (1989; New York: First Run Icarus Films, 1990), VHS.

"Song of the Reed", directed by Wu Hsiu-ching (2015; Taipei: Taipei Women's Rescue Foundation, Shengchi Media, 2015), DVD.

"The Apology. Before it's too late", directed by Tiffany Hsiung (2016; New York: Icarus Films, 2017), DVD

"The Murmuring", directed by Byun Young-Joo (1995; Seoul: The Association of Korean Independent Film and Video, 2006), DVD.

"The Murmuring Trilogy DVD Digipak Limited Edition", directed by Byun Young-Joo (1995, 1997, 1999; Seoul: Plain Archive, 2017), 3 DVDs.

7. Expert Interviews

7.1. Interview with Director Wu

Interviewer: Did you watch other documentaries on comfort women before you started making your own? And if so, which ones? And what was your opinion about them?

Wu: I watched one, only one. Actually, I don't like watching these kinds of documentaries first, because I don't want to be influenced by them. I watched a Korean documentary, I don't really remember… „The Murmuring". I feel that the director emphasized the trauma itself.

Interviewer: Did you interact with the director or with other directors?

Wu: No, no.

Interviewer: My next question regards the title, „Song of the reed". You mentioned a little bit about the reed and what it symbolizes. There is a bible quote with reed at the very end of the documentary. Did you first had the bible quote or first -

Wu: Yes, yes. The quote was in the beginning. One day in the morning when I prayed and suddenly the bible words, the quote came to my mind. And I also know god is using this point of view seeing the Ama. I realized although they are suffering so much and like reeds, god sends many angels to support them. This documentary is about how they overcome and how this support group, the Taiwanese support group, the Japanese support group, how they cooperate and accompany the Ama. So, this was at the beginning, I got the words.

Interviewer: And what about the „song"? Why is it not „story of the reed"?

Wu: I feel the song, what is very interesting about the song, when you are singing in a valley, actually you already stopped, but the song, because of the echo, will repeat and repeat the singing around the valley. This is why I feel I wanted to make it the title, the „song of the reed".

Interviewer: You mentioned that the filming itself may be seen as part of the healing process. And you gave the example of Hsiu-Mei Ama, that she wouldn't talk, but when you filmed the family, she stepped forward. Do you have another example of filming as a healing process?

Wu: Shen-Chung Ama, when I interviewed her son, I found she was very nervous about what her son will answer to my question. At that time, I understand that those Ama, they keep silence in their families, even though they all knew the Ama went to the workshop. In the documentary you see her grandson speak and the Ama also listened to her grandson saying something. The Ama felt very comforted. This is the other example. But Shen-Chung changed, I think, because she went to church. Her action influenced her grandson and granddaughter. Three of her daughters, after Ama passed away, they became Christian.

Interviewer: Now a little bit about the process of filming, so I guess you filmed all over Taiwan, because the workshops were in Taipei, but then some of the Ama lived in Kaohsiung and Pingtung. So, where exactly were all the location where you filmed and travelled?

Wu: Every time they decided a place to take Ama to travel and the laoshi (teacher of workshop) also went there. Because it is inside, you can't see the outside, but a lot of the places were not in Taipei.

Interviewer: There are aboriginal Ama, and ones who speak Taiwanese, and ones who speak Mandarin and some even speak Japanese. Do you speak all of those languages? Was the communication difficult? How did you feel about the language situation?

Wu: The language between them I feel is very interesting. When it's like, Shen-Chung going to be baptized, I recorded Lian-hua and her daughter congratulating Shen-Chung in Mandarin. Actually, Lian-hua speaks Taiwanese. She can speak a little bit Mandarin, but Shen-Chung listens Mandarin. I tried to make a brigade and make them communicate. So I said: „Ama, Shen-chung will be baptized. Can you say something?". And she said: „Ok, but I need to say it in Mandarin, otherwise she can't understand." I said „Ok, let's practice." That's why she needed a lot of practice, because she speaks Taiwanese.

Interviewer: Regarding the Japanese language, do they feel like the Japanese language symbolizes the perpetrator in this case or is it just a normal language that they also speak with the support group? Is there a negative image of the Japanese language?

Wu: No, no, not at all. They think it's very normal. Because Taiwan's culture is influenced by Japan a lot. So a lot of people speak Japanese and we like to go to Japan to travel. So that's why when you speak Japanese in Taiwan, it's very normal.

Interviewer: Because for example in South Korea it's not really -

Wu: Yeah, they hate Japanese, I know. But no, they don't in Taiwan.

Interviewer: The workshop ended in 2012. Was it because too many of them passed away or was then just the ending of the workshop?

Wu: No, because TWRF decided that even when there are only two Ama, they want to still keep doing the workshops, but when Shen-Chung became sick, she got cancer, and Xiao Tao also, her health is not good, so… You can't just have only one and have a workshop. That's why the end was in 2012.

Interviewer: For the last session, did they have a special ending?

Wu: No, you never know… You know, when Shen-Chung was baptized, three weeks after that, she was sick.

Interviewer: So we could say that the baptism and how they communicated and gave their congratulations was kind of the closure or the ending?

Wu: No…this, and…Hsiu-mei Ama also was sick and passed away. So it was very, very fast. So they don't know why it was so soon. They couldn't do anything.

Interviewer: I guess that was very hard for the support group and the foundation…that they wanted to do more workshops, but they couldn't, because they passed away so quickly.

Wu: Yes, yes.

Interviewer: Chris Berry mentioned that there might be an ethical dilemma for the directors of documentaries. You don't want to exploit the emotions if you film their suffering, but at the same time, you need to show emotions to touch the audience. Chris Berry praised you for framing them as survivors rather than as victims and having this future-looking, forward-looking perspective. Did you have those considerations in mind when you made the film?

Wu: Do you mean, when I show this film, do I have this contradiction?

Interviewer: Yes, did you think about this contradiction?

Wu: Yes, sure, sure. But I noticed that if they want to say something, that's okay. So I mean, I respect them. If they want to say something, I shoot something. But if they don't want to say anything, I'm not pushing.

Interviewer: A question regarding this image of the former so-called comfort women as the "sweet little grandmas", which is not real, because they might be heavy smokers and drinkers for example and this might also be a little contradicting. Did you actively try to change this image, this „sweet little grandma"-image? Because yesterday you mentioned for example that Xiao Tao, she didn't want to be filmed smoking so much. How did you feel about this image? Did you want to create a new image?

Wu: When we first shoot, she smoked, even though she is a heavy smoker, she was very angry. But yesterday you watched the short clip. She felt very peaceful smoking before me. So, that's the relationship: When she felt that I'm her friend, it was ok for her to show a negative part. That's why I feel, everything you can shoot, if they feel okay. This is very natural, this is okay. But don't bring up the negative things, I don't think it's fair to them.

Interviewer: For the paper that I'm writing, I want to re-frame the issue as more of a gender issue, that it's male violence on women. What I really liked about your documentary is that we have a lot of scenes in which the Ama talk about the injustices they suffered by their own people, for example by their family members. There is this very heart-breaking scene in which Xiao Tao talks about how her uncle threw her out. How do you feel does the discourse around so-called comfort women fit in with the feminist discourse on victim shaming, on rape culture, on patriarchy, on male violence on women, on sexual violence?

Wu: Yes, because I want that people in Taiwan, especially in Taiwan, when they watch this documentary, think about themselves. Because, like Xiao Tao, she is already 92 years old. 70 years have passed, but why is she still remembering these things with her uncle? So yes, the Japanese did something bad to them, but how about their families, how about their society, how about their people? I feel, if you see a comfort woman, you just see „Japan" or these topics, but this is not enough. I want to remind all the people in Taiwan's society how we treated them. This is very important.

Interviewer: Do you think this also starts a discourse on the problems that we have today in society, like rape and male violence on women?

Wu: Yes, yes, sex discrimination and every family likes sons better than daughters, like this kind of gender things still exist, but it's already better now than in the generation of Ama.

Interviewer: So you're also hoping that with the documentary you can get people to think about the situation today?

Wu: Yes, yes.

Interviewer: Taiwan, Japan and now you're here: Did you go to other countries as well?

Wu: You mean to show this film?

Interviewer: Yes, or something like we did here?

Wu: I also went to Hong Kong and they were very moved, touched by this film. Because at the same time, a Chinese director also showed another documentary about China's comfort women and they felt very sorry, because the Chinese government didn't respect them. The director said: „Taiwan and China all had comfort women, but Taiwan was like heaven and they like hell. Heaven and hell, a lot of difference." Because Taiwan has NGOs to treat Ama, like this kind of documentary, workshops to heal them. But China, they don't have these kinds of things. And I also went to Germany, Heidelberg. And a lot of the Chinese female students cried a lot. They cried a lot, because they were just moved by the documentary. And they said that if China had this kind of workshop, their Ama would be better.

Interviewer: Generally, how was the perception different in the countries? How was it different in Taiwan to Japan to Hongkong to Germany and here? The questions the audience asked you for example or generally the reaction of the people to your documentary?

Wu: The Chinese I think didn't have a lot of experience about this kind of workshop. They were asking me: „The teacher is professional?", „Why they push Ama so hard that Ama cry?". I said: „No, no, you don't know, this is just the healing process." When they ask questions, you can see their society, how they see healing. I thought of this kind of feeling.

Interviewer: And how was it here? How did you feel about the reactions in Austria, in Vienna?

Wu: A lot of your teachers, professors, I feel like they were moved a lot. I feel very happy about it. Actually, I thought that the language is so complicated and I was not sure if the audience here can understand. But since on Friday they did, now, I feel it's good and they can understand Ama.

Interviewer: And on sunday as well, there were people crying, in our class as well.

Wu: Really? Sunday? Who?

Interviewer: A lot of the girls, and I cried even though I've seen it five times already.

Wu: Which part made you cry?

Interviewer: When they cry, I also cry. And especially Xiao Tao, when she talks about her uncle and then she talks about her grandma. It's very moving. And a lot of the other girls told me the same, they've seen it three times already and they still cry.

Wu: I know, the audience in Tainan, one of the woman in the audience, she said she never had this kind of experience in the theatre. Everybody cried. She said she was already in a healing process. I think I picked up the workshop, the healing part, because: whom do you want to thank? Who do you want to remember? What were your happy years like? Those questions that the teacher (of workshop) read, I think are everyone's questions. Everyone has them. Everyone has one person you want to say thank you to him or her. So I feel, not just for comfort women, not just for those Ama, because they were in a classroom and we shot, I sort of duplicated the healing process to the audience. So when you watch the movie, you cry. This was experimental. Actually, when you do these kinds of things, you don't want someone to shoot you. But it was very special, because in the workshop they forgot everything. They were like kindergarten students; they just followed laoshi (teacher of workshop). This was kind of a miracle.

Interviewer: Was it also hard for you yourself? Did you get sad as well when you worked so much with this sad topic? How did you personally handle your emotions? Did you also cry, for example?

Wu: I cried a lot. Every time I watch the film, I cry, every time. Every time at a different part. When I was in Hong Kong, I felt that I've already done it enough, but I didn't think that when Lian-hua sings the song, I'd cry. Because the song talks about herself. You're alone in another country, you feel lonely, those kind of things. So…I don't know, every time I see the film, I cry.

Interviewer: Even though you made it yourself?

Wu: Yes, yes, every time. So that's why some parts, I don't want to see again. But I miss them a lot.

Interviewer: Now that they pass away, and it doesn't really look like the Japanese government is going to give an apology in time, do you, with your documentary, have any other goals? Do you have anything in mind? For example, you mentioned that you'd like to see that in Mainland China the Ama receive a better treatment. Are you advocating for this as well?

Wu: I feel that if some other country invites me, I will go. Not just to tell them about Taiwan's former comfort women, no, but just to share this story, for them. Like you, you say that you and your classmates, you cried a lot. And I think it's a healing process. Everyone has his or her own story.

Interviewer: I think they say that crying actually relieves stress, it makes you calmer.

Wu: Yes, it relieves. Great, when you write the paper you should mail it to me.

Interviewer: Of course! Thank you so much!

7.2. Interview with director Byun

Interviewer: „the Murmuring“ won two awards in Japan and Korea in the 90s (Shinsuke Ogawa Award at the Yamagata International Documentary Film Festival in 1995, and the Korean Film Critics Special Award in 1996). It would be interesting to know a) how many/ which other competitions did you submit the documentary to? and b) what is the ranking of the awards?

‘낮은 목소리’가 1990 년대 일본과 한국에서 총 두 차례 수상을 했습니다. 이와 관련하여
1)다른 영화제에 작품을 제출하셨다면 어떤 영화제에 몇 차례정도 제출하셨는지
2)수상하신 상의 순위가 어느정도 되는지 궁금합니다.

Byun: The Murmuring 즉 낮은 목소리는 1995 년에 완성되어 1995 년 4 월 서울을 중심으로 극장에서 상영되었습니다. 1995 년 yamagata international documentary film festival 에서 ogawa shinsuke prize 를 받았고 그 상은 일본의 유명한 다큐멘타리 감독을 기리기 위해 제정된 상으로 아시아 신인 감독상에 해당합니다. 낮은목소리는 1996 년 일본에서 전국적으로 상영되었고, 관람한 관객 수는 정확히 집계되지 않았지만, 일본 전역의 도시에서 상영 되었습니다. 그리고 낮은 목소리와 그 다음 작품인 낮은 목소리 2(habitual sadness) 가 동시에 1998 년 베를린 국제 영화제 영 포름 부분에 출품 되었습니다.
낮은목소리는 그 외에 뉴욕의 인권영화제를 비롯해서 몬트리올 영화제등 북미와 유럽의 영화제에 초청되었습니다.

Production of “the Murmuring” was completed in 1995 and was screened in theatres mostly in Seoul in April 1995. In 1995 it won the Ogawa Shinsuke Prize at the Yamagata International Documentary Film Festival. This price was established to praise famous Japanese documentary directors and corresponds to an Asian Newcomer Award. In 1996, “the Murmuring” was shown nationwide in Japan, and although the number of people who watched it was not exactly counted, it was screened in cities across the whole country. And then in 1998, “the Murmuring” together with its sequel, “habitual sadness” were screened together at the Berlin International Film Festival. Additionally, “the Murmuring” got invited to the New York Human Rights Film Festival as well as the Montreal Film Festival and other North American and European film festivals.

Interviewer: Did you watch other documentaries on comfort women? And if so, which ones? And what was your opinion about them?

위안부에 관한 다른 다큐멘터리를 보신 적이 있는지요? 보셨다면, 어떤 작품을 보셨는지, 그리고 그 작품들을 어떻게 생각하시는지 궁금합니다.

Byun: 본 적은 없습니다.

No, I have not watched any.

Interviewer: Did you interact with other directors?

‘낮은 목소리’ 촬영을 준비하면서 위안부 문제를 다루는 다른 감독들과도 교류하셨습니까?

Byun: 교류한 적은 없습니다. 다만 낮은 목소리는 16mm 필름으로 만들어진 영화고, 당시에 모든 기자재를 일본의 다큐멘타리 감독의 프로덕션에서 지원 받았습니다.

No, I have never interacted with any. However, “the Murmuring” was produced as a 16mm film, and at the time, I received all of the equipment from Japanese documentary directors as support.

Interviewer: The filming itself may be seen as part of the healing process for the survivors. Do you have an example of filming as a healing process?

위안부 생존자분들께는 촬영 그 자체가 치유의 과정으로 느껴질 수 있을 것 같습니다. 촬영이 치유의 한 과정으로서 의의를 가졌던 예를 들어주실 수 있을까요?

Byun: 아래에 질문 하신 것과도 겹치는 부분이 있을 것 같습니다만, 전체적인 설명을 하는 것이 필요할 것 같아서 여기에 함께 답하겠습니다. 낮은목소리는 1992 년 아주 우연한 기회에 기획되었습니다. 자원봉사를 하는 친구를 만나기 위해 “나눔의 집”에 가게 되었고, 할머니들과 인사를 나누는 과정에서 제가 영화감독인 것을 아시고는 당장 이곳에서 나가라라고 말씀 하셨습니다. 50 여년을 자신의 상처를 숨기고 살았던 여성들이 용기를 가지고 세상에 자신의 존재를 밝혔지만, 일본정부는 사과하지 않았고, 많은 기자들과 예술인들이 그녀들을 대상으로 무엇인가를 만들었지만 그 결과를 나누지도 않았기 때문에 피해의식이 깊은 상태였습니다. 그곳을 나와 집으로 돌아오며 이 영화를 만들겠다고 생각한 것입니다. 즉, 저는 일본군 위안부 피해 여성들의 당시의 피해 사실에 대해 관심을 가진 것이 아니라, 스스로를 숨기고 살아온 여성들이 세상에 자기 자신을 드러냈을 때 삶이 어떻게 변화하는가를 영화로 만들고 싶었던 것입니다.
그래서, 1994 년 1 월까지 2 년여간 할머니들의 집을 매일 방문하고 친구가 되려고 애썼고, 어떤 촬영도 하지 않았습니다. 그리고 1994 년부터 할머니들을 촬영하기 시작하였습니다. 그리고 1995 년 완성하였고, 서울의 작은 극장 세 곳에서 영화를 한달 간 상영하였습니다. 할머니들은 매일 극장에 나와 관객과 만나셨고, 아마도 그 과정이 할머니들에게 치유의 과정이 되었다고 생각합니다. 스스로를 한번도 좋아해 본 적이 없던 여성들이 자신이 출연한 작품을 본 관객들이 “당신을 좋아한다”라고 말하는 것이 너무 즐겁고 힐링이 되는 과정이었을 것입니다. 1996 년 일본에서 이 영화는 상영되었고, 일본 상영장 근처의 숙소에서 할머니들이 저에게 또 한편의 영화를 만들자고 직접 제안을 하셨습니다. 전 하고싶지 않았습니다. 너무 힘들었으니까요. 그때 낮은목소리 마지막 씬 송년회 장면에서 술을 마시고 취해 노래를 부르던 강덕경 할머니가 폐암 말기 판정을 받으시고, 저에게 자신이 6 개월밖에 못사니까 자신이 죽을때까지를 찍어달라고 부탁을 하셨습니다. 그래서 시작된 작품이 낮은목소리 2 (habitual sadness)입니다. 이 작품은 점점 죽어가는 한 할머니와 그리고 낮은목소리라는 작품 이후 국민들의 후원으로 경기도 광주의 조용한 시골마을에 집을 마련하여 농사를 짓고 닭을 키우며 살게 된 다른 할머니들의 농촌 생활을 다룬 다큐멘타리입니다.

그리고 1999 년 저는 돌아가신 할머니들과 여전히 세상과 싸우는 할머니들을 다룬 마지막 다큐멘타리 숨결(my own breathing)을 만들게 됩니다. 숨결의 핵심은 하나 였습니다. 저는 제가 직접 "할머니 할머니의 위안소 생활을 증언해주세요"라고 묻는 것이 언제나 싫었습니다. 그래서 숨결은 피해자인 할머니가 다른 피해자인 할머니들에게 묻고 이야기를 나누는, 피해자 스스로 만들어보는 역사 다큐멘타리의 형식입니다.

There seems to be an overlap with the questions below, but I think it is necessary to give a full explanation, so I will answer it here. I started to plan on filming "the Murmuring" in 1992 after a very casual incident: I went to the "House of Sharing" to meet a friend who volunteered there. While greeting the grandmothers, as soon as they realized I was a director, I was told to leave. The women lived 50 years hiding their wounds and then had the courage to show the world that they existed, but the Japanese government did not apologize. Many reporters and artist created something about these women, but because they never shared the consequences, the grandmothers were left with a deep sense of victimization.
When I got home from there I thought that I would make that film. In other words, what interested me was not the fact that they were victims that were greatly harmed by the Japanese military as "comfort women", but I wanted to make a film about how their lives changed when they stepped forward after a living with a secret for so long.
So, until January 1994, I went to their home every day for two years and tried to become their friend. During that time I did not take any shots. Eventually, in 1994, I started to film the grandmothers. Then in 1995, it was completed and first screened for one month in three small theatres in Seoul. The grandmothers came to the theatre every day to meet with the audience. I think this probably was a healing process for them. It was a healing process and enjoyable for the women, who never liked themselves, when the audience, after seeing their appearances in the documentary, told them: "I like you".
In 1996, the documentary was screened in Japan, and in the accommodation close to where we screened it in Japan, the grandmothers personally proposed to me to make another documentary. I did not want to. It was too hard. At that time, grandmother Kang Duckyeong, who is seen dancing drunk in the last scene of "the Murmuring", the scene of the year-closing party, asked me to film her life until the end, because she had late-stage lung cancer and only six months left to live. So we started to produce "habitual sadness". This is another documentary work that deals with one grandmother who is slowly dying, and also other grandmothers, who, with national support they got after "the Murmuring", could build a farm in a quiet rural village in Gwangju, Gyeonggi province, and live a rural life there farming and raising chickens.
Finally in 1999, I created another final documentary, "My own breathing", about grandmothers who have died and grandmothers who were still fighting in this world. There was one main key element in "My own breathing". I always hated directly asking the grandmothers myself to testify on their life in the "comfort stations". Therefore, in my "My own breathing", one grandmother asks another grandmother questions and they have conversations among themselves, so it is a historical documentary created by victims themselves.

Interviewer: You filmed both in Seoul and Wuhan, China. Was the communication in China difficult? How did you feel about the language situation?

서울과 중국 우한 두 도시에서 촬영을 하셨는데, 중국에서 의사소통이 어려우셨습니까? 중국에서의 의사소통과 관련하여 어떤 감정을 느끼셨는지요?

Byun: 저는 이미 촬영 전 그곳을 몇차례 다녀왔고, 그곳에서 현지 코디네이터와 통역자를 섭외한 상태였습니다. 문제는 없었습니다.

I had already been there a few times before shooting, and we worked together with local coordinators and interpreters. There were no problems.

Interviewer: Regarding the Japanese language, do they feel that the Japanese language symbolizes the perpetrator in this case or is it just a normal language? Is there a negative image of the Japanese language?

일본어에 관한 질문을 드리겠습니다. 다큐멘터리에서 일본어는 가해자를 상징하는지, 아니면 그저 일상적인 언어인지 궁금합니다. 극중 일본어는 부정적인 이미지를 가지고 있는 것인가요?

Byun: 부정적인 의미는 아닙니다.

No, there is no negative meaning regarding Japanese language.

Interviewer: There might be an ethical dilemma for the directors of documentaries. You don't want to exploit the emotions if you film their suffering, but at the same time, you need to show emotions to touch the audience. Did you have those considerations in mind when you made the film?

다큐멘터리 감독님들은 윤리적 딜레마를 느끼실 수도 있을 것 같습니다. 피해자의 고통을 잘 담아내어 관객들을 감동시켜야 하지만 동시에 피해자의 감정을 착취하고 싶지는 않기 때문이겠지요. 다큐멘터리 촬영시 이런 문제들에 대해 고민하셨는지요?

Byun: 기다리는 것. 할머니들이 준비가 되어 스스로 무언가를 하고 싶을 때까지 기다리는 것. 그외에는 방법이 없다고 생각합니다.

It's about waiting. It's about waiting for the grandmothers to be ready to express themselves in their own terms. I think there is no other way than waiting.

Interviewer: Regarding the image of the former so-called comfort women as "sweet little grandmas", I would like to ask you if you actively tried to change this image? For example by showing some of the survivors smoking and drinking, which might be seen as contradicting with the „sweet little grandma"- image. Generally, how did you feel about this image? Did you aim to create a new image?

담배와 술을 즐기는 할머니들의 모습을 보여줌으로써 위안부 할머니들이 가진 소위 '연약하고 가련한 할머니' 이미지를 바꾸려는 적극적인 노력을 하신 것인가요? 위안부 할머니들이 가진 이미지에 대해 어떻게 생각하시는지요? 새로운 이미지를 만들어내고자 하셨나요?

Byun: 그것이 그녀들의 일상이니까요. 순결한 피해자 여성으로 포장하는 것이야말로 죄악이라고 생각했습니다.

This is their daily life. I thought it would be the very worst thing to do to tell their story while packing them up as “pure female victims”.

Interviewer: How do you feel does the discourse around so-called comfort women fit in with the feminist discourse on victim shaming, on rape culture, on patriarchy, on male violence on women, on sexual violence?

위안부 문제가 피해자 탓하기, 강간 문화, 가부장제, 여성에 대한 폭력, 성폭력 등에 관한 페미니스트 담론 속 어떤 위치를 차지한다고 생각하십니까?

Byun: 바로 그 부분이 핵심이죠. 중요한 것은 한국의 가부장적인 문화가 그녀들로 하여금 오랜 시간 입을 다물고 있게 만든 것이니까요. 전 그녀들이 피해자일 뿐 아니라, 전쟁에서의 성폭력에 반대하는 가장 중요한 페미니스트 운동가들이라고 생각합니다.

That’s the core point! Because the important thing is that the Korean patriarchal culture has kept these women silent for such a long time. I think these women are not only victims, but the most important feminist activists fighting against sexual violence in wars.

Interviewer: Do you think it can also starts a discourse on the problems that we have today in society, like rape and male violence on women? Are you hoping that with the documentary you can get people to think about the situation today?

‘낮은 목소리’가 성폭행이나 여성을 대상으로 한 폭력과 같은 사회문제에 관한 담론의 시발점이 될 수 있을 것이라 생각하시는지요? ‘낮은 목소리’를 통해 사람들이 이런 문제들에 대해 생각해 볼 기회를 가질 수 있기를 바라십니까?

Byun: 전쟁과 여성, 그리고 여전히 일상에서 지속되는 성폭력에 대해 사회가 보다 더 올바라지기를 바라는 마음이 큽니다.

I strongly hope that society will care more about war and women, and also about the sexual violence prevailing in our everyday life.

Interviewer: Did you travel to multiple countries to show the documentary? How was the perception different in different countries? The questions the audience asked you for example, or generally the reaction of the people to your documentary?

다큐멘터리 상영을 위해 다양한 나라를 방문하셨나요? 각 나라에서 ‘낮은 목소리’를 어떻게 받아들였나요? 관객의 질문이나 반응에 차이가 있었다면 어떤 점이였는지 궁금합니다.

Byun: 다양했고, 좋았습니다.
제가 가장 좋아했고 아직도 기억하는 관객의 반응을 적는 것으로 대신할까 합니다. 일본의 어느 작은 소도시에서 상영을 했고, 서울로 돌아왔을 때 일본어로 된 편지가 한통 도착했습니다. 일본어 통역자를 통해 그 편지를 읽어보니 내용이 이랬습니다. "저는 15살에 성폭력을 당하고 난 후, 학교도 가지 않았고 아무도 만나지 않았고, 집에만 있었습니다. 어느날 어머니가 강제로 낮은목소리를 상영하는 극장에 데리고 갔습니다. 영화를보았고 집으로 돌아와 편지를 씁니다. 저도 할머니들처럼 이제 사람들도 만나고, 웃고, 이야기하고 세상을 살아가겠습니다."라는 내용이었습니다. 저는 이 편지를 읽었을 때의 그 순간을 지금도 기억하고 있고, 그녀에게 그리고 할머니들에게 그리고 이 작품을 만들기로 한 나 자신에게 참 감사했습니다. 이 편지가 내가 이 영화를 만들며 목표했던 전부였을지도 모릅니다.

It was varied, and good. I'll tell you about the reaction that I liked the most and still remember. When I came back to Seoul after screening the documentary in some very small Japanese city, I received a letter from Japan. A Japanese translator translated the letter and the content I read was like this: "After I was sexually abused at the age of 15, I did not go to school, did not meet anyone and stayed only at home. One day, my mother forced me to go the theatre where "the Murmuring" was screened. I watched the documentary and went back home to write this letter. Now I will also, like the grandmothers, meet people, laugh, talk and live my life." That was the letter's content. Until now I remember the moment when I read this letter. I felt really grateful towards the girl, and the grandmothers, and to myself for making this documentary. This letter probably was the exact aim I had when making this documentary.

Interviewer: Did you get sad when you worked so much with this sad topic? How did you personally handle your emotions?

'낮은 목소리'는 상당히 슬픈 주제를 다루고 있는데 이 주제를 계속 다루면서 복받치는 감정은 어떻게 다스리셨습니까?

Byun: …. 술?

…Alcohol?

Interviewer: Now that the survivors pass away, and it doesn't really look like the Japanese government is going to give an apology in time, do you, with your documentary, have any other goals? Do you have anything in mind or are advocating for anything?

많은 생존자들이 이미 별세하였고, 남은 생존자들에게조차 일본 정부의 사과는 기약이 없습니다. 이번 다큐멘터리에 다른 목표가 있다면 어떤 것이 있을까요? 특별히 전달하고 싶었던 것이 있으면 말씀 해 주세요.

Byun: 아직도 많은 사람들이 싸우고 있고, 낮은목소리 이후 또 많은 작품들이 다른 감독들에 의해 만들어졌습니다. 그렇게 계속 싸우는 것. 그것이 중요하다고 생각합니다.

There are still a lot of people fighting, and after “the Murmuring”, many other films by different directors were produced. I think it is important to keep fighting like that.

감사합니다. 특히 누구신지 모르겠지만 한글을 번역해주신분도 정말 감사합니다. 그럼.

Thank you. I don’t really know who you are, but I also really appreciate the person who translated into Korean.

Interviewer: Thank you so much for your thorough response to my questions, I really appreciate that you took the time to help me!

7.3. Interview with Director Sekiguchi

Interviewer: First of all, I just learned that you changed your first name to Yuka. I thought it was Noriko. Would you prefer it that I refer to you in my thesis as Yuka?

Sekiguchi: That'll be good, and please do not address me as director. Yuka'll do!

Interviewer: Did you watch other documentaries on so-called “comfort women”? And if so, which ones? And what was your opinion about them?

Sekiguchi: I made my film on Comfort Women way back in 1989 (English one in 1990) and back then I did not come across with similar films, so no.

Interviewer: Did you interact with other directors of documentaries of so-called “comfort women”?

Sekiguchi: No.

Interviewer: The filming itself may be seen as part of the healing process for the survivors of sexual violence. Do you have an example of filming as a healing process?

Sekiguchi: That, it depends on the filmmaker. TV style of filming can be very intrusive, as TV directors often have to work in a short time span to complete. From filmmaker's POV, I think 'TRUST' is the most important factor. I don't believe me or my film have a power to 'HEAL'. Although healing may perhaps be achieved out of mutual (between the subject and the filmmaker) respect and trust.

Interviewer: You filmed both in Japan and Papua New Guinea. I have read that you actually lived in Papua New Guinea. How long did you live there? Watching the documentary, I got the impression that you actually learned the language? How was the communication and language situation?

Sekiguchi: I loved to go to PNG and my location research method is like anthropological field research. I must learn their language, even a little. That will develop friendship and eventually trust. At one time, I lived there 6 months longest. Sometimes 3-4 months. It took me 7 years to complete the film! I even risked my own life having contracted malaria. LANGUAGE is essential. It's the only way to obtain first hand information.

Interviewer: Regarding the Japanese language, do they feel like the Japanese language, in Papua New Guinea, symbolizes the perpetrator/occupier in this case or is it just a normal language? Is there a negative image of the Japanese language?

Sekiguchi: Surprisingly there is no negative image on the Japanese language. You know WHY? Because with previous colonial masters like Dutch, German, English and Aussie, they didn't even bother teaching them languages. To them, they were native slaves. They pride themselves that they were sent school to learn Japanese. I was surprised that their Japanese was intact!

Interviewer: There might be an ethical dilemma for the directors of documentaries. You don't want to exploit the emotions if you film about the suffering of the victims of violence, but at the same time, you need to show emotions to reach touch the audience. Did you have those considerations in mind when you made the film?

Sekiguchi: Taking time. You must take time to overcome ethical issues. You have to have mutual respect and trust. You cannot rush. 7 years is the years I took.

Interviewer: Regarding the image of the former so-called "comfort women" as "sweet little grandmas", did you you try to change this image? How did you feel about this stereotypical image? Did you aim to create a new image?

Sekiguchi: It's an all male perspective to me, though 'looking like sweet little grandma' may be NOW, but not in those days. Are you talking about Korean cultural point of view? It sounds like very patronizing male point of view.

Interviewer: How do you feel does the discourse around so-called "comfort women" fit in with the feminist discourse on victim shaming, on rape culture, on patriarchy, on male violence on women, on sexual violence?

Sekiguchi: It has to link with WAR created by MEN. For Japanese, very systematically organized military (thus public) brothel. Similar to that now is PEDOPHILIA RING all over the world, systematically organized human trafficking system. Children! Horrific crime that needs to be addressed.

Interviewer: Do you think this also starts a discourse on the problems that we have today in our societies, like rape and male violence on women? Are you hoping that with the documentary you can get people to think about the situation today?

Sekiguchi: Film is not the statement, but provocation. Good films provoke people. I hope I've been making these films regardless of subject matters.

Interviewer: Did you travel to multiple countries to show the documentary? How was the perception different in different countries? The questions the audience asked you for example, or generally the reaction of the people to your documentary?

Sekiguchi: In 1990s, yes. The film received many international awards through international film festival circuit. Some overseas Koreans argued that the film undermined Korean comfort women. I realized back then, human hierarchy. What about those native men who touched Japanese comfort women? Their head was cut off. What about native women completely denied their existence? The film must provoke people.

Interviewer: Did you get sad when you worked so much with this sad topic? How did you personally handle your emotions?

Sekiguchi: Filmmaking requires lots of energy and you've got to be tough. If you become emotional too often, then perhaps filmmaking is not for you. I've been making films about my own mother's dementia for the last 8 years.

Interviewer: Now that the survivors pass away, and it doesn't really look like the Japanese government is going to give an apology in time, do you, with your documentary, have any other goals? Do you have anything in mind or are advocating for anything?

Sekiguchi: Politics is very important. The decent government is equally important. The world is slowing changing and when time comes, the demand of my film will come again. However, my film is not propelling the change itself.

8. Abstracts

8.1. Abstract in English

This master's thesis compares and analyses six documentary films by four directors on the topic of the so-called "comfort women" of the Japanese Imperial Army: "Senso Daughters" by Japanese director Sekiguchi Yuka that was released in 1989, the trilogy "The Murmuring" (1995), "Habitual Sadness" (1997) and "My own breathing"(1999) by Korean director Byun Young-joo, "Song of the Reed" by Taiwanese director Wu Hsiu-ching that was released in 2014 and "The Apology" by Canadian director Tiffany Hsiung that was released in 2016.

For this purpose, I use an analytical framework derived from theory on conflict-related sexual violence on the one hand and on feminist filmmaking and documentary ethics on the other hand. I also conducted expert interviews with three of the four directors.

The documentaries not only light up several issues connected to the discourse on so-called "comfort women" and are sources of testimonies of live witnesses from Japan, Papua New Guinea, Korea, Taiwan, China and the Philippines, but they also document the activism of the survivors and support groups. All four directors criticise women's exclusion in historical records and demand that so-called "comfort women" are included in Japanese history textbooks, and all of the six documentaries can be integrated in a broader feminist discourse, as they all point out harmful patriarchal gender norms, connect the issue of so-called "comfort women" to other forms of conflict-related sexual violence and offer insight into the mechanism of victim blaming and victim shaming, which are issues that are still prevalent in current feminist discourses.

8.2. Zusammenfassung auf deutsch

Diese Masterarbeit vergleicht und analysiert sechs Dokumentarfilme von vier Regisseurinnen zum Thema der sogenannten „Trostfrauen“ der Kaiserlichen Japanischen Armee: “Senso Daughters” der japanischen Regisseurin Yuka aus dem Jahr 1989; die Trilogie der koreanischen Regisseurin Byun Young-joo: “The Murmuring” (1995), “Habitual Sadness” (1997) und “My own breathing”(1999); “Song of the Reed” der taiwanesischen Regisseurin Wu Hsiu-ching aus dem Jahr 2014 und “The Apology” der kanadischen Regisseurin Tiffany Hsiung aus dem Jahr 2016.

Für die Analyse vergleiche ich die sechs Dokumentarfilme anhand von elf Fragen, die ich beim Lesen von Theorie über sexuelle Gewalt in bewaffneten Konflikten einerseits und ethische Aspekte des Dokumentarfilms andererseits als essentielle Fragen befunden habe. Außerdem führte ich Experteninterviews mit drei der vier Regisseurinnen.

Die Dokumentarfilme beleuchten nicht nur unterschiedliche Problematiken im Zusammenhand mit dem Diskurs um sogenannte „Trostfrauen“ und sind Quellen von Augenzeugenberichten aus Japan, Papua-Neuguinea, Korea, Taiwan, China und der Philippinen, sie dokumentieren auch den Aktivismus der Überlebenden und NGOs, die diese unterstützen.

Alle vier Regisseurinnen kritisieren in ihrer Arbeit die Exklusion von Frauen in Geschichtsschreibung und fordern, dass sogenannte „Trostfrauen“ in japanische Geschichtsbücher Einzug finden, und alle der sechs Dokumentarfilme können in einen breiteren feministischen Diskurs integriert werden, da sie patriarchale Normen aufzeigen und die Problematik der sogenannten „Trostfrauen“ mit anderen Formen sexueller Gewalt in bewaffneten Konflikt verbinden und den komplexen Mechanismus der Opferbeschuldigung oder „Täter-Opfer-Umkehr“ erklären können.